



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

# Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and  
Communications Committee](#)

12/01/2017

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)

[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)

[Committee Transcripts](#)

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau  
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 4 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd  
o'r Cyfarfod ar gyfer Eitemau 3, 4 a 6  
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public  
from the Meeting for Items 3, 4 and 6
- 5 Cyllid ar gyfer Addysg Cerddoriaeth a Mynediad at yr Addysg Honno:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth Ragarweiniol 1  
Funding for and Access to Music Education: Preliminary Evidence  
Session 1

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w dystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Hannah Blythyn	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour
Dawn Bowden	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour
Neil Hamilton	UKIP Cymru
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	UKIP Wales
Bethan Jenkins	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor)
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Dai Lloyd	Plaid Cymru
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	The Party of Wales
Jeremy Miles	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour
Lee Waters	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Dr Owain Arwel Hughes CBE

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Steve George	Clerc Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Siân Hughes	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Clerc Deputy Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:47.*  
*The meeting began at 09:47.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau**  
**Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest**

[1] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch a **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you and chroeso i Bwyllgor Diwylliant, y welcome to the Culture, Welsh Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu. Croeso i Language and Communications aelodau'r pwyllgor. Gan bod y Committee. I welcome the committee cyfarfod yn mynd yn syth i mewn i members. As the meeting will gyfarfod preifat, bydd yr hysbysiadau immediately go into private session, cyhoeddus arferol yn cael eu gwneud the usual public notices will be made o dan eitem 5. A oes gan unrhyw un under item 5. Does anyone have any unrhyw beth i'w ddatgan ar declarations of interest to make at ddechrau'r cyfarfod? Na. the beginning of the meeting? No. As Ymddiheuriadau: mae Suzy Davies for apologies, we've heard from Suzy wedi dweud efallai na fydd hi'n gallu Davies that she may not be able to dod yma heddiw. attend today.

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd**  
**o'r Cyfarfod ar gyfer Eitemau 3, 4 a 6**

**Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public**  
**from the Meeting for Items 3, 4 and 6**

*Cynnig:*

*Motion:*

*bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu that the committee resolves to gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod ar exclude the public from the meeting gyfer eitemau 3, 4 a 6 yn unol â for items 3, 4 and 6 in accordance Rheol Sefydlog 17.42. with Standing Order 17.42.*

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion moved.*

[2] **Bethan Jenkins:** Felly, rydw i'n **Bethan Jenkins:** Therefore, I move cynnig mynd i mewn i sesiwn breifat that we go into private session under o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42. A ydy Standing Order 17.42. Is everyone pawb yn hapus? content?

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 09:48.  
The public part of the meeting ended at 09:48.*

*Ailymgynullodd y pwyllgor yn gyhoeddus am 10:34.  
The committee reconvened in public at 10:34.*

**Cyllid ar gyfer Addysg Cerddoriaeth a Mynediad at yr Addysg Honno:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth Ragarweiniol 1  
Funding for and Access to Music Education: Preliminary Evidence  
Session 1**

[3] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn ichi am ddod yma heddiw. Rydym ni'n mynd i gychwyn y dystiolaeth ar gerddoriaeth mewn addysg. Chi yw'r person cyntaf rydym ni wedi ei gael i mewn i roi tystiolaeth inni. Ar hyn o bryd, rydym ni'n ymgynghori ar dermau'r hyn rydym ni'n mynd i fod yn edrych arno—termau'r ymchwiliad. Felly, rydym ni'n hybu pobl i gymryd rhan yn hynny ac hefyd rydym ni'n mynd i fod yn, gobeithio, cael pobl i mewn o'r sector sydd yn mynd i roi tystiolaeth inni. Ond, wrth gwrs, gan eich bod chi wedi cael profiad helaeth yn y maes yma—ac fe wnaethom ni weld yr erthygl dros y Nadolig yng nghyd-destun yr hyn yr oeddech chi'n ei ddweud ynglŷn â sefyllfa cerddoriaeth yng Nghymru—tybed a fedrwch chi roi cyflwyniad byr yng nghyd-destun y ffaith eich bod chi wedi dwed bod yna 'argyfwng' ar y ffordd os na fydd yna newidiadau yn digwydd yn y maes yma. Felly, croeso mawr, ac hefyd gobeithio y gallwch chi ymestyn croeso i'r Aelodau Cynulliad a sicrhau

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much for joining us today. We're going to start our evidence session with regard to music education. You're the first witness that we've invited in to give evidence to us, and, at present, we're consulting on the terms of reference of what we're going to be looking at—the terms of reference of the inquiry. So, we're encouraging people to take part in the consultation. We hope to invite people in from the sector who are going to give their evidence to us. But, of course, as you have had so much experience in this area—and we saw the article over the Christmas period in the context of what you were saying about the situation of music education in Wales—I wonder whether you could give us a brief introduction in the context of the fact that you said that there's a 'crisis' in the pipeline if changes aren't made in this area. So, welcome to you, and I hope that the Members will welcome you and that you will ensure that their questions are answered. Thank you.

bod eu cwestiynau nhw yn cael eu hateb hefyd. Diolch yn fawr.

[4] **Dr Hughes:** lawn, diolch yn **Dr Hughes:** Thank you very much. I'll fawr i chi. Fe wna i siarad yn Saesneg. speak in English.

[5] I'll speak in English so that we all understand each other. I will be delighted to answer any questions, and very often it is questions that guide you into coming up with answers and whatever. How all this happened: I was approached by BBC news to do interviews on radio and television in English and Welsh about this problem about music in schools, which I was delighted to do. Questions—and probing questions—were asked of me, and I answered truthfully, I hope, and, as you said, Bethan, from my own experience as well. I was then amazed that I was contacted by you to join this committee—I thought, 'Wow, this is something quite special'—but then even more amazed how the whole situation has grown. It's gone everywhere: it's online, it's on Twitter—everything. I was in church on Sunday morning in London, in Harrow where I live, and I was approached by people there in the congregation, even by the Bishop of London, would you believe, who said, 'I hear you're going to the Senedd'. When the Bishop of London says that to you—. And why he was there—

[6] **Bethan Jenkins:** He's already changed the name for us, then. We don't need a consultation. [*Laughter.*]

[7] **Dr Hughes:** The church I go to was 923 years old on Sunday, constituted by Anselm, so that's why he was there. But I suddenly realised, 'Wow, this is causing consternation everywhere', and since then I've been approached—I've done interviews since then, I've done two this morning, in English and Welsh, which shows me that the whole situation is really getting the public's attention. I think that in itself—if I've done nothing else, I've brought it to the attention of people in that way, and to my own attention as well.

[8] **Bethan Jenkins:** So why do you say, though, specifically in that article, the word 'crisis'—why do you use the word 'crisis'? Because, obviously, people need to understand what the situation is now and how it can therefore be improved.

[9] **Dr Hughes:** That's an interesting point, that I used the word 'crisis'. That was simply because I felt it was, in that, having done a lot of research

since then, I had been told beforehand that the situation in the schools was such that people weren't getting instruments to play, and you will know as well as I do the importance of instruments in schools, and I can enlarge upon that at any time. Anything to do with music, it is so important for education. Let's take an instrument, for example. If you learn an instrument, that in itself—and I know this from experience—the first thing you learn is self-discipline from learning an instrument, the hours and hours of practice that is there. That's a discipline that you won't get from anything else. You get it from that. You won't even get it from sport, quite frankly. Playing an instrument is discipline. What happens then is that you can hopefully have a group in the school—a few playing in a group—again, the education is excellent. You then move to the town or the city ensemble that you're in, from there to the county, then to the National Youth Orchestra of Wales, for example.

[10] Now, the importance of that, apart from the discipline, is that you are playing in a group. You have your own standard, your own discipline of having to practice to get to where you are. Then you're playing with a group. Then there becomes competition, there becomes self-criticism and criticism from others, which is a wonderful way of developing you as a person and in education. I can't think of anything better than just that little facet on its own.

[11] **Bethan Jenkins:** But you're saying that the situation at the moment is such that maybe schools that are not having that—

[12] **Dr Hughes:** Well, much of my research, and what I've been told—and, obviously, I was given a lot before the initial interview that I did—was that schools do not have instruments, so that in itself is a crisis. The playing is going down. The singing is going down. Choirs everywhere are going down. That's a crisis, in my language. I think something that strikes both you and I right to the core is that I had the privilege of conducting the National Youth Orchestra of Wales. I was the musical director. The National Youth Orchestra of Wales is the oldest national youth orchestra in the world. It's the first one created in the world. The funny thing is, after almost 60 years, I was the first—and I am still—the first Welshman ever to be its musical director. That's another little story. But the sad news—and I had a wonderful time there, as you know, and Bethan played when I was in the orchestra, and for better—I could say a lot worse. [*Laughter.*] But that in itself, what we did just with that orchestra was, because of the standards—I got professionals in as tutors, people I knew in the business, so you're talking about the top players in all

the best orchestras in this country, and a lot of them Welsh. What we're losing are people like that coming through the system. These were brilliant players and, what they were doing, they were tutoring these people. So, these people were having tutelage, you know, for nothing from the best players. Then I'd come in, and then I treated them, as Bethan knows, as professional orchestras. The fact that they were a youth orchestra meant nothing to me, they were an orchestra, and, therefore, I treated them, the 150 of them, like a professional orchestra. We played some of the greats, the Mahler symphonies, Shostakovich, all of the big symphonies. That takes a lot. And we'd travel to Berlin, to everywhere, you know. That in itself was a brilliant education, but, because they were so good, we were selling Wales. Now then, if that education is not happening, if the players aren't coming through, how do we sell Wales as a musical nation? It's impossible, and the really sad news, which I think probably made me think this is definitely a crisis, was when I heard, I was told, that this year is the lowest uptake of people having an audition for the National Youth Orchestra of Wales in its whole lifetime, since 1946, and this is 2017. That is really, really sad.

[13] **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you for those comments and I will concur that you treated us very professionally, and I enjoyed my time on the orchestra under your leadership also.

[14] **Dr Hughes:** What did you play?

[15] **Bethan Jenkins:** Viola.

[16] **Dr Hughes:** I know the viola, what pieces were we playing?

[17] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mahler No. 1 we did.

[18] **Dr Hughes:** Mahler No. 1, yes.

[19] **Bethan Jenkins:** And we did others, obviously, but that's the one that sits with me and I listen to it and I can't listen to it without remembering those experiences.

[20] **Dr Hughes:** That's wonderful, wonderful.

[21] **Bethan Jenkins:** Anyway, we're having a little chat here. [*Laughter.*] This isn't really what we came here to do, as much as I like it. I know that Jeremy Miles has some questions for you on the hub and on local provisions,



so I'm going to ask Jeremy to come in now.

[22] **Jeremy Miles:** Diolch yn fawr. Diolch i chi am ddod mewn. Roeddwn i'n gwranddo arnoch chi ar y radio y bore yma. Gwnaethoch chi sôn am, fel rydych chi wedi sôn heddiw, y gwaith tîm ac ati, a phobl yn mynd—efallai nad ydyn nhw'n cario ymlaen fel cerddorion, fel wnes i ddim, ond eu bod nhw'n mynd i fyd y gyfraith ac ati, ac roeddwn i'n gyfreithiwr cyn imi gael fy ethol, so gallaf i ategu beth a ddywedoch chi. Mae'n fy nharo i mai un o'r problemau mwyaf fan hyn yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y ddarpariaeth ar draws yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Mae sialensau yn dod yn sgil hynny. Hynny yw, mewn rhai ardaloedd efallai ei bod hi'n llai tebygol bod pobl yn gallu fforddio prynu eu hofferynnau eu hunain. Byddai fy rhieni i byth wedi gallu fforddio prynu'r offeryn pres roeddwn i'n ei chwarae, er enghraifft. Mae'n rhaid gwneud rhywbeth i gysoni hynny fel bod pobl yn cael y cyfle ar draws pob rhan o Gymru i gymryd rhan. Beth rydych chi'n credu—? A oes darlun gyda chi o'r patrwm ar draws Cymru o ble mae'r broblem waethaf, a ble, efallai, bod arfer da, os oes hynny?

[23] **Dr Hughes:** Rwy'n licio'r frawddeg ddaru i chi ei defnyddio—yr *hub*—a gwneud tipyn o waith i edrych i mewn i beth ydy'r *hub* yma. Maen nhw wedi trio pethau fel hyn yn Lloegr, yn llwyddiannus mewn rhai llefydd. Mae yna gamgymeriadau,

**Jeremy Miles:** Thank you very much. Thank you for coming in. I was listening to you on the radio this morning. You mentioned, as you have done today, the teamwork that's involved and how people may not move on to become musicians but move into other areas, as I did into the area of law, and I was a lawyer before being elected, so I can concur with what you said. It strikes me that one of the biggest problems here is the variation in provision across local authorities in Wales. There are challenges that arise as a result of that. For example, in some areas perhaps it's less likely that people would be able to afford to purchase their own instruments. My parents couldn't have afforded the brass instrument that I played, for example. So, we need to get some consistency so that there's an opportunity for people across Wales to have the same level of access. So, do you have a picture of the pattern across Wales of where the problem is greatest and where, perhaps, there is good practice?

**Dr Hughes:** I like the sentence that you used—the hub—and doing some work to look into what this hub might be. Now, they've tried things like this in England, and they've been successful in some areas. Some mistakes have been made, but, if we

ond, pe byddem ni'n mynd ar ôl yr un peth, gallwn ni ffeindio allan beth yw'r camgymeriadau a'u gwneud nhw'n well. Ond rydw i'n licio'r syniad o *hub*—hynny yw, bod person neu fudiad yn y canol ac yn mynd allan i bawb. Ac, felly, nid yw pawb yn mynd ar eu pennau eu hunain a ddim yn gwneud sens; mae un mudiad yn cadw pawb at ei gilydd, yn helpu ei gilydd. Pe byddai yna un ardal—dywedwch rŵan, mewn un ardal, mae yna broblem ariannol mewn un lle, gallai le arall eu helpu nhw drwy ddweud, 'Rydym ni'n gwneud e drwy wneud hwn'. Hynny yw, yr *hub* busnes yma, rydw i'n ei licio fe'n fawr iawn. Buaswn i fy hun, yntê, yn licio mynd mwy i mewn i hwn.

[24] **Jeremy Miles:** A sut mae'r *hub* yn gweithio ar lawr gwlad? Beth yw'r patrwm? A yw'r awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio?

[25] **Dr Hughes:** Ie, ond mae eisiau rhywun yn y canol sy'n dweud, 'Reit, rydym ni'n mynd i edrych ar ôl pawb'. Mae yna gorau, mae yna gerddorfeydd—mae yna gymaint o gerddorfeydd—ond hefyd chwaraewyr sydd mewn *brass band*, mewn *jazz band*. Maen nhw i gyd ar eu pennau eu hunain rŵan, ond pe byddai yna un mudiad yn edrych ar eu holau nhw a hefyd yr ardaloedd ei hunain—a rydych chi wedi dweud rŵan bod yna rai ardaloedd, yntê, nid oes ganddyn nhw ddim yr arian i helpu ei gilydd. Efallai bod yna ardal

pursue the same idea, then we'd find out what those mistakes are and then we could learn from them. But I do like the idea of having a hub—namely that there would be a person or a group at the centre that would go out to everyone. And so it's not about everyone going about this on their own and not making sense; there would be one group or organisation keeping everyone together, helping each other. So, if there was one area that would have a financial problem, then the hub could help them and say, 'We do it by doing this'. So, I do like this idea of this hub. I would like to investigate that further.

**Jeremy Miles:** And how does the hub operate on the ground? What's the pattern? Is it local authorities collaborating?

**Dr Hughes:** Yes, but you need someone in the centre to coordinate and say, 'Right, we're going to look after everyone'. There are choirs, there are orchestras—there are so many orchestras—but also players who are in brass bands and jazz bands and so on. They're all in isolation, aren't they, now, but if there was one organisation to look after all of them and the areas themselves—and you've said that there are some areas that don't have the funds to help themselves. But there might be another area that

arall sy'n gallu eu helpu nhw, neu ddweud, 'Fe allech chi gael yr arian drwy wneud hwn a'r llall, neu beth bynnag'—hynny yw, mae pawb yn helpu ei gilydd, nid mynd ar eu pen eu hunain a gwneud camgymeriadau a ddim yn cael pethau'n iawn. Felly, rydw i'n licio'r gair *hub* yma.

could help them, or say, 'You can get the funds through doing this, that or the other', so everyone is helping each other, not just going about this on their own in isolation and making mistakes. So, I do like this idea of the hub.

10:45

[26] **Jeremy Miles:** Reit, ocê, a dyna'r ffordd mae'n gweithio yn Lloegr ar hyn o bryd.

**Jeremy Miles:** Right, okay, and is that how it works in England at present?

[27] **Dr Hughes:** Rydw i'n clywed eu bod nhw wedi gwneud camgymeriadau, fel mae pawb yn ei wneud efo pethau newydd. Fe allwn ni ddysgu o'r camgymeriadau, ond dylem ni edrych ar y patrwm.

**Dr Hughes:** I've heard that they have made mistakes, as everyone does with new initiatives. But we could learn from those mistakes, and we should look at that idea.

[28] **Jeremy Miles:** Ocê, diolch.

**Jeremy Miles:** Okay, thank you.

[29] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dai.

[30] **Dai Lloyd:** Ie, ymhellach i hynny, a dweud y gwir, achos—. Mae'n wir i ddweud ei bod yn anrhydedd i'r pwyllgor eich cael chi yma hefyd. Rydym ni wedi clywed o'ch ochr chi ei bod yn anrhydedd i chi fod yma; mae'n anrhydedd i ni eich cael chi yma hefyd. Ond yn y bôn, rydym ni wedi cael nifer o adroddiadau dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf ar y pwnc yma, ac, wrth gwrs, fel rydych chi wedi sylwi, nid oes yna fawr o ddim byd wedi newid yn y bôn; mae yna dal argyfwng o ran miwsig mewn ysgolion, ac ati. Yn

**Dai Lloyd:** Further to that, because—. It's true to say that it is an honour for the committee to have you here as well. We've heard from your side that it's an honour for you to be here, but I'd like to say that it is an honour for us that you are attending. Now, we've had many reports over the past few years on this subject, and, as you've noted, very little seems to have changed essentially; there is still a crisis in terms of music within schools. So, building on that idea of a hub, do you have a Welsh concept or solution for this? Because we know

adeiladu ar y syniad *hub* yna, a oes gyda chi ateb i Gymru o ran sut i ddelio efo hyn? Achos mae yna bwysau ariannol anferthol ar ein cynghorau sir ni, er enghraifft, a dyna sut ydym ni yn y sefyllfa yma yn y bôn. A oes gennych chi ateb i'w gynnig fel ffordd ymlaen?

[31] **Dr Hughes:** Ym mha ffordd? Nid wyf yn deall yn iawn.

[32] **Dai Lloyd:** Yn nhermau ein bod ni'n gallu cael gwasanaeth cenedlaethol sydd yn meithrin doniau cerddorol, y cerddorfeydd, ac yn gwneud yn siŵr bod ein plant ni a'n pobl ifanc ni yn gallu cael gafael yn yr addysg a'r ddisgyblaeth yna, o ba bynnag gefndir maen nhw'n dod—rhyw fath o ateb i Gymru, ynteu ateb rhanbarthol ydy o'n mynd i fod? Os gennych chi ryw weledigaeth i'n helpu ni allan?

[33] **Dr Hughes:** Mae'n fy nharo i, os ydych chi'n siarad am bethau fel yma, fod eisiau rhywbeth—nid oes dim byd i'w gael ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae'n bwysig i gael yr *hub*—cael efallai un person sydd yn mynd i helpu i ddechrau'r peth, neu fudiad yw'r peth gorau. Byddai'r mudiad yma yn edrych ar ôl popeth sy'n mynd ymlaen ym mhob man. Felly, mae'n rhaid creu rhywbeth newydd, nid jest dweud, 'Beth am gôr, neu rywbeth?'—creu rhywbeth hollol newydd—*a new hub*, mudiad newydd sy'n mynd i edrych ar bopeth.

there are great financial pressures on our councils, for example, and that why we are in this situation, essentially. So, do you have a solution in terms of the way ahead?

**Dr Hughes:** In what way? I don't understand exactly.

**Dai Lloyd:** In terms of us being able to have a national service that develops our musical skills, our orchestras, and ensures that our children and young people can have access to that education, from whatever background they have—some sort of solution for Wales, or would it be a regional solution? Do you have any kind of vision to help us?

**Dr Hughes:** It strikes me that, if you're talking about these issues, we do need something because there isn't anything at the moment. So, it's important for us to have that hub—to have one person, perhaps, who is going to help and co-ordinate and start this, or an organisation. That would be best. That organisation would look after everything involved in this in all areas. So, we do have to create this new initiative, not just say, 'What about a choir, or something?'—we do need to create a new hub, a new organisation that's going to look at and consider

everything.

[34] **Bethan Jenkins:** Would this be national and for adults and young people, because obviously there are changes to the way that music—

[35] **Dr Hughes:** It could start locally, first of all, as sort of a local thing that could then spread to the areas, to a county, regions and nationally. As you build it up and make it a success, that movement itself, whatever it is—Joe Bloggs could run it or—whatever leads it; I don't know. But it's an area that one should look at, because nothing is happening at the moment is the point that you're making. If there's nothing happening, then we've got to do something. So, let's start somewhere. That's one of the ideas that has intrigued me—you brought the name 'hub' up; you've started it—and I think, 'Why can't we look at something?' And I'd be delighted, actually, to be involved. If I can help in any way—I'll tell you as a committee: I'll help you in any way if you want to move this forward, or, any ideas you've got or initiatives, I'd be delighted to help.

[36] **Bethan Jenkins:** Obviously, locally, there are many different operations at the moment because of the fact that many local authorities took away their peripatetic tutoring. So, some people have set up businesses, some people have set up charities, so I'd be interested to hear how you think that they could potentially work together, or whether they would need to—. You're saying, it seems to me, that there would be one national organisation that would then help them.

[37] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, we need an organisation. If all these disparate groups are just going in their own direction and doing all sorts of things, making mistakes, and thinking, 'We can't do it because of that', if there is a central point—. And we'd need some really good people. I also would add, by the way, that you've made—you make enquiries of various people and organisations. You've come to me as a professional. The area that I've got—and the expertise and experience, I think, is the most important thing that I've got. There are many, many professional musicians who you can contact who have experience in this sort of work. First of all—

[38] **Bethan Jenkins:** In a voluntary way, then, would that be?

[39] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, absolutely. Let's start there. But in the same way as I had these wonderful tutors to the National Youth Orchestra of Wales, and they came at my invitation because they knew me, and they knew the vision I

had for the orchestra—

[40] **Bethan Jenkins:** So, they weren't paid for that work.

[41] **Dr Hughes:** Oh, yes, the tutors are paid, because you know how long a course lasts for the National Youth Orchestra of Wales. But I think let's start by just—. You don't have to pay somebody to ask them; you're not paying me today. You don't have to pay anybody to get advice. It's the right people you get the advice from. So, one of the things we can do is go to top-class professionals—and I can open the way for you there—who have come up through the same system as you, if you like, of education, who've gone through the different orchestras, arrived at the National Youth Orchestra, but have gone on and have become top players in Europe. That's what we're talking about. Now, they must know something; they should be able to contribute something. So, this hub is a manifestation of that. What we need is to find out what sort of organisation is going to be at the hub. That is the vital thing. It's something we don't have at the moment, therefore, the way I'm listening to you talking and asking me questions, it sounds to me as if we need to be thinking completely outside the box and coming up with something absolutely new.

[42] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy wants to come back on that.

[43] **Jeremy Miles:** I'm just interested in this idea of voluntary effort, if you like, if I can describe it in that way. That's not quite what you were saying, but—. There may be a difference between the different kinds of musical tuition here, I suppose, and I'm thinking of the relationship between education in schools on a local authority basis and community music playing, for example. I'm thinking of the brass band sector, the brass band culture; there's an awful lot of voluntary tuition and education that goes into people who learn brass instruments, which comes through the existence of community-level brass players. So, there's a vast amount of that, which, certainly in that part of the musical sector, exists already, and may be hidden to the discussion.

[44] **Dr Hughes:** But that could be tapped into. Look at the success of the bands we've got in Wales—the Cory is No.1 in the world, and there are so many of them. I try and watch, if I can, let's say the National Eisteddfod—not that I'm into competitions, actually, but what I like to do is to keep up with who is around. And what has come through to me very, very clearly over the last couple of years is the number of youngsters and people playing in brass

bands. There are four divisions and a lot of them are playing in each one and competing against each other. And so many—from both sexes—youngsters are playing in brass bands. Now, there is an area that we can tap into—just one area, okay? But that can be disparate even among itself, that can be, as well. So, if that hub can say—and there's got to be an organisation that runs all these things and puts these festivals together and the competitions together—to them, 'Right. Could you come to us? Can we have advice from you? This is what we want, what can you—?', that, for example—.

[45] **Jeremy Miles:** But that's only ever going to be in addition to a core paid-for service, isn't it? Because, actually, those bands depend, to some extent, on people coming up through school and learning brass instruments. That's an additional, rather than a substitute.

[46] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, but the only way that they can play in these bands is to learn at school.

[47] **Jeremy Miles:** Yes, so what I'm saying is that that provision needs to be paid-for provision, essentially, doesn't it?

[48] **Dr Hughes:** Exactly. Exactly, yes. I'm just wondering whether—

[49] **Jeremy Miles:** Sorry, just to be clear, I don't mean paid for by the individual, I mean by the local authority.

[50] **Dr Hughes:** No, no, absolutely. You see that's the problem. When you go to areas—. The Government came up with these 12-point suggestions, which is fine in certain areas, but it doesn't work in a lot of areas because they don't have the staff, they don't have the money, and in areas where individuals cannot afford to put money themselves into it—. Cerdd Gymunedol Cymru, apparently, have written a report about this, which I think should be a very important—. I'd like to study it. It should be a very, very good thing that we should all study. You might've read it; I haven't. I just know that CGC have come up with a very, very good response to that 12-point Government plan.

[51] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dawn Bowden would like to carry on with the theme you were saying, about affordability and those who can't, potentially, afford the instruments or the tutoring.

[52] **Dawn Bowden:** Thank you for that. It is following on that theme of

equality of opportunity, really. It does seem to me that, when we're faced with cuts in this kind of service in this area, the children who are more likely to continue will be those from wealthier families, from families in which their parents can afford for them to do things differently, or in different settings, or can afford to buy instruments, and so on. So, those children who come from areas of greater deprivation or from poorer families are the ones who are going to be, potentially, left behind. Now, if we're going to get Welsh Government, potentially, to put money into the kinds of services that we've been talking about, there has to be something around equality of opportunity, so that that is accessible regardless of needs.

[53] **Dr Hughes:** I agree with that.

[54] **Dawn Bowden:** And there is also, I guess, something around how music, as opposed to it just being something you do for fun, or it's part of the culture, or whatever, being potentially seen as a route out of poverty, in lots of different ways—not necessarily become a megastar, but all of those kinds of things that you were talking about, in terms of their personal development, and so on.

[55] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, absolutely.

[56] **Dawn Bowden:** Could you comment a bit more on that, in terms of whether you agree that that is something that would need to be part of a Welsh Government strategy—equalising that access?

[57] **Dr Hughes:** I agree absolutely—there is no question. Why should an area, because some people can afford it, be left to have to do that? Everybody should have equal opportunity, no question at all. And, therefore, funding has got to be found, because it is absolutely vital in people's education. I think we all agree now that music is so much an important part of a child's development, and the things that come out of it is amazing. The players that I have been told personally by them that, if they hadn't learned an instrument, and gone either into an orchestra, or whatever, into that career, they would have been in prison. And I'm not making something dramatic about it; I've been told often by people, 'I would have been in prison, but there was an instrument there that I could learn'. Very often, I have asked somebody, 'Why have you learned the double bass?' 'Because that was the instrument that was in the school at the time'. Wonderful. There is something there that you get hold of, and play, and that's vital.



[58] If you want my answer: the Government has got to put money into this—end of the story, because it is absolutely vital. Because it's not just that music is good; it's because you're learning instruments, the discipline of doing that. The people of the National Youth Orchestra of Wales—and Bethan was there with me, and I've been with them—only a certain percentage go into the profession, because it's a tough profession, let's be honest—only certain people get there. But they've become teachers, and very, very good teachers. But they've become doctors, they've become lawyers, and they're good at that, because they've had the discipline of learning their instruments in the first place, and being part of an orchestra, or a choir, or whatever. And that is proven beyond doubt. So it's not just music—it's education for everybody where they're going.

[59] **Bethan Jenkins:** Hannah, did you want to come in?

[60] **Hannah Blythyn:** Yes. You've answered it in part, then, but, it's kind of how we make learning an instrument and music more accessible and attractive to people who might not think it is actually for them. And you've touched on examples of actually what it could do for your life, but if you have any other ideas, like how that could be part of the strategy of the Welsh Government, not just about tackling poverty, but giving people opportunities, and making it clear it's not just opportunity for a certain group of people. Like you said, there's a value to learning an instrument, which isn't just about actually the enjoyment, which is a large part of it and is important, but it does offer you the opportunity as well. So, if you had any other ideas how we could do that.

[61] **Dr Hughes:** I think it's vital. And I think enjoyment, first of all, is very, very important. I think the other thing that we must remember is, as the children get older, especially getting into their teens, there are so many other things taking their time. There's everything going on now, which is going to appear more attractive. Are they going to spend six hours, when they could be spending their time playing games, or whatever, and doing whatever? That will always be there; life has always been like that.

[62] Back to this hub again, how are we going to have an organisation that brings everybody together? There's got to be finance from somewhere to do it. I think that perhaps the point I'm making really—I hope I am, and that we all are here—is priority. How much of a priority is music in education? I think it's absolutely vital. I also think that the arts—whenever there's a problem, anywhere in finance, the first people are the arts, and music in particular, we

get knocked down all the time. And why? Well, actually, it's causing damage. I think we need now to look at the damage that's been caused.

11:00

[63] And the other thing that people don't realise, apart from education, is what music is doing for the health of people. Without music—I'm talking about problems in the NHS—we're going to have people getting ill or whatever. The therapeutic value of music is known everywhere now as absolutely. I just heard the other day—there was something in the paper about singing—as people get older, if they can join a choir and sing, they keep healthier, they're using their lungs as they're getting older. These are vital, especially as people are getting older and living longer—these are the things. If there's no choir to go and sing in, if there's no-one to teach someone to sing in the first place, what's going to happen? These are vital. Health is vital.

[64] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Lee Waters.

[65] **Lee Waters:** I just want to talk to you about money.

[66] **Dr Hughes:** Oh gosh. [*Laughter.*]

[67] **Lee Waters:** Clearly, public spending is declining and, as you said, being a non-statutory service, music has been something that has not been a priority. There have been numerous reports trying to find an answer to this, and the best efforts have been the creation of a body called National Youth Arts Wales, which has been set up as a charity. It's estimated that needs something like £450,000 a year to run. I just wonder if you can give us your experience of whether or not you think there is the potential out there for giving and for fundraising, given how difficult it is in Wales in particular to raise money for the arts from sponsorship or from people who have benefited themselves. Can you just give us a reality check of how easy it's going to be to raise that sort of sum every year?

[68] **Dr Hughes:** Through sponsorship, very, very difficult, because you're competing against everything. Everyone's asking for money and, let's be quite honest—I love sport; I played a lot before—sport gets a huge amount of money; music and the arts doesn't. You're talking about £450,000 for the whole of—what did you call it?

[69] **Lee Waters:** The National Youth Arts Wales.

[70] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, now that covers all the organisations, the National Youth Orchestra of Wales, the brass band, the jazz band, the choirs, the youth choirs—it covers all that. With the greatest respect, £450,000 is trifling—absolutely trifling. When I ran the National Youth Orchestra of Wales, we had a budget of around £150,000 and the standards were phenomenal. We were up against the National Youth Orchestra of Great Britain and they were getting £8 million, £9 million, £10 million a year, up against our £150,000. It's pathetic, you know. So, it's up to us to go around and get money and use all our contacts to get it, but that in itself is not good enough, is it? It really, really is not. We've got to decide how much money is prioritised for music, and I would say go right back to the very beginning.

[71] I'm just wondering whether this little story might help to see how we can move on. My daughter is a headteacher in a London primary school—here again, problems with music. What they have done, and she uses her budget to pay for this—it happens to be a woman—a woman comes in once a fortnight to the school, she then has a session with all the children, singing and whatever, with the staff in with her. Then, when they finish the session, she then has a session with the staff. The staff then, when she's gone—she comes back in a fortnight—carry on what they've been taught with the children. The feedback from them is that they feel so much more confident having had that help on the way.

[72] To me, that is the most simple concept—it's being shared. If it's once a fortnight in my daughter's school, maybe the other schools in the area will have her one day as well. That is a simple way and it's one person. And what you're having in my daughter's school is they're beginning to sing at the age of three. She can see the development of people. So, I've seen it at first hand, through my daughter, what they do in London, and London is tough—teaching in schools in London is tough. I love things like that. She goes out and buys cheap percussion instruments so the kids at school have got something there. They come to—they've got something and then she'll eventually find instruments.

[73] What we need, really—back to this hub again—is an organisation that's going to encourage people to do this sort of thing and find out what the successes are. So, that hub will say to Joe Bloggs over there who's running that organisation, and somebody else will have the community thing or whatever, 'What do you find successful? What do you find as helping? What

do you find is not working?' If they can all contribute together to help each other, that's got to be a really good start.

[74] **Lee Waters:** Can I just be clear on your view on the funding of it, because the current intention is to create this body that will be self-funding over time? Are you saying you're sceptical about whether or not it's going to be possible to maintain that level of private funding?

[75] **Dr Hughes:** The first thing is, you need money to start it. To have a group like that, you've got to have money. You can't start from nothing. If you then make a success of something, then you've got something to go out to private money, for sponsorship. You can't say to somebody who's running an organisation who's having 100 requests every day for money, 'I've got this idea of doing this'. They'll laugh at you. But, if you've started something off, it can become self-funding, but only if you've become successful and you've proved you can do it. You need that initial money from the Government to start it off.

[76] **Lee Waters:** There is some initial money from local authorities, but the question is how long it can continue. But, you think, given a fair wind, that it's realistic to think that it will be able to generate its own funds over time.

[77] **Dr Hughes:** If it's run properly with enough money to start it off and do it properly, it can. You've got to have money to start something. So, if you had that—but also make sure you have the right people in place, the thing we're talking about, to run the thing, so we can co-ordinate everything so that money is not being wasted for a start. It can self-generate—I agree with that very, very much, but you've got to be successful first to attract people.

[78] **Lee Waters:** Okay, thank you.

[79] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Neil **Bethan Jenkins:** Neil Hamilton has a Hamilton gwestiwn. question now.

[80] **Neil Hamilton:** I totally agree with everything you've said this morning. As regards kick-start funding, it's clear, comparing the priority that the Government in England seems to give music education with that in Wales—paradoxically, considering this is *gwlad y gân*—

[81] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, exactly.

[82] **Neil Hamilton:** Music and song have been part of our heritage. Nick Gibb, the Minister of State for Schools, wrote to us to say that, in England, they give £75 million a year, broadly speaking, as central ring-fenced funding for these music education hubs. In Wales, about £20 million a year is spent on the All-Wales Arts and Education Programme, but music is only one element in that. So, the per capita funding overall is the same, but the music element in it is much less than in England. So, we definitely need the Welsh Government, I think, to give a higher priority to this area, but the sums of money in issue are tiny in comparison with their budget. But, of course, everybody who wants money is bound to make that case. I wonder, in light of your own experience, and of living and working in England as well, whether you can tell us whether you can compare the outcomes in England and Wales and whether we can do more with what we've got in Wales.

[83] **Dr Hughes:** It's interesting what you were saying about the comparison in money. What I was told the other day is that somewhere like Northampton and Gwent, which are equivalent in size of what they're meant to be—Gwent gets £150,000 per annum and Northampton gets £2.4 million. That is the measure of, what you were talking about, the money that goes into music and the arts between England and Wales.

[84] It's interesting to hear what you said about *gwlad y gân*—we're supposed to be a musical nation—Dylan Thomas didn't agree, obviously. But, we are a musical nation, in the sense, if we train all these people properly. But the way things are going, we are not going to be a musical nation because, as I said about the youth orchestra, the people aren't there to actually go into the orchestra. So, something is absolutely radically wrong. To go back to where we first started, with the word 'crisis'—we are at a crisis point, no question at all. What I've said is, 'I'll help in any way'. What I think is good about this chat now is you're asking questions about what we are going to do. As long as we agree something has got to be done, then let's go ahead and do it.

[85] **Bethan Jenkins:** Do you think that it needs—. Expanding on Neil's point, obviously, they've ring-fenced the money that local authorities spend on music in education, whereas at the moment, local authorities in Wales receive that money but they can choose how they spend it, and potentially it doesn't go into music. Do you think that (a) there needs to be a national strategy and then (b) that money is dedicated, then, towards going to those local authorities specifically for music in education?

[86] **Dr Hughes:** Absolutely. Absolutely and no question. I think everything—. I'd like to thank you for agreeing with what I've said this morning. The experience is that music in education is vital for the whole of education, and for the health of people and everything. Therefore, there is, to me, a priority there. You know, you're talking your language now, but I understand what 'ring-fenced' means. Let's ring-fence the money, absolutely; it is for music. And that's the other thing: when the Olympics came here, there was lottery money, or whatever, and an awful amount of the money from lottery was moved away from the arts and music to that. So, we lost out hugely. In other words, they said, 'Oh, but that's not important. We'll move it away and use it.' It is vitally important. As if the Olympics haven't got enough money. As if sport isn't having enough money as it is, and I am a sportsman. I love sport, but it is having huge amounts of money.

[87] **Bethan Jenkins:** Do you think there's an argument as well about looking cross-curriculum, because I think Hannah touched on it earlier in relation to the discipline and to the skills that you learn? Perhaps other teachers in other subjects don't see how the music and the tutoring and the self-progression that that can give a child is something that they can use in other disciplines, for example mathematics or in how they perform in lessons, in terms of being able to sit quietly and hear what other people say while you're waiting for somebody else to practise their part. You know, a key part of playing in an orchestra is learning to work as a team. Do you think those things are not seen as potentially a cross-curricular agenda at the moment or—?

[88] **Dr Hughes:** Whether it is seen or not, I have no idea, but it's absolutely essential. I mean, that is what living is about. We're training youngsters to live in the modern world, to know how to behave. And if they don't learn that from the very beginning, where are we going to go? We're not going to get wonderful people like you, who are running the country or whatever, you know. [*Laughter.*] That's a bit of a joke, but it is vitally, vitally important. It's all part of people training, and I come back to that discipline again. There is no better discipline than playing an instrument or singing or whatever. Prove me wrong, anybody, but I can't think of anything that makes that discipline for whatever career you're going to go to in the end.

[89] **Bethan Jenkins:** What about, sort of, you know, how universities use alumni—would there be a scholarship or a potential to develop that type of philanthropist approach as well? Because, of course, if you award people for their progression via the professionals you've talked about whom you know,

would that be one other scheme that could be developed here in Wales?

[90] **Dr Hughes:** Definitely. Absolutely. There's no question. And as I've said earlier, consult the professionals, and if professionals are involved and youngsters see what that particular professional has attained, that is brilliant.

[91] Now, I'm here to help you. I've said I'll help you in any way, and if I could tell you exactly what I'm doing at the moment, I hope it might help you. I'm embarking—you know I've made many recordings—on a recording of music by Welsh composers with the company that I've recorded with a lot over the years. They are world-famous, and everything will be sold all around the world, and we're literally talking about all around the world, so Welsh music will be heard around the world. Fine. That in itself is something brilliant, and has that happened before? No. So that's No. 1. What I'm also going to do—I want that CD to go into every school in Wales. I will talk about each composer, and we're talking about an age range from Hoddinott or whatever down to today's people—'That composer comes from this village. He's done this, he's done that.' The people of that town or village will identify that—'Oh, wow.' You know, they'll be inspired—first of all to hear the music, but inspired to do something because that composer comes from their area. And there are people even writing music now who are really very, very good people. So, that is one thing I'm doing—I'm going to do that. I hope that will be a help.

11:15

[92] The other thing that I've heard is that the schools don't have—teachers don't have the skills to play the piano, and therefore, how do people actually learn to sing or whatever if there's nobody playing the piano? I tell you what I would like to do now: I would like to again make a CD of, let's say, half a dozen hymns, some of the Welsh folk tunes, or whatever—identify what are the music and the songs and things that youngsters should sing and learn and be a part of. Let's say the national anthem for a start. A lot of things like that. I would make a recording so that all these can be played in every school, so that if they don't have somebody who can play the piano, they can play this and sing along with it. Also, instrumentalists can play along with this music as well. I'm prepared to do that.

[93] **Bethan Jenkins:** So, as an educational tool then—

[94] **Dr Hughes:** Yes, as an educational tool to go into schools so that they

can sing along with these and learn these songs, because we're even losing that. We're losing that because—and I saw you all nod in approval—there are fewer and fewer people able to play the piano in schools so that people can learn to sing the songs. So, I hope that that will be a help in itself. So, these are the sort of practical things I'm looking at to see if I can help.

[95] **Bethan Jenkins:** Well, we welcome, obviously, your passion and your enthusiasm to help the Welsh education sector in that regard and also, obviously, music progression in Wales. I think it's important that we've heard you've said today. Do any Members have any more questions before we come to an end?

[96] **Neil Hamilton:** I've got one question that occurs to me. When you're seeking to raise money, it's always easier to do it for a specific object rather than for general purposes.

[97] **Dr Hughes:** Yes.

[98] **Neil Hamilton:** And if there is a problem in relation to instrument provision, in that people can't afford to buy them or whatever, perhaps it would be a good idea for us to have a national loan fund or a national bank of instruments, which people could borrow or buy on a long-term funding basis.

[99] **Dr Hughes:** I actually think that's a brilliant idea and, in fact, that same bank—when, for example, a pupil has been learning, let's say the half fiddle and three-quarter fiddle, and they move on, they can go into this bank as well. I really agree with you. It's the same principle—. You've got the Amatis and Stradivarius or whatever that no player can actually afford. They're owned by these billionaires or whoever, so they loan them to these people. When I first went to the Hallé orchestra, the Hallé owned an Amati and a Guarneri, so the leader of the orchestra would then loan the Amati to lead the orchestra. Now, it's the same principle as that. I like the idea of the loan but also to make a bank, so that when we hear of instruments that are not being used, they can go into the bank. I think it's a brilliant idea.

[100] **Neil Hamilton:** And we've got a couple of violins in the attic that belonged to great aunts—

[101] **Dr Hughes:** Exactly. Well, there you are.



[102] **Neil Hamilton:** All I can do is open the case. [*Laughter.*]

[103] **Bethan Jenkins:** I would say, though, if somebody's progressing I think it's important as well that we think of the quality of the instrument. I think that gets lost sometimes, because if somebody is actually showing real talent, if they're playing on a patchy cello then, actually, they don't realise their own potential because they're not hearing the sound that should be coming out of that cello.

[104] **Dr Hughes:** Exactly.

[105] **Bethan Jenkins:** So, I think we need to be looking at not only just getting an instrument because somebody might have it in their attic, but also what that instrument offers in terms of potential for that person.

[106] **Dr Hughes:** I think, again, you're talking like a musician; that's a very, very good idea. As they get better, you know they're going to sound much better with a better instrument. I used to do it at the youth orchestra, by the way: I let people play on other people's instruments—the younger ones could see what it was like to play on a much better instrument. I could see it on their faces. That is part of improvement: you go to a better instrument and you think, 'Wow, I'm making a better sound here.' Yes, it's a very good idea. Very good.

[107] **Bethan Jenkins:** Brilliant. Well, we've thoroughly enjoyed your evidence session today. We didn't see your conducting skills here today. I was going to get my baton out just to—

[108] **Dr Hughes:** Your baton—my God. [*Laughter.*]

[109] **Bethan Jenkins:** Just to turn the tables around somewhat.

[110] **Dr Hughes:** Absolutely.

[111] **Bethan Jenkins:** I forgot it; it's at home.

[112] Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am      Thank you very much for joining us  
ddod i mewn heddiw.                      today.

[113] **Dr Hughes:** Pleser mawr.                      **Dr Hughes:** It's a great pleasure.

[114] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwy'n **Bethan Jenkins:** I hope that you will gobeithio y gallwch chi gymryd take an interest in what will be diddordeb yn yr hyn sy'n cael ei discussed throughout our inquiry, drafod drwy gydol yr ymchwiliad, a and, of course, we will keep in byddwn ni, wrth gwrs, yn cadw mewn contact with you in the context of cysylltiad â chi yng nghyd-destun y any further discussions here as well. drafodaeth bellach yma hefyd.

[115] **Dr Hughes:** It's been a privilege for me to be here. I've thoroughly enjoyed it, actually, because this sort of back and forth, and talking and questioning, is a stimulus in itself, and that's how we move on, do you know what I mean? I am as enthusiastic now as I was God knows how many years ago, and the day I lose my enthusiasm then—. I believe in it and any support I can give you, you've got it.

[116] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn.

[117] **Dr Hughes:** Thank you. Do I disappear now? [*Laughter.*]

[118] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Dyna **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you. That yw diwedd y cyfarfod yma heddiw. brings us to the end of this meeting Diolch yn fawr iawn i'r Aelodau am today. Thank you to Members for gymryd rhan. taking part.

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 11:20.*

*The public part of the meeting ended at 11:20.*