



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and
Communications Committee](#)

14/09/2016

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)
[Meeting Agenda](#)

Cynnwys
Contents

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting
- 6 Craffu ar Waith Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros yr Economi a'r Seilwaith:
Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Pumed Cynulliad
Scrutiny of the Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure:
Priorities for the Fifth Assembly
- 28 Bil Cymru: Tystiolaeth gan Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg
Wales Bill: Evidence from the Office of the Welsh Language
Commissioner
- 46 Craffu ar waith Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes:
Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Pumed Cynulliad
Scrutiny of the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language:
Priorities for the Fifth Assembly

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Mae hon yn fersiwn ddrafft o'r cofnod. Cyhoeddir fersiwn derfynol ymhen pum diwrnod gwaith.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. This is a draft version of the record. The final version will be published within five working days.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Hannah Blythyn	Llafur
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour
Suzy Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig
Bywgraffiad Biography	Welsh Conservatives
Neil Hamilton	UKIP Cymru
Bywgraffiad Biography	UKIP Wales
Bethan Jenkins	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor)
Bywgraffiad Biography	The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Dai Lloyd	Plaid Cymru
Bywgraffiad Biography	The Party of Wales
Jeremy Miles	Llafur
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour
Eluned Morgan	Llafur (yn dirprwyo ar ran Dawn Bowden)
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour (substitute for Dawn Bowden)
Lee Waters	Llafur
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Manon Antoniazzi	Cyfarwyddwr, Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth, Llywodraeth Cymru Director, Culture, Sport and Tourism, Welsh Government
Alun Davies	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes) Assembly Member, Labour (the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language)
Huw Gapper	Uwch Swyddog Polisi ac Ymchwil, Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Senior Officer Policy and Research, Welsh Government, the Office of the Welsh Language Commissioner
Paul Kindred	Uwch-ddadansoddwr Polisi, Llywodraeth Cymru Senior Policy Analyst, Welsh Government
Peter Owen	Pennaeth y Gangen Polisi y Celfyddydau, Llywodraeth Cymru Head of Arts Branch, Welsh Government

Dyfan Sion	Cyfarwyddwr Polisi ac Ymchwil, Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Director of Policy and Research, the Office of the Welsh Language Commissioner
Ken Skates	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros yr Economi a'r Seilwaith) Assembly Member, Labour (the Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure)
Bethan Webb	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr, Yr Iaith Gymraeg, Llywodraeth Cymru Deputy Director, Welsh Language, Welsh Government

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Steve George	Clerc Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Alys Thomas	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Clerc Deputy Clerk
Robin Wilkinson	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:15.
The meeting began at 09:15.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[1] **Bethan Jenkins:** Croeso i'r **Bethan Jenkins:** Welcome to the
pwyllgor a chroeso yn ôl i Aelodau ar committee and welcome back to
ôl yr haf. Gobeithiaf eich bod chi i Members after the summer. I hope
gyd wedi cael brêc hefyd yn ystod y that you've all had a break during the
gwyliau. Os bydd larwm tân, dylai holidays. If the fire alarm should
pawb adael yr ystafell trwy'r sound, everyone should leave the
allanfeydd tân penodol a dilyn room via the fire exits and they
cyfarwyddiadau'r tywyswyr a'r staff. should follow instructions from the

Ni ddisgwylir prawf heddiw. Dylai bawb troi eu ffonau symudol i fod yn dawel, os gwelwch yn dda. Mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithio'n ddwyieithog. Mae clustffonau ar gael i glywed y cyfieithu ar y pryd a gellid hefyd addasu'r sain arnynt, ar gyfer pobl sy'n drwm eu clyw. Mae'r cyfieithiad ar y pryd ar gael ar sianel 1, a darllediad gair am air i glywed y sain yn well ar sianel 0. Peidiwch â chyffwrdd y botymau ar y microffonau, oherwydd y gall hynny amharu ar y system, a gofawch bod y golau coch ymlaen cyn dechrau siarad.

ushers and staff. We do not expect a drill today. Everyone should turn their mobile phones on to 'silent' please. The National Assembly operates bilingually. Headphones are available to hear the simultaneous translation and you can adjust the audio on them, for people who are hard of hearing. The interpretation is available on channel 1, and the floor language for sound amplification is on channel 0. Please don't touch the buttons on the microphones, because that can interfere with the system, but do make sure the red light is on before you start speaking.

[2] A oes unrhyw ddatganiadau o fuddiannau yr hoffai Aelodau ddatgan cyn inni ddechrau? Na. Rydym ni wedi cael ymddiheuriadau gan Dawn Bowden; mae hi'n sâl ar hyn o bryd, a gobeithio y bydd yn gwella'n fuan. Mae Eluned Morgan yn mynd i ddod i'r pwyllgor—dyma hi ar y gair—yn lle Dawn am y tro.

Are there any declarations of interest that Members would like to make before we begin? I see there are none. We've received apologies from Dawn Bowden, who is ill at present, and we hope that she gets better soon. Eluned Morgan will substitute for her—and, as I say that, here comes Eluned, who's replacing Dawn for now.

09:16

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod

Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd ar gyfer eitemau 3 ac 8 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(vi).

that the committee resolves to exclude the public for items 3 and 8 in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.
Motion moved.*

[3] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eitem 2 yw'r cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i benderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod ar gyfer eitemau 3 ac 8. Felly, rwy'n cynnig bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod ar gyfer yr eitemau yma, yn unol â'r Rheolau Sefydlog, os yw pobl yn hapus. Diolch yn fawr.

Bethan Jenkins: Item 2 is a motion under Standing Order 17.42 to exclude the public from the meeting for items 3 and 8. So, I move that the committee does agree to exclude the public from these items in accordance with the Standing Orders, if everyone is content. Thank you, I see you are.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 09:16.
The public part of the meeting ended at 09:16.*

*Ailymgynullodd y pwyllgor yn gyhoeddus am 09:46.
The committee reconvened in public at 09:46.*

**Craffu ar Waith Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros yr Economi a'r Seilwaith:
Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Pumed Cynulliad
Scrutiny of the Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure:
Priorities for the Fifth Assembly**

[4] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym yn mynd i symud i eitem 4 a chraffu ar waith Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros yr Economi a'r Seilwaith: blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y pumed Cynulliad. Pwrpas y sesiwn yw cymryd tystiolaeth gan Ken Skates fel yr Ysgrifennydd Cabinet priodol ar ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y pumed Cynulliad. Mae e wedi paratoi papur, sydd yn y papurau o'ch blaenau chi fel Aelodau Cynulliad, ac yn y papurau cyhoeddus. Hefyd, mae yna friff gan y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil

Bethan Jenkins: We'll move to item 4, which is scrutiny of the Cabinet Secretary for the Economy and Infrastructure, and priorities for the fifth Assembly. The purpose of this session is to take evidence from Ken Skates as the relevant Cabinet Secretary on his priorities for the fifth Assembly. He has prepared a paper, which is available in your papers as Assembly Members, and in the public papers. There is also a brief that the Research Service has prepared for us.

ynghlŷn â hynny hefyd.

[5] Mae yna bobl sy'n rhan o dîm y Gweinidog—yr Ysgrifennydd, sori—yma hefyd: Manon Antoniazzi a Peter Owen. Felly, os fedrwch chi wneud pum munud o gyflwyniad ac wedyn gallwn ni fynd drwy themâu a chwestiynau gan Aelodau, ac wedyn mynd o fanna. Diolch yn fawr.

There are people who are members of the Secretary's team here: Manon Antoniazzi and Peter Owen. So, if you could give a five-minute introduction and then we could go into the themes and questions from Members, and then we'll take it from there. Thank you.

[6] **The Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure (Kenneth Skates):** Thank you, Chair. Can I begin by congratulating you on your election as Chair of this important committee and welcome Members to it, in particular those Members who are new? I'm conscious that a good degree of work was done in the previous Assembly on a number of the subject areas that we'll be discussing today, and that work might be rather new to those Members. So, I'd like to offer the opportunity to Members to have a briefing session, perhaps, on the Historic Environment (Wales) Act 2016, which I think contains a good deal of detail that Members may wish to be familiar with. In addition, if there are any specific briefing notes or briefing papers that Members would benefit from having, I'd be more than happy to ask officials to put those together.

[7] In terms of priorities for this Assembly, clearly, in regard to the historic environment, in regard to the culture sector and the arts, I wish Wales to become a more active nation. I think we have a very proud record in promoting heritage and in participating in the arts, but I wish people to become more active in the arts and in physical activity as well. That's one of the priorities—a healthier and more active Wales.

[8] I also wish to see the culture sector become an integral part of a prosperous and secure Wales and also of helping to unite people and connect people. The fundamental needs of all human beings include the need to feel competent and connected; the arts and the culture sectors provide an ideal opportunity for that to happen. So, I wish to see organisations and institutions become more responsive to Welsh Government priorities in building a more united, a more connected Wales, a Wales that is more ambitious, that is learning, that is secure and that is prosperous.

[9] In terms of the institutions and some of the national sponsored

bodies—their resilience and sustainability—we know that pressures on public finance will continue, so I wish them to become more resilient. I will be endeavouring to assist in raising additional forms of income, whether it be fundraising or sponsorship or money through philanthropic means. There are a number of actions within the manifesto upon which we were elected that will form the basis of the programme for government that I believe will offer huge new opportunities to the culture sector to influence and to participate in wider Government programmes.

[10] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr am fod yn fyr, Ysgrifennydd. Rwy'n credu bod hynny yn rhoi rhyw fath o gyd-destun, ond dim ond i bobl wybod—y rhai sydd yn gwyllo a hefyd Aelodau'r Cynulliad—rydym ni'n mynd i fod yn edrych yn benodol ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, amgueddfeydd, archifau a llyfrgelloedd, y celfyddydau, a chyhoeddi a llenyddiaeth o fewn *remit* y pwyllgor yma. Felly, rwy'n credu ei fod e'n bwysig ein bod ni'n gwneud hynny'n glir i'r bobl sydd â diddordeb yn y maes yma. Felly, rydym ni'n mynd i ddechrau—a diolch am gynnig briff i Aelodau'r Cynulliad; mae hynny'n rhywbeth rwy'n credu y bydd yn ddefnyddiol iawn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much for your brevity, Secretary. I think that does give us some sort of context, but just so that the people watching are aware and also Assembly Members, we are going to be looking specifically at the historic environment, museums, archives and libraries, the arts, and publishing and literature within the remit of this committee. So, I think it's important that we make that clear to those people who are interested in these issues. So, we are going to start—and thank you for that offer of a briefing to Assembly Members; I think that would be very useful.

[11] I ddechrau gyda'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn fras, wrth gwrs, roedd rhai ohonom ni, fel roeddech chi'n ei ddweud, yn rhan o'r cynllun hwnnw fel rhan o'r pwyllgor blaenorol. A oes yna fodd i ni gael esboniad ynglŷn â ble mae hynny ar hyn o bryd a hefyd unrhyw fath o wybodaeth ychwanegol ynglŷn â'r corff Cymru Hanesyddol, sydd yn rhan o'ch briff? Wedyn bydd rhwydd hynt i Aelodau ofyn

If we could start with the historic environment in very general terms, as you said, some of us were members of the predecessor committee that covered this in some detail. Could we have some idea of where that work is at the moment and any additional information about the Historic Wales organisation, which is part of your brief? Then Members can pose their own

cwestiynau.

questions.

[12] **Ken Skates:** Yes. Thank you, Chair. Well, in terms of the historic environment, it makes a huge contribution to our economy. It contributes to people's education, it boosts opportunities for volunteering and for enabling people to feel more connected and confident. There are 32,500 jobs connected to the historic environment, both in terms of the management and maintenance of historic assets and tourism-related heritage. It's one of the top reasons for people coming to Wales, so, in terms of the visitor economy, the built environment is incredibly important.

[13] The Act, the historic environment Act, received Royal Assent ahead of the Assembly elections, and it contains numerous provisions that place Wales at the forefront of heritage protection management in the UK and, I believe, beyond. The Act seeks to make improvements to the existing legislation by enhancing protection where required, but legislation, as the Member is well aware, can't alone deliver effective management of the historic environment. So, for example, I've been working with the Cabinet Secretary for planning and environment to improve planning policy. In that regard, the Cabinet Secretary has been consulting on the first-ever technical advice note for the historic environment, and a revised chapter of 'Planning Policy Wales' for the historic environment is being consulted upon.

[14] In terms of the Act itself, just if I give a quick overview on some of the primary measures within it, it seeks to improve the protection of scheduled monuments. It also expands the definition of scheduled monuments. Members may be aware of an incident in north-east Wales some years ago where Offa's Dyke was severely damaged. The legislation seeks to address the problems with previous legislation that were exposed as a consequence of the damage that took place. The Act also strengthens the ability of local planning authorities to intervene where listed buildings are either falling into disrepair or are being inappropriately maintained.

[15] The Act also enables heritage partnership agreements to be formed. Now, these agreements are particularly important where there are multiple historical assets within the ownership of one organisation, so, for example, the National Trust. It means that the system is simplified and it means that a longer term plan can be put in place for the maintenance and, indeed, promotion of historic environments. I've also talked about the work that's taking place in other departments within Government, but we are putting together best practice documents as well on maintaining and owning and

ensuring that listed buildings are well protected by their custodians or their owners.

[16] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes yna **Bethan Jenkins:** Do Members have gwestiynau gan Aelodau o ran y any questions specifically on this thema yma yn benodol? Pe byddai'r theme? Could the Minister also Gweinidog yn gallu esbonio hefyd—. explain, because I think, as part of Rwy'n credu fel rhan o'r cwestiwn the question, I did ask what Historic gwnes i ofyn beth oedd Cymru Wales is—? Can you answer that, Hanesyddol. A ydych chi'n gallu ateb please, and then we'll go to Dai hynny ac wedyn byddwn yn mynd at Lloyd? Dai Lloyd?

[17] **Ken Skates:** So, in the coming 10 days, there will be publication of the Randerson report, which looks at options for ensuring that the institutions and organisations—those primary organisations that manage our historic environment—are working closer together for the promotion of, and maintenance of, historic assets that can include museums; it can include castles, abbeys and so forth. The Randerson report will be published, I believe—is it 17 September?

[18] **Ms Antoniazzi:** It is, yes.

[19] **Kenneth Skates:** Imminently. That will be accompanied by an announcement of a steering group, which will contain members of the National Trust, the national library, the national museum, Cadw, the royal commission and, of course, representatives of trade union organisations, to explore the options that are presented in the Randerson report—options for bringing together some of the organisations and institutions that are tasked with promoting and managing historic assets. It's my view that Wales should be seen as a welcoming country—a country that is proud of its history and heritage; a country that is outward-looking. But I don't believe that people should come to Wales—or indeed the Welsh people should be inhibited in any way from experiencing the historic environment because of multiple layers of bureaucracy, different marketing strategies or different ticketing strategies. So, Baroness Randerson looked at how we can ensure that there are synergies that are exploited for the benefit of the people of Wales and visitors, but equally how the various institutions and national sponsored bodies can become more resilient and sustainable in an environment where public resources, quite frankly, are not going to be improving at any time soon. So, it's about the sustainability of the sector as well.

[20] It's also about ensuring that those skills are contained within the sector. If I may, I'll just identify one institution where we know there are very specialist skills that we need to be very proud of, and protect—the national library, for example. It's about how we make sure that those skills are retained, how we make sure that they're built on, and actually how we exploit those skills, not just for commercial potential but also for education. The idea of Historic Wales is to make sure that we have a historic environment that is better promoted, that we're prouder of, that captures more people on a constant basis, whether they're visitors or whether they're people of Wales. I think there's also a role for Historic Wales potentially in the development of a social tourism policy as well. In my view, there are far too many people from disadvantaged backgrounds, far too many carers, far too many looked-after children who simply don't have an opportunity to have time away from their responsibilities or away from home. I do believe that Historic Wales could be at the forefront of social tourism policy, not just in Wales but further afield as well. We could develop something that we could be very, very proud of indeed.

[21] In terms of the historic environment Act, Manon, do you have any updates on some of the regulations? Because this is going to be of particular significance to new Members as well. These are going to be coming forward imminently.

[22] **Ms Antoniazzi:** As you said earlier, Minister, you enumerated some of the ways in which the Act gives improved protection and flexibility for local authorities to intervene where buildings are at risk and so forth. It also places historic environment records on a statutory footing. So, those records are going to be the basis of a lot of our work in the future. I think I would just refer back to another thing that you alluded to briefly, which is the series of best practice guidance documents, which are going to be looking at supporting the management of the heritage by all kinds of stakeholders, ranging from improving the way that we manage historic assets of special local significance, all the way through to managing world heritage sites, which are obviously of global significance. So, there'll be more on that in the autumn.

[23] **Bethan Jenkins:** Bydd yn rhaid **Bethan Jenkins:** We will have to ask inni geisio gofyn mwy o gwestiynau further questions down the line, lawr y lein, achos mae yna lot o because there are a lot of other themâu gwahanol. Os gallwn ni drio themes. So, if we could try to get the

cael cwestiynau i mewn, byddai hynny'n grêt. Dai Lloyd, rydych chi eisiau gofyn cwestiwn.

questions in, that would be great. Dai Lloyd, I think you have a question.

[24] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. A allaf i ddiolch i'r Ysgrifennydd Cabinet am ei adroddiad, ac hefyd am ei adroddiad llafar? Yn enwedig fel Aelod newydd i'r lle yma—swil, mewnblyg, diymhongar fel fi—byddwn yn hoffi'r cynnig hwnnw o gael rhyw fath o *briefing* gennych chi ar Ddeddf yr amgylchedd hanesyddol. Felly, diolch yn fawr am y cynnig hwnnw.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you, Chair. May I thank the Cabinet Secretary for his paper and for his oral report? Particularly as a new Member of this place—I am shy, introverted—I would appreciate that offer of having some sort of briefing from you on the historic environment Act. So, thank you very much for that offer.

[25] O ran fy nghwestiwn i, fe wnaethoch chi sôn yn fyr am bwysigrwydd hanes yng nghydestun adeiladau, neu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol, a phwysigrwydd hybu ymwybyddiaeth o'n hanes ni fel cenedl i'n pobl ni, yn ogystal â'r sawl sy'n ymweld, ac yn benodol felly i'n hysgolion ni, achos mae ymwybyddiaeth o hanes Cymru yn ddiffygiol yn aml.

You briefly mentioned the importance of history in the context of our built environment, or historic environment, and the importance of promoting the importance of our history as a nation to our own people as well as to visitors, and particularly in our schools, because an awareness of the history of the Wales is very deficient very often.

10:00

[26] Rwy'n credu bod creiriau yn y fan hyn—mae yna adeiladau yn y fan hyn sy'n adnodd i'n hysgolion ni eu defnyddio, ac sydd yn galw allan am fwy o gydweithio, dywedwch, rhwng eich adran chi a'r adran addysg. Nid fy mod yn awgrymu eich bod yn mynd i gael gafael ar bortffolio arall yn ogystal â'r un sydd gyda chi, ond byddwn yn gobeithio, gan fod yr adnodd hanesyddol yma gyda ni, y

We do have some artefacts and buildings that are available, and they're a resource for our schools to use, and they are just crying out for more collaboration between your department and the education department. Not that I'm saying for one moment that you're going to get hold of another portfolio in addition to the one you already hold, but I would hope, in having this historic

byddem ni'n ei lawn defnyddio fe— resource, that we make full use of
 nid jest ei gadw fe, ond i hybu it—not just to preserve it, but to
 ymwybyddiaeth o'n hanes ni fel promote awareness of our own
 cenedl, sy'n mynd yn ôl dros history as a nation, which goes back
 ganrifoedd. over many centuries.

[27] **Kenneth Skates:** I agree entirely with the Member. This is one area where I'm most excited. In my portfolio, I think the connection that we can have across Government, to promote—whether it be for the purpose of better health or better education—our historic environment and culture is enormous. It's incredibly exciting, and one of the developments that I think we should be looking at very closely at the moment is St Fagans, as a potential exemplar development that seeks to bring together culture and education, because within the St Fagans development, there is a unit that can be used for overnight accommodation for schools. Again, this links in, potentially, to the social tourism policy.

[28] Promoting culture and heritage to learners—and, I'd suggest, learners at every age—is vitally important, because it references where we're from, it gives us a sense of connectedness to other people, it improves our confidence and our competence as well, through opportunities to volunteer and to gain work experience. In terms of promoting that to schools and to other organisations, I do think that the thematic years that we've rolled out, this year being the Year of Adventure, but next year being the Year of Legends, could be of incredible value. With the Year of Legends, it's my vision to explore some of the heritage that hasn't really been promoted in recent years, or indeed, ever before. Local stories, for example, give people a sense of identity for the location where they've been born and where they live. It could be very valuable in drawing people together at a time where I think, generally, society is becoming more fragmented. So, the Year of Legends could be of great importance, and I'm keen to make sure that we continue with the thematic years. But, equally, it's important that I use the remit letters to the national sponsored bodies as a challenge in this regard as well, to make sure that there are targets; that there are objectives in place for those national bodies to link in with educational institutions, with training providers, with health boards, for the benefit of people's well-being as well. In fact, we're all obliged to do that anyway under the well-being of future generations Act.

[29] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much am yr ateb yna. Mor ddiddorol ag for that answer. Interesting as it was,

oedd e, s ydym ni'n gallu trio cadw'r can we try to keep a little more
atebion bach yn fyr? Mae yna themâu focused? We have a lot of themes,
gwahanol gyda ni, ac ni fyddwn yn and we're in danger of not covering
cyfro popeth os na fydd hynny'n everything if that doesn't happen.
digwydd. Lee Waters, mae cwestiwn Lee Waters, you have a question.
gyda chi.

[30] **Lee Waters:** Diolch. I'm interested in the Historic Wales idea, and I think you're absolutely right to try and explore synergies. I just wonder if you could tell us a little bit about the process you have in mind. So, there's a report due imminently, then there's a steering group; what happens then?

[31] **Kenneth Skates:** The steering group will then draw up the timeframe for actions and they will make recommendations to me based on the options that the Randerson report produced. The timeframe will be determined by that steering group; I wouldn't wish to influence that at this stage. The people who are on the steering group, I've got immense confidence in for taking this piece of work forward, but they will be tasked with examining all the options, then producing a road map—setting each of the options and recommendations, and then producing a road map for reaching Historic Wales in whatever guise that might be. But, I'm very clear that Historic Wales should be established for the purpose of drawing together institutions and organisations for mutual benefit, and, principally, for the benefit of the people that they all serve.

[32] **Lee Waters:** Thank you.

[33] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydy hynny'n **Bethan Jenkins:** Is that okay, Lee? Are iawn, Lee? A ydych chi'n hapus gyda you happy with that? Eluned Morgan hynny? Mae cwestiwn gan Eluned has a question now. Thank you. Morgan nawr. Diolch.

[34] **Eluned Morgan:** I just wanted to follow up on that question, really. I can see that there's benefit in mutual benefit, but I'm not clear what the drivers are beyond that, in terms of what the remit of the Baroness Randerson report was. What is the problem that we're trying to resolve here? Is it a financial problem? I can understand that synergies might be useful, but there's a huge difference between full mergers and back-office—bringing together of those things.

[35] **Ken Skates:** Absolutely.

[36] **Eluned Morgan:** So, what's the driver here? I'm not clear.

[37] **Ken Skates:** There are multiple drivers. You've identified some. Of course, resources are one. The protection and enhancement of skills contained within the organisations is another—again, linked to public finances. Also, the need for a simpler offer for the people of Wales and for visitors. Also, to find ways of better promotion of all of the assets. I find it incredible that, within Cardiff, we have different organisations running with different marketing strategies and different ticketing processes: Cardiff Castle, Castell Coch and Tredegar House—different organisations where there could be a central, powerful and distinct 'Historic Wales' unit that could promote all of the assets together. So, it's not just about resources, but it's about skills and promotion and it's also about having the shared expertise and the drive to take advantage of some of the Welsh Government programmes that could be hugely advantageous to the people that the institutions serve, whether it be in terms of health or tackling poverty.

[38] I'll give you another example in the Fusion programme, which has been operating in six pioneer areas, but it's been rolled out to 25 pioneer areas. We have numerous institutions and organisations that are part of the Fusion programme, but if we could simplify the offer and bring many together, I think it would be even more compelling and it would reach more people.

[39] **Bethan Jenkins:** Os yw'n iawn, a allwch chi roi'r manylion i lawr y lein o ran sut y mae pethau'n mynd i weithio? Wedyn bydd hynny'n helpu'r pwyllgor i ddatblygu ei waith ynglŷn â *remit* y grŵp hwnnw.

Bethan Jenkins: If it's okay, could you give us the details in terms of how things are going to work? Then that will assist the Committee to develop its work i. terms of that group's remit?

[40] Rydym yn symud ymlaen at amgueddfeydd, archifau a llyfrgelloedd yn awr, os yw hynny'n iawn, Ysgrifennydd. A allwch chi egluro sut y mae'r adolygiadau arbenigol o lyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus ac amgueddfeydd lleol wedi mynd a sut y maent wedi sbarduno mwy o waith a mwy o ddiddordeb yn y

We will move on now to museums, archives and libraries, if that is okay, Cabinet Secretary. Could you explain to us how the expert reviews into public libraries and local museums has gone and how they have driven greater work and greater interest in these areas? Then Members will be able to ask questions.

meysydd yma? Wedyn bydd
Aelodau'n gallu gofyn cwestiynau.

[41] **Kenneth Skates:** Thank you, Chair. This is another area of work that I find very exciting. I think it was C.S. Lewis who once said that we read so that we know that we are not alone, and I think that means that libraries are incredibly important in drawing people together, although it is often in silence. But on the expert review of public libraries, along with the expert review of museums, the work has been incredibly valuable in informing future strategies. I would like to thank everybody who has been involved in both reviews.

[42] In terms of libraries, the review has enabled us to produce best-practice guidance and a toolkit that helps local authorities and communities understand the challenges and the opportunities of establishing community-managed libraries. They've provided guidance on statutory library services and community-managed libraries. It's also enabled us to produce the report, 'Scoping a New Future for Welsh Public Libraries'. I do think that we have something of a proud story to tell about Welsh public libraries. We've lived through incredibly difficult times in recent years and I think we're all aware of the pressures that have been on local authority budgets. In spite of those pressures, the figures so far show that only 20 public libraries in Wales since 2011 have closed permanently. It might be worth the committee looking at how that compares to the rest of the UK.

[43] In that time, we've also invested considerable sums in the utter transformation of more than 100 community libraries across Wales. It's my view that libraries in the twenty-first century shouldn't just be there for containing books. They serve more than one purpose now and the purpose of the community learning libraries is to establish hubs in the centre of communities that people can call into whether they wish to use computers, wish to read, wish to read magazines, get advice, use a cafe or whatever it might be—but they become the heart of a community or they become a component of a larger heart in a community. We've got examples of community learning libraries that have been established in leisure centres, for example. It's about consolidating the facilities that we have so that that facility that emerges is sustainable for the future and is attractive to people for a variety of reasons.

[44] In terms of the expert panel on museums, we've accepted most of the 10 recommendations. It was produced at a time that made it difficult for us

to actually then respond with a new strategy, and we did say at the time that this would be for a new Government. And so, as a result of that, we are now developing a new museum plan for Wales. But, again, we know that there are pressures on museums across Wales. We've been able to give advice to local authorities, both in terms of libraries and museums, but those pressures are likely to continue. So, there is a need to ensure that museums, like libraries, are more resilient for the future, that they examine ways of becoming community hubs as well.

[45] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. If we could receive more information about that plan shortly, that would be excellent. I think Jeremy Miles has the next question.

[46] **Jeremy Miles:** Yn eich papur chi, mae gyda chi drafodaeth ynglŷn â llyfrgelloedd digidol a'r broses o ddiuideiddio'r stoc ag ati. Pa mor bell ych chi'n gweld hynny yn ymestyn i mewn i lyfrgelloedd lleol awdurdodau lleol neu lyfrgelloedd cymunedol?

Jeremy Miles: In your paper, you mentioned digital libraries and the process of digitising stock and so on. How far do you see that extending into local authority libraries or community libraries even?

[47] **Ken Skates:** Well, that's contained within the standards, and I'm pleased to say that the number of libraries in Wales that are achieving this standard is increasing, and the number of museums likewise, because I think there is a role for digital technologies in museums. Well, we're seeing it already with the People's Collection Wales. It's of invaluable significance in promoting Wales as well, but we're seeing it with local museums, the use of digital technology, and, again, within the accreditation programme for museums, there is a need to make sure that you have services there that are fit for the twenty-first century. I see digital as being an agenda that crosses all Government departments and should penetrate very deeply into all service provisions. When we look at the role of libraries in the twenty-first century, they have as great a role in terms of leisure as they have in terms of providing essential information on an advisory basis, and whether it be in terms of giving advice on housing benefit or going through the process of actually applying for benefits, libraries are increasingly becoming the port of call for people who need advice or support or need to make an application for Government assistance.

[48] **Jeremy Miles:** And in terms of the digital agenda generally, you wouldn't distinguish between local authority-run libraries and community-run libraries in terms of the scale of your ambition.

[49] **Ken Skates:** No, not at all. In terms of the library standards, the library standards should apply to all.

[50] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt. Mae yna **Bethan Jenkins:** Great. There is a gwestiwn gan Neil Hamilton. question from Neil Hamilton.

[51] **Neil Hamilton:** Well, I'm very pleased to hear you say that. When I was a kid, I used to read after lights-out under the bedclothes, and today, kids are stuck in front of computer screens, I believe, all the time. So, obviously, digitisation is the way of the future. We've been talking about the assets that you're ultimately responsible for, in ministerial terms, but what matters is the use that is made of them, isn't it? I was wondering to what extent there is any integration inside the Government machine between the department for education, for example, because we're talking about, basically, kids, aren't we, in what we've been discussing today? And it's vitally important, I think, to enthuse youngsters in the way that you're obviously enthused about the matters for which you are responsible.

[52] **Ken Skates:** Can I thank the Member for the question and say that I'd particularly like to provide briefing notes on a number of points here? Because I could talk for too long, I think, on various subjects that are relevant here. But, if I could just touch on some of them, if I may.

[53] **Bethan Jenkins:** Briefly, please. [*Laughter.*]

[54] **Ken Skates:** As briefly as I can. We've worked together with education and other departments on some major projects, including the Every Child a Library Member scheme, which I'd like to provide a briefing note on, because that's something I'm particularly passionate about—we automatically sign up every year 4 pupil now to become a member of their local library, and what the evidence is showing us is that it's not just beneficial for the child; in some cases, we're seeing that their family members, their parents, are going into libraries and joining for the first time in their lives as well. Really, really significant in challenging perceptions and challenging deprivation. We also have the summer reading challenge, which proves to be incredibly successful, and which we operate with the education department.

[55] I mentioned Fusion. I'd like to provide a briefing note on Fusion as well, because the idea of that programme is to challenge the cultural organs in communities to engage more directly with people who, for all manner of reasons, have not been part of cultural activity. Also, there's arts and creative learning, which is a £20 million programme that links us with education and with the Arts Council of Wales for the purpose of promoting creativity within schools. If I could provide briefing notes on those rather than talk for too long, I'd be very grateful.

10:15

[56] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt. Diolch yn fawr. Sori, mae hyn jest o ran amser—mae'n anodd. Mae cwestiwn bras gan Lee Waters hefyd. **Bethan Jenkins:** Great. Thank you very much. Sorry, it's just because of the time—it's difficult. We now have a question from Lee Waters.

[57] **Lee Waters:** Yes, I wanted to ask a little bit about the library standards you mentioned and how local authorities are assisted in developing those standards, given that resources are declining. What's the dynamic around those standards?

[58] **Ken Skates:** We provide advice, we provide support and we provide guidance. But we can also provide, as we have been doing, capital support as well. It's for local authorities to utilise their grants—their RSGs—for the purpose of maintaining the service provision, but we are able to provide grants for transformation to make them more resilient. Primarily in terms of ensuring that the standards are met, our role is in providing the support, advice and guidance. But it is—

[59] **Lee Waters:** What happens if they're not met?

[60] **Ken Skates:** If they're not met, the ultimate sanction is that I can determine we take them over. That has not been used yet.

[61] **Lee Waters:** Okay.

[62] **Ken Skates:** But we do have, if I may say so, if you like, a risk monitor of all of the libraries that are operated or, at least, all the local authority library services.

[63] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rŷm ni'n gallu **Bethan Jenkins:** We can return to

dod yn ôl at lot o'r pethau yma yn sicr. Mae lot o themâu ac ni fyddwn ni'n gallu gofyn cwestiynau ar bopeth. So, rwy'n mynd i symud ymlaen at y celfyddydau. Rwy'n credu bod hwn yn rhywbeth lle rydym ni wedi cael nifer fawr o ymatebion dros yr haf—ynghlŷn â chylch gwaith ein pwyllgor ni. Roedd lot o gwestiynau ynghlŷn â'r celfyddydau, eto o ran toriadau ond eto o ran beth sy'n cael ei wthio a'r pethau sydd ddim efallai yn cael yr un fath o ffocws.

[64] Wrth gwrs, rhowch eich barn ynghlŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru gyfan, ond roedd un cwestiwn penodol ynghlŷn â pham nad yw Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gwneud cymaint o operâu wedi'u seilio ar Gymru o ran hanes—rwy'n credu eu bod nhw'n gwneud Macbeth cyn hir—a ddim yn gwneud digon o waith ynghlŷn â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yng Nghymru. Rwy'n cydnabod eu bod yn cael cyllid gan Loegr hefyd ac, felly, efallai mai hynny yw rhan o'r—nid problem, ond rhan o'r drafodaeth. Ond, efallai y gallech chi ateb hynny a hefyd ddweud wrthym ni sut rydych chi'n gweld yr adran hon o'r portffolio'n gweithio a sut, wedyn, mae pobl Cymru'n gallu ymwneud â'r celfyddydau'n fwy, yn enwedig o ran yr agenda tlodi?

many of these issues certainly. There are a number of themes that we're not going to be able to cover this morning. So I'm going to move on to the arts. I think this is something that we've received a number of responses on over the summer—in terms of our committee's remit. There were a number of questions on the arts—again in the context of cuts but also in terms of what's being promoted and what perhaps is not being given the same kind of focus.

[65] Of course, you can give your view on what is happening at an all-Wales level, but there was one question as to why Welsh National Opera wasn't actually producing so many operas based on Wales and Welsh history—I think they're doing Macbeth before too very long—and not doing enough work in terms of what's happening within Wales. I do acknowledge that they receive funding from England too and perhaps that is what accounts for part of the—not a problem perhaps, but part of the discussion. But, perhaps you could respond to that and also tell us how you see this section of the portfolio working and developing and how the people of Wales can become more engaged with the arts, particularly in terms of the poverty agenda?

[66] **Ken Skates:** Okay, I'll be as succinct as I can be. In terms of the WNO, I'll just deal with that issue very briefly. You're right—it receives significant funding from England and tours England as much as it tours Wales, if not more. I could not influence, and I would not wish to determine, on the WNO's

behalf, what the content of their activities should be. That is for them, I believe. I've attended performances of a nature that is appealing to a wide range of people. I think it's as important to make sure that you appeal to indigenous people as you do appeal to people outside of Wales. But it is very much for the WNO to determine what they provide for their patrons.

[67] In terms of the arts, this is again an area of work that is particularly exciting. We have, as I've already mentioned, the arts and creative learning programme and we have the Fusion programme. I can share with committee members today the news that there will be a new culture strategy. That work has been taking place over the summer. That strategy is being developed right now. In addition, there are numerous activities contained within the programme for government, based on the manifesto pledges, that will be of direct interest to the arts community. Principally, the development of a Wales well-being bond and social prescriptions. I think the two tied together and have the potential to be game-changing in terms of how we shift the health service from an ill-health service to a wellness service. There's also a challenge fund, specifically for community arts and community sport, linked to digital inclusion and the development of new talent. Particularly in a country where we are bursting with ability but where resources are often scarce, I think the existence of a challenge fund could help people realise their potential and, indeed, focus on community engagement.

[68] The remit letters to the national sponsor bodies—primarily, of course, the Arts Council of Wales—are very clear in terms of active participation and participation. I should say that, in terms of becoming a more creative country, I think we are making great progress. The latest data show that, particularly among young people, we are seeing a rapid increase in participation rates. They show that almost 90 per cent of young people and children participate in the arts at least once a year, and that figure is the highest that it ever has been. In terms of adults, more could be done, and that's why we have got the Fusion programme. But, again, it's on the increase, and it's at the highest level since 2009, so we are back to almost pre-austerity levels. So, we are in a good position in terms of participation. We are heading in the right direction. We have got some programme for government measures that I think will further enhance the offer that we have and tie in the arts with education and with health. But, there are pressures on resources at a local authority level and a national level. We can't escape from that. We will do all we can to protect institutions and to protect practitioners. That's why we have developed, for example, the arts and creative learning programme, which contains within it a fund that enables young people,

perhaps for the first time in their lives, to experience arts activities.

[69] **Bethan Jenkins:** Can I just interrupt?

[70] **Ken Skates:** Yes.

[71] **Bethan Jenkins:** I am sure that some of these issues will come through. Hannah has a question.

[72] **Hannah Blythyn:** Thank you, Chair. You touched on it slightly, but, in your opener, you talked about Wales being more active in the arts. What role do you see for the challenge fund, the well-being bond and social prescriptions in this, especially in the light of budget straits and the tackling poverty agenda?

[73] **Ken Skates:** Absolutely. Okay, so, in terms of tackling poverty, the Fusion programme is the principal mechanism for addressing the challenges that people face in getting employment and developing the confidence and the qualifications that they need. That programme we are committed to, and we are expanding it to 25 areas of Wales. In terms of education, again, we are committed to arts and education. In terms of health, the well-being bond and social prescriptions will potentially match illnesses that people present at GP surgeries with local activities—whether they be in the arts, whether they be in heritage, whether they be in sport or physical activity—with known treatments that are able to prevent an illness from becoming worse or, indeed, to enable that illness to be successfully treated. There have been pilot schemes that have proven to be particularly effective, especially in the area of mental health. If I could make one suggestion for this committee to look at a quick piece of work, it would be on the link between the arts and health. I am in the process of speaking with colleagues in other departments on the development of a new arts and health strategy, and it might be timely, if I may suggest, for the committee to look at this piece of work, especially ahead of the roll-out of the social prescription and well-being bond.

[74] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy, roedd **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy, you had a gennytt ti gwestiwn, ac wedyn Eluned. question, and then Eluned.

[75] **Jeremy Miles:** Rydych chi wedi **Jeremy Miles:** You have mentioned sôn am y dyhead i ehangu the aspiration to enhance and creadigrwydd yng Nghymru. O ran y expand creativity in Wales. In terms polisi celfyddydau a'r polisi sy'n of the arts policy and the policy

cefnogi'r diwydiannau creadigol, beth ydych chi'n gweld yw'r ffin, ac a oes unrhyw enghreifftiau o gydweithredu neu gyd-gynllunio, ac ati? A allwch chi ymhelaethu ar y ffin rhwng y ddau faes polisi hynny? supporting creative industries, where do you see the boundary there, and are there any examples of collaboration? Could you expand on the boundary between those two policy areas?

[76] **Ken Skates:** We try not to create clear boundaries where a clear boundary will not benefit the consumer or the practitioner, but there are roles for the arts council that are distinctive to the role of those who manage the creative industries. While there are people who are employed at the same point in time or at different times in their career in one or both of those sectors, there is a need to make sure that one focuses on economic return as a driver—if you like, the commercial arts—and that the other, which is the subsidised arts, is managed by those who are able to convey the significance of products that goes beyond their economic value. That is a role for arts councils. Arts councils are there to provide support and finance to forms of creativity that would not be commercially viable. We have, in between, something of a void at the moment. It's captured now by the increasing degree of self-generated art that we often see on the internet, whether it be on YouTube or others—particularly digital. We also see, increasingly at a community level, self-generated art that is neither supported by the subsidised arts delivery system nor by the creative industries. It's my wish to see that gap filled with support from the challenge fund.

[77] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Sori, mae pum munud ar ôl gyda ni. Mae yna gwestiwn—. Gallwn ni ddod yn ôl at bopeth, yn sicr. Diolch. Mae cwestiwn gan Eluned. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. Sorry, we have only five minutes left. There's a question—. We can come back to all of these issues in the future, of course. Thank you. Eluned has a question.

[78] **Eluned Morgan:** Rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn falch i glywed bod grŵp trawsbleidiol ar y celfyddydau ac iechyd yn cwrdd am y tro cyntaf yn ystod y mis yma, felly bydd hynny'n gyfle, gobeithio, i edrych ar yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei wneud yn y maes yma. Ond rwyf yn meddwl eich bod chi ar flaen y gad fan hyn. Mae lot o **Eluned Morgan:** I'm sure you'll be pleased to hear that there is a cross-party group on the arts and health, which is to meet for the first time during this month, so that will hopefully be an opportunity to look at what's been done in this area. But I do think that you are in the vanguard here. A great deal of work has been

waith wedi cael ei wneud, ond rwy'n meddwl mai beth sy'n bwysig yw, gan eich bod yn gwneud hyn, eich bod yn mesur impact a'n bod ni yn cael rhyw fath o asesiad fel ein bod yn gweld a ydyw'n gweithio, ac os oes yna ffordd i adennill arian—arbed arian—o'r gwasanaeth iechyd, efallai, mae angen inni gael yr *evidence* yna, rwy'n meddwl. Byddai hynny'n bwysig.

done, but I think what's important is that, as you are doing this, you do actually assess its impact and that we do have some sort of an assessment so that we can see whether it is working or not, and if there is any way to save funding, or recoup some funding from the health service, perhaps, we need that evidence, I think. That would be very important.

[79] Roeddwn eisiau gofyn ichi ynglŷn â'r *remit letters* sy'n mynd i'r *arts council*, er enghraifft. I ba raddau y bydd hwnnw—celfyddydau ac iechyd—yn rhan o'r *remit letter* yna?

I wanted to ask you in terms of the remit letters that are sent to the arts council, for example. To what extent will the issue of the arts and health be part of that remit letter?

[80] **Ken Skates:** Well, the arts council has responded very well its impact. As a consequence of speaking with the arts council we decided that there would be a new arts and health strategy, so they are very keen to participate in any initiatives that bring together health providers and arts organisations. The remit letter identifies numerous objectives within the Government priorities, including promoting well-being and health. Then, based on those demands within the remit letter, an operational plan is proposed by the arts council that identifies clear objectives. Peter, are you able to give any indication as to what this year's remit letter has resulted in in terms of the operational plan proposals?

[81] **Mr Owen:** Well, it's basically emphasising the need, as you say, to evaluate the initiatives that are already in place, but also to do more work to promote and expand those initiatives that are already proven to be effective. As the Minister says, arts and health is a specific objective in the arts council's remit letter this year, so they are already in discussions with public health colleagues about this. Certainly your point about evaluation has been at the forefront of those discussions—the need, perhaps, to do some extra research this year to, if you like, make the case more fully for an expansion of arts and health initiatives and programmes.

[82] **Ken Skates:** I think it's really important just to mention that the well-

being bond would actually require investment from public organisations on the basis of performance targets being met. So, the money will be paid out on the basis of mutually agreed targets being met.

[83] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae cwpwl o funudau ar ôl gyda ni. Rydym jest yn mynd i symud ymlaen at gyhoeddi a llenyddiaeth. Ysgrifennydd, mae yna adolygiad ar hyn o bryd o lenyddiaeth a chyhoeddi, a chaf ar ddeall, o'ch tystiolaeth, fod hynny yn mynd i gael ei ddatgan ym mis Hydref. A oes modd ichi roi mwy o fanylion? Eto, rydym wedi cael lot—. Wel, rwyf i'n bersonol wedi cael pobl yn dweud eu bod nhw eisiau gwybod yn iawn beth sy'n digwydd, a hefyd o ran sut yr oedd y penderfyniad wedi cael ei wneud yn y gyllideb ddiwethaf o ran hyn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We've got a couple of minutes left. We'll just move on to looking at publishing and literature. Cabinet Secretary, there is a review currently of publishing and literature, and my understanding from your evidence is that there will be a statement on that in October. Are you in a position to give us greater details? Because I've personally, again, had people telling me that they want to know exactly what's happening, and also about how the decision was made in the last budget on this.

[84] **Kenneth Skates:** Absolutely. The Member will be aware that a previous review was undertaken into the Welsh Books Council, but I think, given the rapidly changing world that we live in, and particularly with new and emerging digital technologies, there was a necessity for us to look across the board at the publishing sector as a whole. I thought it was a timely opportunity to initiate a review of the support that is given to the publishing industry. You're right that there will be completion to that work reached in October, and I'd expect a statement thereafter. Can I say that the review has resulted in more responses than were secured for the Donaldson review? Believe it or not, there were more than 800 online responses to the review. So, it's proven to be an incredibly popular piece of work for people to contribute to.

[85] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê. A oes yna gwestiynau penodol ar hyn? Lee.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay. Are there any specific questions on this? Lee.

[86] **Lee Waters:** Just on a different subject, if I may.

[87] **Bethan Jenkins:** No, you can't.

[88] **Lee Waters:** Okay.

[89] **Bethan Jenkins:** No, it's fine. Carry on. [*Laughter.*]

10:30

[90] **Lee Waters:** There's some confusion from your paper on the media forum. I would just appreciate some clarity about where ministerial responsibility lies for this, because I was under the impression that it lies with Alun Davies, but it seemed to appear within your portfolio. Can you just help us understand?

[91] **Ken Skates:** Yes. Broadcasting is with my colleague and the media industry as an economic entity is with me.

[92] **Lee Waters:** Right, so the forum—would that be with you, or would that be with the other Minister?

[93] **Ken Skates:** That would still be with me.

[94] **Lee Waters:** Okay.

[95] **Ken Skates:** But I wouldn't be averse to my ministerial colleague sharing that forum. I think it would probably be of incredible value to him.

[96] **Lee Waters:** Okay. So, can you tell us what your plans are for the forum, in that case?

[97] **Ken Skates:** Well, at the moment we're looking at some pieces of work, but we've not finalised the work programme for the forum. But, if I may, I'll just give an indication of where I do have concerns and where the forum could look at carrying out some inquiries. One concerns the print media in Wales and the continuing democratic deficit that we talked about relentlessly in a previous Assembly term.

[98] **Lee Waters:** Thank you.

[99] **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay. That's interesting, because obviously we'll have Alun Davies in afterwards, so should we be directing questions in future to you with regard to purely the forum, and then other questions in relation to

the media to him? Because he made the statement on it, I think we just need to be clear exactly who and where the demarcations lie.

[100] **Ken Skates:** I'll clarify with him who should take questions on this, but it's my view that, given his role in broadcasting, he clearly has an interest in the media as well at large. So, I think it is important that the media forum is something that we can both contribute to and take from.

[101] **Bethan Jenkins:** And will there be—? Have you determined who's on it, the terms of reference and how people can engage with it?

[102] **Ken Skates:** I think it may be worth me producing a briefing note on where we're up to on this, and the forward work plan as well.

[103] **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay, thank you. If there's anything we haven't raised today, if you would be okay with this, would it be possible for us to write to you and then have those questions back?

[104] **Ken Skates:** Absolutely.

[105] **Bethan Jenkins:** Because, obviously, we physically couldn't cover everything in the time that we had.

[106] **Ken Skates:** I'm sorry I talked a little too much.

[107] **Bethan Jenkins:** Well, you know, you have to talk to answer the questions, it's just we didn't have enough time to ask them all. So, thank you very much. Diolch yn fawr.

[108] **Ken Skates:** Diolch yn fawr **Ken Skates:** Thank you very much. iawn.

[109] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym ni'n **Bethan Jenkins:** We're now going to cael brêc byr o 15 munud ac wedyn have a short break of about 15 byddwn ni nôl. minutes and then we'll be back.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:32 a 10:50.
The meeting adjourned between 10:32 and 10:50.*

Bil Cymru: Tystiolaeth gan Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg
Wales Bill: Evidence from the Office of the Welsh Language
Commissioner

[110] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Eitem 5 ar yr agenda yw Bil Cymru a thystiolaeth gan swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg. Pwrpas y sesiwn benodol yma yw cymryd tystiolaeth gan swyddfa'r comisiynydd ynglŷn ag effeithiau posib y Bil Cymru arfaethedig ar y Gymraeg. Nid yw'r comisiynydd ei hun ar gael i ddod i drafod y Bil gyda'r pwyllgor oherwydd ymrwymadau blaenorol. Rydym yn nodi bod hynny'n siomedig, ond mae dau o swyddogion y comisiynydd yma i ateb eich cwestiynau. Ac mae llythyr y comisiynydd at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn y papurau cyhoeddus fel papur i'w nodi. Mae yna hefyd fwy o ymchwil sydd wedi cael ei roi i Aelodau Cynulliad.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. Item 5 on the agenda is the Wales Bill and evidence from the Welsh Language Commissioner's office. The purpose of this specific session is to hear evidence from the Welsh Language Commissioner's office on the possible impact of the Wales Bill on the Welsh language. The commissioner herself was not available to come to discuss the Bill with the committee due to previous commitments. We do note that that is disappointing, but two of the commissioner's officials are here to answer your questions. And the commissioner's letter to the Secretary of State is in the public papers as a paper to note. There has also been further research that has been given to Assembly Members.

[111] Mae Dyfan Sion, cyfarwyddwr polisi ac ymchwil yma, a hefyd Huw Gapper, sydd yn uwch-swyddog polisi ac ymchwil. Croeso i chi yma heddiw. Os ydych chi eisiau dweud rhywbeth yn fras, byddai hynny'n grêt, ac wedyn gall Aelodau Cynulliad ofyn cwestiynau wedi'u seilio ar hynny. Rwy'n credu mai'r pwynt mwyaf pwysig i ni yw: a ydych chi wedi cael ymateb gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i lythyr y comisiynydd, er mwyn i ni ddeall yn iawn beth yw'r hyn sydd yn digwydd

Dyfan Sion, the director of policy and research is here, and also Huw Gapper, who is senior policy and research officer. Welcome today. If you would like to speak at the outset, broadly, that would be great, and then Assembly Members can ask questions based on that. I think that the most important point for us is whether you've received a response from the Secretary of State to the commissioner's letter, in order that we can understand fully what is happening at present. Thank you.

ar hyn o bryd? Diolch.

[112] **Mr Sion:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. Rydym wedi cael ymateb; fe wnawn ni gyfeirio at hynny yn y man. Diolch am y gwahoddiad, yn y lle cyntaf, i drafod â chi heddiw.

Mr Sion: Okay, thank you very much. We have received a response and we will refer to that a little later. First of all, thank you for the invitation to discuss this issue with you this morning.

[113] O ran Bil Cymru ei hun, rwy'n meddwl ei bod yn deg dweud bod gennym ni ddau brif bryder, ac fe wnawn ni sôn am hynny yn y man. Ond, efallai, jest i roi rhywfaint o gyd-destun i chi fel pwyllgor yn y lle cyntaf, fel y gwyddoch chi, mae yna dair cyfundrefn dyletswyddau iaith yn bodoli yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Yn gyntaf, cynlluniau iaith o dan Ddeddf 1993, safonau'r Gymraeg hefyd o dan Fesur 2011, a hefyd yn y Cynulliad mae yna Ddeddf ieithoedd swyddogol a chynllun iaith yn deillio o hwnnw.

In terms of the Wales Bill itself, I think it's fair to say that we have two main concerns, and we will discuss that in due time. But if I could just give you some context in the first place. As you know, there are three language duty regimes in existence in Wales at the moment. First of all, the language schemes under the 1993 Act, then there are the standards under the 2011 Measure and also in the Assembly there is an official language Act and a scheme emerging from that.

[114] Fel y gwyddoch chi, mae safonau'n raddol cymryd drosodd oddi wrth gynlluniau iaith, felly mae'r cynlluniau iaith yn cael eu disodli yn raddol. Erbyn hyn, mae yna 60 o sefydliadau yn ddarostyngedig i'r safonau. Ond, o dan y Mesur, ni allwn osod safonau ar Weinidogion y Goron heb gydsyniad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Nid yw'r cydsyniad hwnnw wedi'i roi eto. Cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cymru o dan y Mesur ydy gofyn am y cydsyniad hwnnw. Mae'n deg dweud, rwy'n meddwl, o ran y trafodaethau sydd wedi bod, ei

As you know, standards are gradually taking over from language schemes, so language schemes are being gradually replaced. We now have 60 organisations that are subject to standards. But, under the Measure, we cannot impose standards on Ministers of the Crown without the Secretary of State's consent. That consent has not yet been given. It's the responsibility of the Welsh Government under the Measure to ask for that consent. I think it is fair to say, I think, in terms of the discussions that have taken place,

bod hi'n annhebygol y cawn ni gydsyniad, yn sicr yn y tymor byr.

that it is unlikely that we will receive consent in the short term.

[115] Wedi dweud hynny, er na allwn ni osod safonau ar Weinidogion y Goron, rydym yn gallu gosod safonau ar rai adrannau Llywodraeth San Steffan a hefyd ar gyrff sydd ddim wedi'u datganoli. Felly, er enghraifft, o dan y gyfundrefn bresennol, rydym ni yn gallu gweithio efo gyrff fel y BBC ac Ofcom, ac rydym yn y broses o weithio gyda nhw ar safonau'r Gymraeg. Rydym hefyd wedi dechrau gweithio efo gyrff fel Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi a Chynilion a Buddsoddiadau Cenedlaethol. Felly, mae yna rai gyrff San Steffan yr ydym yn gallu gweithio gyda nhw o dan y gyfundrefn bresennol.

Having said that, although we cannot impose standards on Ministers of the Crown, we can impose standards on certain departments of the Westminster Government and also on some non-devolved bodies. So, for example, under the current regime, we can work with organisations such as the BBC and Ofcom, and we are in the process of working with them on Welsh language standards. We have also started to work with bodies such as Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs and National Savings and Investments. So, there are certain organisation in Westminster that we can work with under the current regime.

[116] Gan gofio hynny i gyd, i droi at Fil Cymru, fel y dywedais i, dau brif bryder sydd gennym ni. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r gyfundrefn yna. Rydym wedi cael cadarnhad gan Swyddfa Cymru na fydd y Bil yn effeithio ar ddarpariaeth Mesur y Gymraeg fel mae o ar hyn o bryd, ond mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dechrau sôn am ddiwygio Mesur y Gymraeg. Felly, mae yna gwestiwn yn codi wedyn: pe bai hynny'n digwydd, a fydd angen cydsyniad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar gyfer ystod ehangach o gyrff?

Bearing that in mind, turning to the Wales Bill, as I said, there are two main concerns that we have. The first relates to that regime. We have received confirmation from the Wales Office that the Bill will not impact upon the provision of the Welsh language Measure as it currently stands, but the Welsh Government has started to talk about amending the Welsh language Measure. Therefore, the question arises: if that were to happen, would we need the consent of the Secretary of State for a broader range of organisations?

[117] Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond Gweinidogion y Goron y mae angen cydsyniad ar eu cyfer nhw. Mae yna

At the moment, it's only Ministers of the Crown that we need consent for. I think there is a risk, if the Welsh

risg, rwy'n credu, pe bai Mesur y Gymraeg yn cael ei ddiwygio ac o dan Fil Cymru, y byddai angen cydsyniad wedyn ar gyfer cyrff sydd heb eu datganoli, felly ystod ehangach o gyrff. Gwnawn ni drafod hynny ymhellach yn y man.

language Measure were to be amended, that we would need consent under the Wales Bill for non-devolved bodies, so that would be a broader range of organisations and bodies. We can discuss that further later this morning.

[118] Mae'r ail brif bryder sydd gennym ni wedyn yn ymwneud ag argymhellion comisiwn Silk. Fel y gwyddoch chi, fe gyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad yna a oedd yn delio â phob math o faterion cyfansoddiadol. Ond, fel rhan o'r argymhellion hefyd, mi oedd yna nifer o bethau a oedd yn delio â'r Gymraeg. Mae gennym ni bryder nad ydy rhai o'r pethau hynny wedi cael eu hystyried o fewn Bil Cymru fel y mae o wedi ei lunio ar hyn o bryd.

The second main concern we have relates to the recommendations of the Silk commission. As you know, that report was published and it dealt with all sorts of constitutional issues. But, as part of the recommendations, there were a number of issues related to the Welsh language. We do have some concerns that some of those issues haven't been taken into account within the Wales Bill as it's currently drafted.

[119] Felly, dyna i chi grynodedb, cyd-destun, ar y cychwyn, ac fel y dywedais i rydym ni'n hapus iawn i drafod y pwyntiau yna'n benodol efo'r pwyllgor.

So, that's a summary to give you some context at the outset, and, as I said, we are happy to discuss those specific points with the committee.

[120] **Bethan Jenkins:** Nid wyf i'n siŵr os wnes i glywed beth oedd ymateb yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol.

Bethan Jenkins: I'm not sure if I heard what the response of the Secretary of State was.

[121] **Mr Sion:** Rydym ni wedi derbyn ymateb gan Swyddfa Cymru erbyn hyn. Huw, a wyt ti eisiau cyfeirio at hynny?

Mr Sion: We've received a response from the Wales Office. Huw, do you want to refer to that?

[122] **Mr Gapper:** Fe wnaethom ni ohebu â Swyddfa Cymru ynglŷn â'r ddau brif bryder. Mae'r ymateb rydym ni wedi ei gael yn gosod allan

Mr Gapper: We did have some correspondence with the Wales Office on our two main concerns. The response that we've received sets out

safbwynt clir na fydd Bil Cymru'n effeithio mewn unrhyw ffordd ar weithrediad Mesur y Gymraeg. Felly, mi fydd y Cynulliad yn medru parhau i basio rheoliadau yn unol â Mesur y Gymraeg yn sgil pasio Bil Cymru, heb unrhyw effaith ar y rheoliadau hynny. Felly, mae hynny'n beth cadarnhaol, ein bod ni wedi cael cadarnhad pendant am hynny.

a clear view that the Wales Bill will not impact in any way on the implementation of the Welsh language Measure. Therefore, the Assembly will continue to pass regulations in accordance with the Welsh language Measure as a result of the passing of the Wales Bill without it having any impact on those regulations. So, that's very positive, that we have been given confirmation of that.

[123] O ran yr ail bryder am y dyfodol, pe bai'r Cynulliad eisiau deddfu yn y dyfodol, yna safbwynt Swyddfa Cymru ydy: felly mae'n rhaid bod. Ydy, mae Bil Cymru yn mynd i gyfyngu ar bwerau'r Cynulliad i ddeddfu ar gyfer y Gymraeg, ond felly mae'n rhaid bod er mwyn cael y ffin eglur yma rhwng awdurdodau Cymreig ac awdurdodau sydd heb eu datganoli.

In terms of the second concern for the future and if the Assembly were to legislate in the future, then the view of the Wales Office is: it must be so. Yes, the Wales Bill may limit the powers of the Assembly to legislate on the Welsh language, but it must be so in order to have this clear boundary between Welsh authorities and non-devolved authorities.

[124] **Bethan Jenkins:** So, os bydd yna newid yn y dyfodol, byddai yna oblygiad wedyn i gael cydsyniad Llywodraeth Prydain ar hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: So, if there is some sort of change in the future, there would be an implication therefore in terms of getting the consent of the British Government on that.

[125] **Mr Gapper:** Byddai, fel roedd Dyfan yn dweud—

Mr Gapper: Yes, as Dyfan said—

[126] **Bethan Jenkins:** Unrhyw beth sydd allan o fframwaith y Cynulliad.

Bethan Jenkins: That would be anything outside the Assembly's framework.

[127] **Mr Gapper:** Mae'n bwysig nodi, rwy'n meddwl, fod hynny'n cynnwys sefydliadau heb eu datganoli sy'n

Mr Gapper: I think it's important to note that that includes non-devolved organisations and they provide

cynnig gwasanaethau y mae'n rhaid i bobl Cymru eu defnyddio bob dydd. Os ydych chi eisiau trwydded yrru neu drwydded deledu, neu os ydych chi eisiau teithio dramor a chael pasbort, mae'r rhain yn wasanaethau y mae'n rhaid i bobl Cymru eu defnyddio bob dydd a byddai'r Cynulliad yn methu ymdrin â'r pethau hynny mewn deddfwriaeth heb gydsyniad Gweinidog perthnasol y Deyrnas Unedig.

[128] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy Miles, a oedd gennyti ti gwestiwn?

[129] **Jeremy Miles:** Oedd, diolch. Jyst fel fy mod i'n deall yn glir beth yw'r sefyllfa bresennol, yn y llythyr oddi wrth y comisiynydd at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, roedd pryder ynglŷn ag a fyddai'r Bil fel y mae e ar y foment yn cyfyngu ar allu'r comisiynydd yn y dyfodol i barhau i wneud y math o bethau mae'r comisiynydd yn gallu eu gwneud nawr. A ydych chi'n dweud bod yr ymateb wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol wedi cadarnhau, i'ch pwrpas chi, nad yw hynny bellach yn bryder?

[130] **Mr Sion:** Rwy'n meddwl roedd yna ddau bryder ynghlwm â hynny. Yn y lle cyntaf, a fyddai Bil Cymru yn cyfyngu ar beth rydym ni'n gallu ei wneud rŵan o dan Fesur y Gymraeg? Mae ymateb Swyddfa Cymru wedi cadarnhau na fyddai Bil Cymru yn effeithio ar ein gallu ni i weithredu Mesur y Gymraeg. Felly, mae hynny'n gadarnhaol.

services that the people of Wales have to use every day. If you want a driver's licence or tv licence, or if you want to travel abroad and get a passport, these are all services that the people of Wales have to use on a daily basis, and the Assembly wouldn't be able to deal with those issues in legislation without the consent of the relevant Minister in the UK Government.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy Miles, I think you had a question.

Jeremy Miles: Yes, thank you. Now, just so that I understand clearly what the current situation is, in the letter from the commissioner to the Secretary of State, there was concern about whether the Bill as it stands would limit the ability of the commissioner in future to continue to do the kinds of things that the commissioner can do at present. Are you saying that the response from the Secretary of State has confirmed, as far as you're concerned, that that is no longer a concern for you?

Mr Sion: I think that there were two concerns there. In the first place, would the Wales Bill restrict what we're able to do now under the Welsh language Measure? The response of the Wales Office has confirmed that the Wales Bill would not impact on our powers to implement the Welsh language Measure. So, that's positive.

[131] Yr ail fater wedyn oedd, fel y dywedom ni: mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn dechrau trafod diwygio Mesur y Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd, a beth fyddai'r sefyllfa pe bai hynny'n digwydd. Mae'r pryder yna'n parhau, achos, fel y dywedais i, ar hyn o bryd, o dan Fesur y Gymraeg, yr unig sefydliadau y mae'n rhaid i ni gael cydsyniad ganddyn nhw cyn gosod dyletswydd arnyn nhw ydy Gweinidogion y Goron. Pe bai'r Mesur yn cael ei ddiwygio, mae'n bosibl y byddai'r cydsyniad yna'n cael ei ehangu i gynnwys pob math o gyrff sydd ddim wedi cael eu datganoli. Felly, mae yna risg yn fanna, rydym ni'n credu, y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar ein gallu ni—gallu'r Cynulliad i roi dyletswyddau newydd, wedyn, ar rai o'r gyrff yma.

11:00

[132] Rhywbeth pwysig arall i'w nodi, fel y dywedodd Huw, yw mai'r egwyddor i ni, rwy'n credu, yw'r gwasanaeth y mae pobl yng Nghymru yn gallu ei gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, pwy bynnag sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth yna. Felly, dyna sydd y tu ôl i'n pryderon ni, mewn gwirionedd, pe bai Mesur y Gymraeg yn cael ei ddiwygio.

[133] **Jeremy Miles:** Ond, mae gennych bryder mewn egwyddor ar hyn o bryd, achos nid yw'n glir beth yw'r newidiadau a fydd yn cael eu

The second issue then was, as we said: the Welsh Government is now considering amending the Welsh language Measure, and what the situation would be if that were to happen. That concern remains, because, as I said, at the moment, under the Welsh language Measure, the only organisations we need consent for before we place responsibilities upon them are Ministers of the Crown. If the Measure were to be amended, that consent might be expanded to include all sorts of other organisations that are non-devolved. So, there is a risk there, we believe, that that could impact on our ability and the Assembly's ability to impose new functions and responsibilities on some of these bodies and organisations.

Another important thing to note, as Huw said, is that I think that the principle for us is the service that the people of Wales can access through the medium of Welsh, whoever provides that service. So, that's what underpins our concerns, if there were to be some amendment to the Welsh language Measure.

Jeremy Miles: But, you've got a concern in principle, therefore, at the moment as it's not clear what changes are going to be made to the

cynnig i'r Mesur. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, pryder cyffredinol sydd gennych chi ynglŷn â hynny, yn hytrach na rhywbeth penodol. A oes gennych chi enghraifft o rywbeth y byddech chi'n dymuno ei wneud, er enghraifft, o dan Ddeddf sydd wedi ei diwygio na fydddech chi'n gallu ei wneud oherwydd y gyfundrefn?

[134] **Mr Sion:** Rwy'n derbyn y pwynt yna, mai pryder mewn egwyddor ydy o, pe bai Mesur y Gymraeg yn cael ei ddiwygio, ond mae'n deg, rwy'n meddwl, inni dynnu sylw at y risg yna ar y pwynt yma.

[1] ran beth fyddem ni'n ei wneud, ar hyn o bryd, rydym yn gweithio efo nifer o gyrff sydd ddim wedi cael eu datganoli. Mae'n bosib y bydd cyrff newydd yn cael eu sefydlu yn y dyfodol, ac mae'n bosib na fyddwn ni'n gallu gweithio efo nhw i'r un graddau. Mae'n bosib hefyd, wrth i'r broses esblygu, y byddai'n ddymunol gosod dyletswyddau newydd ar rai o'r cyrff yma hefyd, ac eto mae'n bosib na fyddwn ni'n gallu gwneud hynny o dan y gyfundrefn yma.

[135] **Jeremy Miles:** A gaf i ofyn un cwestiwn arall? Yn y Bil fel y mae e nawr, mae gwahaniaethu rhwng y math o gytundeb sydd ei angen gan Weinidog y Goron ar gyfer materion sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg a materion eraill. Hynny yw, mae gofyniad i gael cytundeb ar gyfer newidiadau ar sail y Gymraeg ond

Measure. So, at present, you've got a general concern in relation to that, rather than something specific. Do you have an example of something you'd like to do, for example, under an amended Act that wouldn't be possible because of the system?

Mr Sion: I accept that point that it is a concern in principle, if the Welsh language Measure were to be amended, but I do think that it's fair that we do highlight that risk at this point.

In terms of what we would do, well, at the moment, we are working with a number of non-devolved bodies. It's possible that new bodies may be established in the future and it may be possible that we won't be able to work with them to the same extent. It's also possible that, as the process evolves, it may be desirable to place new functions on some of these bodies, and it's possible that that wouldn't be possible under this regime.

Jeremy Miles: May I ask another question? In the Bill as it stands, there is a differentiation between the kind of consent that's needed from a Minister of the Crown for matters that relate to the Welsh language and other matters. That is, there is a requirement to gain consent for changes in relation to the Welsh

jest ymgynghori ynglŷn â newidiadau eraill. A oes gennych chi gonsyrn am hynny?

language, but just to consult on other changes or modifications. Do you have any concerns about that?

[136] **Mr Sion:** Rwy'n meddwl mai ein prif bryder ni yn fanna ydy ein bod ni'n dymuno cael cysondeb i bobl yng Nghymru, yn y bôn, a dyna sydd wrth wraidd y drefn safonau yn y lle cyntaf: ymgais i gael gwell cysondeb o ran gwasanaethau Cymraeg. Y risg—ac rwy'n derbyn mai risg ydy o—ydy bod y cysondeb yna ddim yn digwydd, a bod yna ddwy drefn yn parhau, sef trefn safonau y Gymraeg ar gyfer cyrff yng Nghymru a threfn arall—cynlluniau iaith o bosib—ar gyfer cyrff Prydeinig. Felly, dyna'r consyrn yn fanna.

Mr Sion: I think our major concern there is that we wish to see consistency for the people of Wales, essentially, and that's what's at the heart of the standards regime: it's an attempt to provide greater consistency in terms of Welsh language services. The risk is—and I do accept that it is only a risk at the moment—that that consistency can't be achieved, that there are two different regimes in place, namely the Welsh language standards regime for bodies in Wales and another regime, possibly involving Welsh language schemes, for UK bodies. That's the concern there.

[137] **Bethan Jenkins:** Iawn? Dai Lloyd.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay? Dai Lloyd.

[138] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr, a diolch yn fawr am y cyflwyniadau y bore yma. Jest i'ch gwthio chi ychydig bach yn bellach, efallai, achos mae gan nifer ohonom ni bryderon mawr ynglŷn â Bil Cymru a'r perygl yma o rwyfo pethau yn ôl i Lundain sydd eisoes wedi eu datganoli i'r lle hwn; dyna le rydym ni'n dod ohono fe. Yn benodol, felly, roeddech yn sôn y bydd beth bynnag sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd o dan Fesur y Gymraeg yn parhau, ond roeddech hefyd yn dweud eich bod chi'n cydweithio ar hyn o bryd efo cyrff sydd heb eu datganoli yma, a bod pethau yn

Dai Lloyd: Thank you very much, and thank you for what you've already said this morning. I want to push you a little further this morning, because a number of us have concerns about the Wales Bill and this danger of things being rolled back to London that have already been devolved to this place; that's where we're coming from, as it were. So, specifically, you were saying that whatever currently happens under the Welsh language Measure as it stands will continue, but you also said that you currently work with non-devolved bodies and that things are going well. So, the

mynd yn iawn. A ydych chi—a dyma'r cwestiwn cyntaf—yn rhagweld sefyllfa yn y dyfodol, wedi i Fil Cymru ddod i mewn, lle y bydd y sefyllfa yna yn newid mewn rhyw ffordd a bydd yn rhaid ichi gael cytundeb newydd lle nawr nid oes angen cytundeb arnoch chi? Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Nid ydym yn sôn am risg nawr; rydym yn sôn am beth yw realiti'r sefyllfa, achos, yn ôl sawl darlleniad o'r Bil Cymru yma, yn enwedig yn y rhan sydd â'r prawf ar 'ymwneud â', '*relates to*', fedrwn chi ddiffinio hynny mor gadarn neu mor llac ag yr ydych eisiau. Gan gofio nad yw San Steffan yn caniatáu defnydd o'r Gymraeg o gwbl lawr ar ben yna'r M4, mae rhai ohonom yn naturiol yn pryderu, ddywedwn ni, fel y buasai'r paragraffau sy'n 'ymwneud â' yn cael eu diffinio—efallai yn fwy cadarn gan rai ac y byddai rhai eraill yn eu diffinio nhw'n fwy llac, efallai. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn bryder real, nid jest yn fater o risg, ac efallai buaswn yn licio'ch sylwadau chi ar hynny.

[139] Y cwestiwn nesaf ydy: rydych wedi derbyn llythyr yn ôl oddi wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ac mae'n tueddu hefyd i ddweud bod yna elfen, efallai, o golli pwerau, neu risg o golli pwerau; beth y mae'r comisiynydd yn mynd i wneud ynglŷn â hyn? Dyna'r cwestiwn sy'n dod o hynny. Hynny yw, a ydym jest yn derbyn y sefyllfa yna, neu fe aiff popeth yn hynod wleidyddol? Os oes rhai pleidiau yn mynd i wneud sŵn ynglŷn â hyn, byddwn yn cael ein

first question is: do you foresee a situation in the future, after the Wales Bill is enacted, where that situation will change in some way and that you would need to have new consents where you now don't need consent? That is an important point. So, we're not talking about a risk there; we're talking about the reality of the situation, because, according to several readings of this Wales Bill, particularly the part on the 'relates to' test, you can define that as strongly or as loosely as you would like. Bearing in mind, of course, that Westminster does not allow any use of the Welsh language down that end of the M4, some of us, quite naturally, are concerned about how the paragraphs on 'relates to' will be defined—perhaps it would be a more robust definition, whereas others would place a looser definition upon it. So, I think that's a real concern, and we're not just talking about risk here. So, I would like your comments on that, perhaps.

The next question is: you said that you have received a response from the Secretary of State, and that that also tends to say that there may be an element, or a risk, of losing powers; so, what is the commissioner going to do about this? That's the question that arises. Do we just accept the situation, because there's a danger that things might get very political? If some parties raised this, we would be accused of being political, but we're trying to be

cyhuddo o fod yn wleidyddol, ond rydym yn ceisio bod yn wrthrychol ynglŷn â hyn ac rydym yn edrych i fudiadau—i bobl fel Comisiynydd y Gymraeg—i fod yn wrthrychol a gwthio yr agenda ymlaen a dweud, 'Nid yw hyn yn iawn; dyma'r pryder gwirioneddol ac mae eisiau gwneud mwy o sŵn amdano fe', fe fuaswn i yn argymhell. Buaswn yn licio eich sylwadau chi ar hynny hefyd.

[140] A'r cwestiwn olaf; fe wnaethoch chi sôn wrth basio am gomisiwn Silk a rhai o'r pethau roedd hwnnw wedi'u cytuno ac wedi'u pasio, ac fe wnaethoch chi efallai awgrymu bod rhai o'r materion hynny hefyd yn fater o bryder at y dyfodol. Fe fuaswn i'n licio pe baech chi'n gallu ehangu ar y pwynt yna hefyd. Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi.

[141] **Mr Sion:** Iawn, diolch. Efallai y gwnaf i ddelio â'r pwyntiau cyntaf ac wedyn fe wnaaf i droi at Huw o ran comisiwn Silk yn benodol. O ran y risg o greu ansicrwydd—rwy'n meddwl mai dyna oedd y cwestiwn cyntaf—o safbwynt gosod dyletswyddau ar y Gymraeg, beth sydd gennym ni ar hyn o bryd ydy trefn sydd yn eglur. Mae'n eglur i ni pa sefydliadau rydym yn gallu gweithio efo nhw o dan y safonau a pha rai nad ydym—pa sefydliadau mae'n rhaid i ni gael cydsyniad ar eu cyfer nhw. Rwy'n meddwl ein bod ni wedi cael trafodaethau gweddol anodd efo un neu ddwy o adrannau San Steffan o amgylch hynny, fel y

objective about this and we look to organisations and bodies such as the Welsh Language Commissioner to be objective and to push the agenda forward and to say, 'This isn't right because there is real concern here and we need to make a louder noise about this', I would suggest. I would like any comments that you have on that.

And now a final question; you mentioned in passing the Silk commission and some of the things that were agreed and passed by it, and you suggested, I believe, that some of those issues were a cause for concern looking forward. So I would like it if you could expand upon that point as well. Thank you very much.

Mr Sion: Thank you. Perhaps I will deal with the first points and then I'll turn to Huw in terms of the Silk commission specifically. In terms of the risk of uncertainty—I think that was your first question—in terms of imposing responsibilities in relation to the Welsh language, we have a system that is clear. It's clear to us who we can work with under standards and who we can't, and which organisations we require consent for. I think that we've had some relatively difficult negotiations with one or two Westminster departments around that issue, as one might expect, but there is clarity in terms of our responsibilities and

byddai rhywun yn ddisgwyl, ond mae yna eglurder o ran ein cyfrifoldebau ni—beth rydym yn gallu ei wneud. Ond rwy'n meddwl ei fod yn bwynt teg, os ydy'r setliad yn newid ac efallai bod y ffordd rydym yn gallu ystyried rhai cyrff yn newid, yna mae'n bosib i hynny gael ei gwestiynu ac mae'n bosib iddo fo arwain at fwy o ansicrwydd maes o law.

[142] O ran yr ail bwynt wedyn, beth rydym ni fel swyddfa'r comisiynydd yn ei wneud os oes yna risg ein bod ni efallai yn colli cyfrifoldeb neu'n colli pwerau, wel, yn amlwg, rydym ni wedi bod yn codi ymwybyddiaeth o hynny. Rydym ni wedi llythyru a chysylltu â Swyddfa Cymru; rydym ni hefyd wedi gwahodd ein hunain i gael trafodaeth â chi heddiw. Felly, mae o'n fater rydym yn ceisio ei godi ar lefel wleidyddol, achos mae hwn yn bwnc llosg gwleidyddol eang iawn, a'r risg efallai ydy bod materion penodol fel y Gymraeg yn cael eu colli yn hynny. Felly, mae yna drafodaethau wedi bod ac yn parhau efo Swyddfa Cymru o ran hynny.

[143] Y pryderon sydd gennym ni ynglŷn â Silk, nid wyf yn gwybod, Huw, os wyt ti eisiau sôn am hynny.

[144] **Mr Gapper:** O ran y pryderon y gwnaethom ni eu cyfleu i'r comisiwn, mae gan y comisiynydd rôl rheoleiddio ac rydym yn derbyn cwynion gan y cyhoedd—rydym yn

what we're able to do. But I do think it's a fair point that if the settlement does change and the way in which we consider some organisations and bodies changes, then that could be questioned and it could actually lead to greater uncertainty in due time.

In terms of the second point, as to what we as the commissioner's office are doing if there is a risk that we are to lose powers or responsibilities, well, clearly, we have been raising awareness of that. We have corresponded with the Wales Office and we've been in touch with them; we have also availed ourselves of the opportunity to have a discussion with you today. So, it's a matter that we are trying to raise at a political level, because this is a political hot potato, and there is a risk that specific issues such as the Welsh language may be lost in the broader discussions. So, discussions have taken place and are ongoing with the Wales Office on that.

On the concerns that we have on Silk, Huw, I don't know if you want to cover that.

Mr Gapper: In terms of the concerns that we conveyed to the commission, the commissioner has a role in regulating and receiving complaints from the public—we have complaints

derbyn cwynion gan rieni sy'n methu cofrestru genedigaethau eu plant yn Gymraeg, gan barau sydd eisiau priodi ond ddim yn medru cofrestru priodasau yn Gymraeg, ac ystod o bethau eraill. Mae'r problemau yn deillio o ddeddfwriaeth San Steffan sy'n rhwystro defnyddio'r Gymraeg, ac sydd hefyd yn tanseilio statws swyddogol y Gymraeg yng Nghymru. Felly, fe wnaethom ni gyfleu hyn i'r comisiwn ac mi wnaeth y comisiwn argymhell y dylid mynd i'r afael â hynny ac y dylid diwygio'r ddeddfwriaeth yma sydd ddim yn caniatáu defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Mi oedd consensws yng nghytundeb Dydd Gŵyl Dewi i fynd â hynny yn ei flaen. Roeddem ni wedi disgwyl felly y byddai Bil Cymru yn ymdrin â hynny. Nid ydyw, a dyna ydy'r pryder.

from parents who can't register their child's birth through the medium of Welsh, people who aren't able to register their marriages through the medium of Welsh, and a range of other issues. These problems arise from Westminster legislation that restricts the use of the Welsh language and also undermines the status of the Welsh language in Wales. So, we set about conveying this to the Silk commission, which then recommended that those issues should be tackled and that there should be a revision of legislation that did not allow the use of the Welsh language. There was consensus in the St David's Day agreement to take that forward. So, we had expected that the Wales Bill would tackle that issue, but it doesn't, and that is the concern.

[145] Rydym ni wedi cael trafodaethau efo Swyddfa Cymru ynglŷn â hynny, a'r ateb ydy eu bod nhw ddim yn gweld Bil Cymru fel y cerbyd priodol ar gyfer ymdrin â hynny, a'u bod nhw yn parhau i ystyried sut arall y gellir ymdrin—. Maen nhw'n derbyn bod angen ei wneud, ond heb gynnig sicrwydd eto sut y byddant yn ei wneud.

We've had discussions with the Wales Office about that, and the response is that they don't see the Wales Bill as the appropriate vehicle for tackling that issue, and that they will continue to look at other means of dealing with it. They do accept that there is a need to do something, but they haven't offered any assurances about how they're going to do that.

[146] **Bethan Jenkins:** A allwch chi esbonio pam nad ydyn nhw yn cytuno mai Bil Cymru yw'r lle i wneud hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Can you explain why they don't agree that the Wales Bill is the appropriate place for doing that?

[147] **Mr Gapper:** Na, nid ydym wedi cael eglurhad ar hynny, dim ond eu bod wedi mynegi eu barn nhw nad

Mr Gapper: No, we haven't received an explanation about that; they've just expressed their view that it's not

trwy Bil Cymru y dylid ei wneud o.

appropriate to do it through the Wales Bill.

[148] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eluned, roeddwn yn gweld eich bod eisiau gofyn cwestiwn.

Bethan Jenkins: Eluned, I saw that you wanted to ask a question.

[149] **Eluned Morgan:** Mae'n ddiddorol achos roedd lot o bobl yn gofyn am newid o'r *conferred model* i'r *reserved model* er mwyn creu sicrwydd bod y ffiniau yn glir. Felly, allwn ni ddim gofyn am y ddau beth. Mae'r llefydd lle oedd y *gaps* yna o'r blaen, nid ydynt yna rhagor, felly yn amlwg mae ein *scope* ni i ddeddfu yn mynd i leihau mewn rhai ardaloedd. Felly, mae'n rhaid i ni fod yn glir, rwy'n meddwl, mai dyna yw *consequence* symud i *reserved model*. Efallai nad ydym yn hapus am hynny, ond rwy'n meddwl mai dyna lle mae'r posibilrwydd am drafodaeth; mae'r ffaith eu bod nhw wedi dweud 'Ocê, ble rŷch chi wedi deddfu, mae rheini'n *exceptions*' ac ati—dyna, rwy'n meddwl, yw'r broblem.

Eluned Morgan: It's interesting because many people were asking for a change from the conferred model to a reserved model so that the boundaries are clear. So, we can't actually have it both ways. Those areas where there were gaps in the past are no longer there, so clearly our scope to legislate is going to be restricted in certain areas. So, I do think that we have to be clear that that is the consequence of moving to a reserved-powers model. We may not be happy with that, but I do think that there is some possibility for discussion and debate; they have said 'Okay, where you have legislated, those are exceptions', and so on—that's the nub of the problem.

[150] Beth nad wyf yn ei ddeall yw: ar hyn o bryd, a oes gyda chi hawl i ddeddfu yn y meysydd yma, neu ai cytundeb sydd gyda chi gyda'r adrannau yma? A ydy hynny'n mynd i newid? A oes gyda chi rhyw fath o eirfa y byddech chi'n licio ei weld yn y Bil? A ydych chi wedi dod lan â geirfa a fyddai'n ffitio i mewn i'r Bil? Yn amlwg, nid yw'r adran *work and pensions* yn mynd i ddweud 'le, fe gewch chi ddeddfu ble bynnag rŷch

What I don't understand is: at present, do you have a right to legislate in this area, or do you have an agreement with these departments? Is that going to change? Do you have some sort of wording that you would like to see inserted in the Bill? Have you come up with anything that could be inserted into the Bill? Clearly, the Department for Work and Pensions isn't going to say 'Yes, you can do

chi'n moyn'; mae'n rhaid iddo fe fod yn glir iawn mai dim ond ynglŷn â'r iaith Gymraeg yw hi. A ydych chi wedi dod lan â'r geirfa yna; a ydych chi wedi rhoi hynny i Swyddfa Cymru?

whatever you want in legislation'; it has to be very clear that it's only in relation to the Welsh language. So, have you come up with that wording and have you presented that to the Wales Office?

Mr Gapper: Os caf ymateb i'r pwynt cyntaf. Nid fy mod i'n anghytuno o gwbl, ond o ran cael y rhaniad yma rhwng awdurdodau Cymreig ac awdurdodau heb eu datganoli—rwy'n dallt hynny—ond pe bai'r Cynulliad yn dymuno gosod swyddogaethau yn ymwneud â'r Gymraeg ar yr awdurdodau yma sydd heb eu datganoli, byddai'r swyddogaethau hynny ond yn weithredol yng Nghymru. Felly, rydym yn sôn am wasanaethau ar gyfer pobl o fewn tiriogaeth Cymru, nid gwneud rhywbeth y tu hwnt i'r ffin. Felly, mae hynny'n rhywbeth i'w ystyried hefyd. O ran yr ail bwynt, wyt ti eisiau dod fewn?

Mr Gapper: Just to respond to that first point. I don't disagree, but in terms of having this division between Welsh authorities and non-devolved authorities—I do understand that—but if the Assembly wished to impose functions in relation to the Welsh language on those non-devolved authorities, those functions would only be in place in Wales. So, we're talking about services for the people within the territory of Wales, not doing something that goes beyond the border. So, that's another issue that needs to be borne in mind, I think. On the second point, I don't know if you want to come in.

[151] **Mr Sion:** O ran cynnig gwelliant penodol, mi gafodd gwelliant ei gynnis i Fil Cymru i ddelio efo'r pwynt rydym yn ei godi heddiw yn y trafodaethau yn San Steffan ar nos Lun. Mi gafodd y gwelliant yna ei wrthod, felly mae yna ymdrechion wedi bod i lunio ffurf o eiriau i ddelio efo'r *issue* yma. Ac i fynd yn ôl hefyd ynglŷn ag adrannau'r Llywodraeth fel cyllid a thollau, ar hyn o bryd, rydym yn gallu gweithio efo nhw o dan safonau, felly mae hynny'n iawn ar hyn o bryd.

Mr Sion: In terms of proposing a specific amendment to the Bill, an amendment was proposed to the Wales Bill to deal with the point that we've raised today and that was done in Westminster on Monday evening. That amendment was rejected, so efforts have been made to come up with a form of words that would deal with this problem. And to return to your point on departments of Government such as HMRC, we are currently able to work with them under standards, and that works.

[152] **Eluned Morgan:** Hawl neu'n gytundeb?

Eluned Morgan: Is that a right or an agreement?

[153] **Mr Sion:** Mae hynny'n hawl. Rydym yn gallu gweithio efo nhw. Y cyrff fyddai'n rhaid i ni gael cytundeb neu gydsyniad â nhw yw Gweinidogion y Goron, felly adrannau Whitehall ei hunan, ac nid efallai'r asiantaethau sy'n gysylltiedig ag adrannau Whitehall. Felly, dyna'r *split* ar hyn o bryd. Beth rydym ni'n poeni amdano yw, os ydy Bil Cymru'n dod i rym, ac os ydy Mesur y Gymraeg yn cael ei ddiwygio, bydd yna fwy o sefydliadau rydym yn methu â gweithio efo nhw. Hynny ydy, bydd adrannau Whitehall, ond hefyd bydd yr asiantaethau cysylltiedig yma hefyd; bydd rhaid i ni weithio trwy gytundeb wedyn, yn hytrach na bod gennym ni hawl. Felly, dyna rydym yn poeni amdano—bod y broses trwy gytundeb yn cael ei ehangu i gynnwys nifer fawr o gyrff.

Mr Sion: That's a right. We do have powers to work with them. The bodies where we would need consent are Ministers of the Crown, and so that includes Whitehall departments themselves, but not the agencies related to those departments. So, that's where the division lies at the moment. What we're concerned about is that, if the Wales Bill were to be enacted, and if the Welsh language Measure were to be amended, then there would be more bodies that we're unable to work with. That is, Whitehall would be included, but there would also be the related agencies where we would have to work via an agreement rather than us having the power to do that. So, that's what we're concerned about—that the process via agreement is being enhanced and expanded to include more bodies.

[154] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydych chi wedi cymryd rhyw fath o gyngor cyfreithiol annibynnol ar hyn eich hunain? Yn ôl beth rwy'n ei deall—dywedwch os rwy'n anghywir—mae rhyw fath o syniad gyda chi mai gwaethygu y bydd pethau pe byddai Mesur y Gymraeg yn newid. A yw hynny'n iawn i ddweud? Onid allai'r sefyllfa wella, neu a ydw i'n hollol anghywir? Jest i fod, efallai, yn fwy positif am y peth; a ydy hi'n naturiol yn mynd i waethygu oherwydd hyn?

Bethan Jenkins: Have you taken some sort of independent legal advice on this issue for yourselves? According to my understanding—and you can correct me if I'm wrong—you have some kind of idea that the situation would deteriorate if the Welsh language Measure were to be amended. But, would it be possible to say that the situation could improve, or am I completely wrong in that assumption? I just want to see whether we can be more positive about this; is it inevitably going to

deteriorate because of this?

[155] **Mr Sion:** Rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi'n bwysig i ni egluro bod ein pryder ni ynglŷn â phwynt penodol iawn yn y fan hon, sef ein gallu ni i weithio gyda nifer penodol o gyrff—hynny ydy, bod y broses trwy gytundeb yn ehangu o fod yn Weinidogion y Goron yn unig, i fod yn Weinidogion y Goron ac adrannau eraill yn San Steffan, ac efallai cyrff eraill sydd ddim wedi'u datganoli. Felly, dyna ydy'r pryder penodol. O ran Mesur y Gymraeg yn y dyfodol, neu ddiwygio materion eraill, mae posibilrwydd y gallai pethau wella a datblygu. Nid dyna'r mater rydym yn pryderu amdano mewn ffordd, just yr *issue* penodol yma.

Mr: Sion: I think it's important that we explain that our concern is on a very specific point here, namely our ability to work with specific bodies—that is, that the process of agreement, where in the past it has only related to Ministers of the Crown, will now relate to Ministers of the Crown and other departments in Westminster, and other non-devolved bodies. So, that's the specific concern that we have. In terms of the Welsh language Measure and any possible amendments, then there are possibilities that the situation could improve and develop, but that's not the issue that we're currently concerned about; it's the very specific issue that we're discussing this morning.

[156] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes yna gwestiynau eraill gan Aelodau? Wrth gwrs, fel roedd Dai Lloyd yn dweud yn gynharach, mae'n bwysig eich bod wedi dod yma, a diolch am hynny, ond a oes yna argymhellion sut wedyn y gallwn ni fel pwyllgor gymryd hwn gerbron y sefyllfa—y ffaith bod Tŷ'r Arglwyddi yn edrych ar hyn ar hyn o bryd? Sut ydych yn meddwl y byddai'r pwyllgor yn gallu helpu yn hynny o beth?

Bethan Jenkins: Do Members have any other questions? Of course, as Dai Lloyd said earlier, it's important that you've come here, and thank you for that, but are there any recommendations that you'd like to make in terms of how we as a committee could take this forward? The House of Lords is looking at this now. How do you think the committee could assist in that regard?

11:15

[157] **Mr Sion:** Diolch am y cynnig yna. Rwy'n meddwl ei bod yn bwysig bod nifer o leisiau'n codi'r pwynt

Mr Sion: Thank you for that offer. What I'd say is that it's important that a number of voices raise this issue. If

yma. Os ydych chi fel pwyllgor yn cytuno bod hwn efallai'n bryder ac yn risg i'r dyfodol, yna os oes yna rhywbeth fel pwyllgor y gallwch chi ei wneud i ysgrifennu at Swyddfa Cymru, neu os oes yna drefniadau eraill o fewn y Cynulliad drwy'r pwyllgor materion cyfansoddiadol, yna'n sicr byddem yn gwerthfawrogi hynny. Rwy'n meddwl ei bod yn bwysig bod ymdrech yn cael ei wneud i godi'r mater yma oherwydd, fel y dywedais gynau, mae trafodaethau Bil Cymru mor eang, y risg ydy bod materion penodol yn cael eu colli yng nghanol hynny. Felly, os oes rhywbeth y gallwch chi ei wneud fel pwyllgor i dynnu sylw'n ychwanegol, i ychwanegu'ch llais chi at hynny, yna byddem yn gwerthfawrogi hynny.

[158] **Mr Gapper:** A gaf i ychwanegu hefyd—? O ran Silk a'r argymhelliad sydd heb ei weithredu drwy Fil Cymru, os oes gennych chi fel pwyllgor bryder ynglŷn â'r pethau hynny hefyd, efallai y byddai'n gyfle i holi sut mae Swyddfa Cymru'n mynd i ymdrin â'r argymhellion hynny.

[159] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê, grêt, diolch yn fawr. Mae hynny'n helpu i fframio'r drafodaeth wedi'r cyfarfod yma. Diolch yn fawr iawn am ddod i mewn heddiw.

[160] Rydym yn mynd i gymryd seibiant ac wedyn byddwn ni nôl i sgrwtineiddio'r Gweinidog nesaf.

you as a committee agree that this may be a cause for concern or a risk in the future, then if there's something that you as a committee can do, such as write to the Wales Office, or if you have other arrangements within the Assembly, for example, involving the CLA committee, then we would certainly welcome that. I think it is important that an attempt is made to raise this matter because the discussions in relation to the Wales Bill are so broad, there's a danger that more particular issues may be left out in that discussion. So if you as a committee could draw further attention and add your voices to that, then that would be very much appreciated.

Mr Gapper: Can I also add—? In terms of the Silk commission recommendations that haven't been enacted through the Wales Bill, if you as a committee were to have concerns about that, then there may be an opportunity for you to ask how the Wales Office is going to deal with those recommendations.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay, thank you very much. That's of great assistance to us in framing our discussions following this meeting. Thank you for joining us this morning.

We're now going to take a break and then we'll return to scrutinise the next Minister who's joining us. Thank

Diolch.

you.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 11:16 a 11:31.
The meeting adjourned between 11:16 and 11:31.*

**Craffu ar waith Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes:
Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Pumed Cynulliad
Scrutiny of the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language:
Priorities for the Fifth Assembly**

[161] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eitem 6 yw craffu ar waith Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes: blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y pumed Cynulliad. Pwrpas y sesiwn hon yw cymryd tystiolaeth gan Weinidog y Gymraeg ar ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y pumed Cynulliad, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi paratoi papur i chi i gyd, fel yr ydych chi wedi gweld. Wrth gwrs, y tystion yw Alun Davies, Aelod Cynulliad, ac wedyn Paul Kindred, sydd yma hefyd, a Bethan Webb. Croeso i chi yma heddiw. Os byddai'n iawn, mae yna themâu gyda ni ac felly rydym ni'n mynd i ofyn cwestiynau ar y themâu, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ateb yn effeithiol ac yn fras i rai o'r cwestiynau. Rwy'n gosod sialens i chi, Weinidog. Os oes dwy funud o gyflwyniad yr hoffech chi ei roi inni, ac wedyn y gallwn i ofyn i Aelodau'r Cynulliad roi cwestiynau ichi. Diolch yn fawr.

Bethan Jenkins: Item 6 is scrutiny of the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language: priorities for the Fifth Assembly. The purpose of this session is to hear evidence from the Minister for the Welsh language on his priorities for the Fifth Assembly. The Minister has prepared a paper for you all, as you've already seen. The witnesses are: Alun Davies AM, and then Paul Kindred, who is also attending, and Bethan Webb. A warm welcome to you here today. Now, if it's alright with you, we do have themes that we want to look at, so we'll be asking questions on those and I hope that the Minister will be able to respond effectively and succinctly to those questions. I'm setting you a challenge, Minister. So, if you'd give us a couple of minutes of introduction at the outset, and then the Assembly Members can come in and put their questions to you.

[162] **Alun Davies:** Diolch yn fawr i chi, Gadeirydd, a diolch i'r pwyllgor am y gwahoddiad i ymuno â chi y bore yma.

Alun Davies: Thank you very much, Chair, and thank you to the committee for the invitation to join you this morning.

[163] Nid wyf eisiau siarad yn hir fel cyflwyniad. Gyda'r ddwy thema, os ydych chi'n licio, yr ydym yn eu trafod y bore yma yn fy mhortffolio i—yr iaith a darlledu—mae gyda ni uchelgais glir, rwy'n credu, ar gyfer y ddau gyfrifoldeb. Bydd y pwyllgor yn ymwybodol ein bod ni wedi lansio strategaeth ac yn ymgynghori ar strategaeth newydd i'r iaith Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Mi wnaethom ni lansio hynny yn ystod yr Eisteddfod, ac rydym ni'n ei drafod ar hyn o bryd gyda phobl ar draws y wlad ac mae hynny yn dod i ben—mae'r broses o drafod yn dod i ben ddiwedd mis Hydref. Ond, wedi dweud hynny, mi fuaswn i'n gwerthfawrogi yn fawr iawn unrhyw sylwadau sydd gan y pwyllgor ac unrhyw waith y buasai'r pwyllgor eisiau ei wneud yn ystod y tymor yma a fydd yn cyfrannu at y gwaith o ymgynghori a'r gwaith o edrych ar y strategaeth ddrafft yr wyf wedi'i chyhoeddi. Felly, buaswn i'n gwerthfawrogi unrhyw sylwadau sydd gan y pwyllgor ar hynny.

[164] Gyda darlledu, ar hyn o bryd rydym yn gwybod bod yna drafodaeth wedi bod am siartr y BBC ac rwy'n credu mai hynny ar hyn o bryd ydy'r flaenoriaeth glir. Rydym ni'n disgwyl gweld y siartr ddrafft yn cael ei chyhoeddi'r wythnos yma. Byddaf i'n cyfarfod â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol mewn pythefnos i drafod hynny a thrafod y flaenoriaeth hynny fel Llywodraeth. Ond eto, mi fuaswn i'n gwerthfawrogi unrhyw waith

I don't want to say too much in terms of an introduction, but with the two themes that we're discussing this morning within my portfolio, namely the Welsh language and broadcasting, I think we have a clear ambition for both of those areas. The committee will be aware that we have launched a strategy and are consulting on the new Welsh-language strategy. We launched that during the National Eisteddfod and we're currently having conversations with people across the country—that process will come to an end at the end of October. But having said that, I would very much appreciate any comments that the committee may have, and any work that the committee may like to do during this term that could contribute to that consultation work and the work of looking at the draft strategy that I have published. So, I would appreciate any comments that the committee may have on that.

In terms of broadcasting, at the moment we know that there has been discussion on the BBC charter and I think that is a clear priority at the moment. We expect to see the draft charter published this week and I will be meeting with the Secretary of State in a fortnight's time to discuss that and to discuss our priorities as a Government. But again, I would appreciate any additional work that the committee could do on this area.

ychwanegol y mae'r pwyllgor yn ei wneud yn y maes yma. Rwy'n gwybod bod y pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith arbennig, roeddwn i'n meddwl—roeddwn i'n aelod o'r pwyllgor ar y pryd—yn ystod y tymor diwethaf, ond yn amlwg mae diddordeb y pwyllgor yn rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei werthfawrogi yn fawr iawn.

I know that the committee has carried out some excellent work in the past, as a member of the committee at that time, during the last Assembly term. But clearly, the committee's interest in this issue is something I appreciate very much.

[165] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwyf jest yn meddwl, fel Cadeirydd, fel cwestiwn cyntaf, os allaf i ofyn—. Rydym ni newydd gael y comisiynydd mewn. A oes gennych chi farn ynglŷn â'r pryderon sydd gyda nhw ynghylch Bil Cymru o ran y gallu i ddeddfu pe byddai'r Bil yn cael ei basio, neu pan fydd y Bil yn cael ei basio?

Bethan Jenkins: As a Chair, may I ask the first question? We've just had the commissioner's office in. Now, do you have a view about the concerns that they've raised about the Wales Bill in terms of the ability to legislate should the Bill be enacted, or rather when the Bill will be enacted?

[166] **Alun Davies:** Bil Cymru?

Alun Davies: The Wales Bill?

[167] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ie.

Bethan Jenkins: Yes.

[168] **Alun Davies:** Nid wyf yn meddwl bod gennym ni yr un pryderon. Yn amlwg, mi fydd y Bil yn gosod sylfaen gwahanol, newydd—gwell, rwy'n meddwl—ar gyfer deddfu yn y lle hwn. Mi fydd hynny hefyd, fel mae eich cynghorydd cyfreithiol yn gwybod yn iawn, yn newid y ffordd rydym yn deddfu a'r cynsail sydd gyda ni i ddeddfu. Ar hyn o bryd, os ydym eisiau dod â chyrff y Goron i mewn i ddeddfwriaeth neu fframwaith statudol ar gyfer y Gymraeg, mae'n rhaid inni gael caniatâd y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan i wneud hynny. Nid wyf yn gweld bod y fath o

Alun Davies: I don't think that we do share the same concerns. Clearly, the Bill will lay a different, new and improved foundation for legislating in this place. As your legal adviser will know full well, that will change the way that we legislate and the basis for our legislating. At the moment, if we do want to bring Crown bodies into legislation or the statutory framework for the Welsh language, then we need the consent of the UK Government to do that. I don't see that the kind of Crown consents included in the Bill, as currently drafted, is going to change that—it's not going to change it in a

Crown consents sydd yn y Bil drafft presennol yn mynd i newid hynny, ac nid yw'n mynd i newid hynny mewn ffordd sydd yn fy mhryderu i'n ormodol.

way that's overly concerning to me, at least.

[169] Mi fuaswn i'n dweud bod gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig gyfrifoldeb ei hunan dros y Gymraeg a gwasanaethau'r cyrff sy'n dod o'r Llywodraeth Prydeinig ac sy'n dod o dan Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig—mae ganddyn nhw gyfrifoldeb eu hunain. Os nad ydyn nhw'n fodlon gweithredu yn y ddwy iaith yng Nghrymu, rwy'n credu y byddai'n rhaid i'r pwyllgor a minnau ofyn rhai cwestiynau iddynt am hynny. Ond rwy'n gweld bod y ddwy Lywodraeth yn gallu parhau i gydweithio er mwyn sicrhau bod cyrff cyhoeddus, chyrff y Goron, lle bynnag y maen nhw, ac o dan ba Lywodraeth maen nhw, yn gweithredu trwy'r ddwy iaith genedlaethol sydd gyda ni.

I would say that that UK Government has its own responsibility for the Welsh language and those services that are provided by the UK Government and under the auspices of the UK Government have their own responsibilities to fulfil. If they are not willing to operate in both languages in Wales, then I do think that the committee and I would have to ask some serious questions of them about that. But I believe that both Governments can continue to collaborate in order to ensure that public bodies and Crown bodies, wherever they are and under whichever Government they operate, operate through the two national languages that we have.

[170] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes gwestiynau gan Aelodau? Rwy'n gweld bod Dai Lloyd eisiau gofyn cwestiwn ac wedyn Jeremy.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. Are there any questions from Members? I see that Dai Lloyd and then Jeremy want to come in.

[171] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr, Weinidog, am eich presenoldeb a hefyd am y papur sydd gerbron. Roeddwn i jyst yn mynd i holi i ddechrau ynglŷn â'r bwriad, sydd i'w groesawu, o gael 1 miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn 2050. Wrth gwrs, mi oedd gyda ni 1 miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg o'r blaen, ond 1900 oedd hynny *or thereabouts*.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you very much, Minister, for your presence and also for the paper that is before us. I just wanted to ask, to begin with, about the intention, which is to be welcomed, to have 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. Of course, we did have 1 million Welsh speakers in the past, but that was back in 1900 or thereabouts.

[172] So, mae wedi cael ei wneud o'r blaen, ond yn benodol felly, gan fod tua 80 y cant o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn mynd trwy gyfundrefn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac rydych yn nodi, wrth gwrs, mai'r cam cyntaf, y cam blaenaf, yn y strategaeth yma ydy trwy gyfundrefn addysg. Yn siarad fel rhywun nawr sydd, er fy swildod naturiol, wedi bod yn ymgyrchu i agor rhagor o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ers rhyw 30 mlynedd bellach yn ardaloedd Abertawe, rwy'n gwybod faint o frwydr gall fod yn lleol ac weithiau yn genedlaethol i ddod dros bob math o rwystredigaethau, fe'i dywedwn ni e fel hynny. Sut ydych chi'n mynd i hybu'r twf aruthrol buaswn i'n ei rhagweld y bydd yn rhaid cymryd lle er mwyn codi'r nifer o siaradwyr Cymraeg i fyny i 1 miliwn?

[173] **Alun Davies:** Rwy'n cydnabod y gwaith y mae'r Aelod wedi'i wneud, er ei swildod naturiol, i hybu'r Gymraeg yn ardal Abertawe. Rwy'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod yna fwy o addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar gael i bobl yn Abertawe ac ym mhob man arall hefyd.

[174] Mae gyda ni'r cynlluniau addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg sy'n dod o gynghorau ac rydym yn disgwyl eu gweld nhw ym mis Rhagfyr eleni. Rwy wedi bod yn ddigon clir, rwy'n meddwl ac rwy'n gobeithio, fy mod i'n disgwyl gweld cynlluniau gan awdurdodau lleol, lle

So, it has been done before, but specifically, given that around 80 per cent of Welsh speakers go through the Welsh-medium education system, you note, of course, that the first step, the major step, in this strategy is to look at the education sector in this area. Now speaking as someone who, despite my natural shyness, has been working to try to open more Welsh-medium schools for some 30 years now in the area of Swansea, I know how much of a battle it can be in terms of local issues and also nationally and the hurdles that need to be overcome, if I can put it in that way. Can you tell me how you are going to promote this enormous growth that I would foresee will have to happen in order to achieve the number of Welsh speakers that you've set of 1 million?

Alun Davies: I do recognise the work that the Member has done, despite his natural shyness, to promote the Welsh language in the Swansea area. I do think that we need to ensure that Welsh-medium education is enhanced in the Swansea area and elsewhere too.

We do have Welsh-medium education plans and we're expecting those from the councils in December this year. I have been sufficiently clear, I think and I hope, that I expect to see plans by local authorities, wherever they are, to increase the provision of Welsh-medium education. We will

bynnag maen nhw, i gynyddu faint o addysg sydd ar gael trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mi fydd gennym gyfle i edrych ar gynlluniau Abertawe a mi fuaswn i'n gobeithio y bydd Abertawe, fel pob rhan arall a phob cyngor arall yng Nghymru, yn sicrhau bod ganddynt y fath o ddarpariaeth sydd yn angenrheidiol arnyn nhw fel cymuned i sicrhau eu bod nhw'n cyrraedd y fath o uchelgais a gweledigaeth rwy'n credu yr ydym yn eu rhannu ar draws y ford yma'r bore yma. Felly, byddaf yn hapus iawn i ddod yn ôl i'r pwyllgor, os yw'r pwyllgor yn dymuno hynny, i drafod y fath o gynlluniau sy'n dod gerbron ym mis Rhagfyr ac ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r rheiny pan ydym yn eu gweld.

[175] **Bethan Jenkins:** Wedyn, ai chi fel Gweinidog bydd yn rheoli hwn neu a fydd yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg—a fyddwch yn gweithio gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg ar hynny?

[176] **Alun Davies:** Rydym ni'n cydweithio ar bob un rhan o'r maes polisi addysg, ond mae gen i'r prif gyfrifoldeb dros hynny—dros addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar bob lefel.

[177] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oedd cwestiwn arall?

[178] **Dai Lloyd:** Nac oes.

[179] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy, a oedd cwestiwn gyda ti?

have an opportunity to look at the plans in Swansea and I very much hope that Swansea, like all other areas and councils in Wales, will ensure that they do have the kind of provision that they as a community need in order to ensure that they achieve the ambitions and vision that I think we all share across the table here this morning. So, I'd be very happy to return to the committee, if the committee wishes, to discuss the kind of plans that are to emerge in December and the Government's response to these when we do see them.

Bethan Jenkins: Then, will it be you as Minister who will manage this or will the education Secretary—will you be working with the education Secretary on that?

Alun Davies: We co-operate on all areas of education policy, but I have the main responsibility for Welsh-medium education at all levels.

Bethan Jenkins: Any further questions, Dai?

Dai Lloyd: No.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy, do you have a question?

[180] **Jeremy Miles:** Mae'ch nod chi yn y strategaeth yn nod uchelgeisiol i gyrraedd 1 miliwn o siaradwyr, wrth gwrs, a bydd angen defnyddio amryw o gamau o ran polisi a champau gweithredol i gyrraedd y nod yna. A oes gyda chi theori am y patrwm o gynnydd iaith dros y cyfnod? Hynny yw, mewn termau syml, a ydy'r cynnydd yn mynd i ddigwydd ar y mwyaf tuag at y diwedd neu yn y canol? Ac, ynghlwm wrth y cwestiwn hynny, beth ŷch chi'n ei feddwl yn nhermau cerrig milltir ar hyd y cyfnod o nawr tan 2050 i fesur cynnydd yn yr iaith?

Jeremy Miles: Your aim in the strategy is an ambitious aim to reach 1 million Welsh speakers, of course, and a number of steps will need to be taken in terms of policy, and action will have to be taken in various ways to reach that aim. Do you have a theory in terms of the pattern for increasing the number of speakers over that period? That is, in simple terms, is the increase to be larger at the end or in the middle? And, linked to that question, what are your thoughts in terms of the milestones during the period from now until 2050 to measure the progress of the Welsh language?

[181] **Alun Davies:** A gaf i ddweud un peth aboutu'r targed? Roedd y targed, wrth gwrs, yn dod o ymrwymiad yn y maniffesto, a phan oeddwn i'n darllen hynny, a phan oeddwn i'n meddwl aboutu fe, ac ar ôl imi gael fy mhenodi, roeddwn i'n meddwl ei bod yn hynod bwysig gosod targed gydag uchelgais, achos rydym ni wedi bod yn defnyddio geiriau gwahanol—rydym ni eisiau gweld yr iaith yn 'llwyddo', 'ffynnu', beth bynnag—ond beth yr ydym ni wedi ei wneud yw rheoli'r sefyllfa fel ag y mae hi, ac nid ydym wedi newid hynny, ac rwy'n credu bod angen newid y ffordd yr ydym ni'n cefnogi'r Gymraeg ac yn hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg. Nid yw hynny yn mynd i ddigwydd oni bai ein bod ni'n gosod targed, ac wedyn gosod targed gydag uchelgais ynddo fe. Nawr, roedd Dai Lloyd yn hollol gywir yn ei ddadansoddiad e:

Alun Davies: May I say one thing about that target? The target, of course, emerged from a manifesto commitment, and when I was thinking about that, and after I had been appointed to post, I thought it was extremely important that we set an ambitious target, because we have been using all sorts of different wordings—we want to see the language 'prosper', and so on and so forth—but what we have done is to manage the situation as it currently exists. We haven't tried to transform it, and I do think we need to change the way that we support and promote the Welsh language. That isn't going to happen unless we set a target, and set an ambitious target. Dai Lloyd was quite right in his analysis: we are looking back at over a century ago to see where we want to get to in 50 years' time, and what I want to do is

rydym ni'n edrych yn ôl, os ych chi'n licio, ganrif, i edrych ar ble yr ydym ni eisiau bod ymhen hanner canrif, a beth rwyf i eisiau ei wneud yw sicrhau ein bod ni'n gosod mewn lle, yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf, gyda'r cynlluniau Cymraeg mewn addysg a fydd yn dod ym mis Rhagfyr, gyda'r strategaeth newydd a fydd yn cael ei chyflwyno o gwmpas Pasg y flwyddyn nesaf, ac wedyn gyda deddfwriaeth newydd mi fyddwn ni'n ystyried y flwyddyn nesaf, cynsail cryf iawn i weld twf yn digwydd dros y blynyddoedd i ddod.

[182] Ond nid yw'n ddigon da i fi fel Gweinidog osod targed am ble yr ydym eisiau bod yn 2050 ac wedyn dweud, 'Reit, rwy'n fodlon dod yn ôl i'r pwyllgor yn 2050 a gadael ichi fy nghwestiynu ar hynny'. Mae'n rhaid bod yna darged i'n cael eu gosod yn ystod y cyfnod, a tharged i ar gyfer yr impact yr ydym ni'n ei gael, a hefyd beth yr ydym ni'n mynd i'w wneud yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf ac yn ystod, dyweder, y pum mlynedd nesaf, y 10 mlynedd nesaf, a hefyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn a'r ddwy flynedd nesaf, achos mae'n bwysig i fi ein bod ni, nid jyst yn gosod strategaeth tymor hir ar gyfer yr iaith, ond hefyd yn gosod ffordd o atebolrwydd Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod ein bod ni'n cadw at y fath o lwybr yr ydym ni wedi ei ddisgrifio. So, mi fyddwch chi'n gweld targedi ac amserlen pan fyddwch yn gweld y strategaeth newydd yn y flwyddyn nesaf.

to ensure that, over the next few years, we put in place, with the Welsh language education plans that will be published in December, and with the new strategy that is to be introduced around Easter next year, and then with new legislation that we will consider next year, a very strong foundation to see growth happening over ensuing years.

But it isn't enough for me as a Minister to set a target for where we want to be in 2050 and then to say, 'Okay, I'm happy to come back to the committee in 2050 and allow you to cross-examine me on that'. We do have to have milestones and targets put in place during that period, and those should be targets for the impact that we're going to have, and also for what are we are going to do over the next few years, and, say, the next five years, the next 10 years, and also for the next year and the next two years, because it's very important to me that not only do we put in place a long-term strategy for the Welsh language, but that we also set out an accountability framework for Government to ensure that we keep to the kind of plan that we have set in place. So, you will see targets and a timetable when you see the new strategy next year.

[183] **Jeremy Miles:** A ydych chi'n sôn am dargeddi yn nhermau rhifau penodol, neu beth sydd gyda chi mewn golwg?

Jeremy Miles: Are you talking about targets in terms of specific numbers, or what do you have in mind?

[184] **Alun Davies:** Rydym ni'n dal yn ymgynghori, felly nid ydym ni wedi dechrau ysgrifennu eto. Yn y lle cyntaf, mi liciwn i weld targedi ac amserlen ar gyfer gosod mewn lle y fath o strategaethau a'r fath o gamau y mae'n rhaid inni eu cymryd ac wedyn edrych ar sut yr ydym ni'n disgwyl gweld hynny'n trosglwyddo'n nifer o siaradwyr. Felly, nid wyf yn credu ei bod yn realistig dweud ein bod ni'n disgwyl gweld cynyddiad oherwydd y strategaeth mewn blwyddyn. Nid wyf yn credu bod hynny'n realistig. Felly, beth rwyf eisiau ei wneud yw gosod mewn lle y camau yr ydym ni'n mynd i'w cymryd, gosod amserlen ar gyfer y camau, ac wedi hynny edrych ar yr impact mae hynny'n ei gael ar y boblogaeth.

Alun Davies: We're still out to consultation, so we haven't started drafting this yet. But, initially, I would like to see targets and a timetable to put in place the kind of strategies and the kind of steps that we need to take, and then look at how we expect to see that being actually turned into Welsh speakers, if you like. So, I don't think it's realistic that we should expect to see an increase because of the strategy in a year's time. I don't think that's realistic. So, what I want to do is to put in place the steps that we are to take and put in place a timetable for that, and then to look at the impact that has on our population.

[185] **Bethan Jenkins:** Roeddech chi'n dweud 'ym mis Rhagfyr', ac wedyn gwnaethoch chi ddweud 'y flwyddyn nesaf'. Pryd y bydd cychwyn wedyn ar y targedau, a'r system fel yr ydych yn ei disgrifio, jyst yn fras?

Bethan Jenkins: You've mentioned 'December' and 'next year'. So, can you tell us when you're going to be starting work on these targets, and the system as you describe it, speaking broadly?

[186] **Alun Davies:** Sori, roeddwn i'n trio gosod y fath o amserlen sydd gyda ni. Rwy'n gallu ysgrifennu atoch chi i egluro hyn.

Alun Davies: Sorry, I was trying to set out the timetable that we have. I can write to you with the details, of course.

[187] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê, grêt. Mae hynny'n ffein.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay, great. That's fine.

[188] **Alun Davies:** Ond, ym mis Rhagfyr, fe fyddwn ni'n cael gan awdurdodau lleol y cynlluniau Cymraeg mewn addysg. Mi fydd yn dod o lywodraeth leol—

Alun Davies: But, in December, we will receive from local authorities the Welsh in education plans, which will be drafted by local authorities—

[189] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae hynny'n wahanol i'r cwestiwn a oedd gan Jeremy, o ran y targedau o ran 1 miliwn o siaradwyr.

Bethan Jenkins: But that's different to the question that Jeremy asked, isn't it, in terms of the targets in terms of 1 million Welsh speakers.

11:45

[190] **Alun Davies:** Wel, mae i gyd yn cyfrannu at ei gilydd, onid ydy? So, mi fydd y strategaeth newydd yn cael ei gyflwyno, rwy'n dweud, o gwmpas y Pasg, ar hyn o bryd, y flwyddyn nesaf. Wedi hynny, yn seiliedig ar y strategaeth, mi fyddwn ni'n edrych ar y fframwaith statudol sydd gyda ni ar hyn o bryd, ac wedyn edrych ar y newidiadau y bydd yn rhaid i ni eu gwneud, neu efallai bydd yn rhaid i ni eu gwneud, i'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol, ac mi fyddwn ni'n ystyried hynny ar ôl i ni osod y strategaeth. So, bydd hynny yn dod.

Alun Davies: Well, it all contributes to the same thing, doesn't it? And, therefore, the new strategy will be issued, I would say, around Easter next year, and then based on that strategy we will look at the statutory framework that we currently have and then look at the changes that we will need to make or we may need to make to current legislation, and we will consider that once we've put a strategy in place. So, that will come.

[191] **Bethan Jenkins:** Oce, grêt. Mae hynny yn glir. Mae Lee Waters yn nesaf, ac wedyn Suzy Davies.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay, that's very clear. Thank you. Lee Waters is next, and then Suzy Davies.

[192] **Lee Waters:** I've got a few questions, if I may, Chair. I'll ask them in turn. The first: Minister, I think you're absolutely right to be ambitious about the language. The hallmark of the debate hitherto has been on the basis of goodwill from all towards the language. Can I just ask you what your vision is? Is it the ambition, over time, that all schools become Welsh-medium schools? And, if that's the case, how do we bring people along with that vision, so that those who feel they need a choice, or should have a choice, in what language they educate their child, can be brought along with that

movement?

[193] **Alun Davies:** I think you're absolutely right about goodwill, and I think we've been able to move the language away from being a political football over the last couple of decades. I think that's a good thing, and I think it's been welcomed right across the country. But it's possible to die of goodwill as well, you know, and what we've got to be able to do is to actually move things forward. Bilingualism has got to be more than Welsh speakers being told to speak English. That means having a vision where the Welsh language is part of our country, our culture, our community, our families, wherever we happen to be, and whether our Welsh extends to little more than the chorus of 'Hen Wlad fy Nhadau' or whether we're able to compete in the National Eisteddfod. We have the same level of ownership, if you like. That means that we need to look at how then we ensure that people have access to the language at an early age to enable them to learn and feel comfortable in the language.

[194] Now, I don't think we're going to move to a situation whereby every single primary and secondary school in the country is going to be teaching through the medium of Welsh. But what I want to see is a situation where Welsh is introduced at an earlier age, and, if you look at the work that Kirsty's doing in terms of the Donaldson process and the creation, if you like, of areas of learning and experience whereby you have a continuum of Welsh-language education from an early age through to age 16, that will, I hope, take us away from the tired old debate that we're having at the moment about Welsh as a second language, and actually enable people to learn Welsh and to learn Welsh to a standard that will enable them to use the Welsh language. One thing that I want to seek to achieve over the coming months and years is to create that sense of ownership, because the question I was getting in the summer when we were launching the strategy was, 'This is a Government strategy for the language', and a sense of 'the Government's going to do this', and 'the Government's going to do that'. Well, the Government is not responsible and cannot ensure that the Welsh language is spoken by people at home. You know, when I was trying to get my son ready for school this morning—I'm not going to have a Minister standing over me telling me that I need to be speaking Welsh with him when I'm desperately trying to get him to turn off *ninja turtles* tonight to go to sleep or to read something rather than just—

[195] **Bethan Jenkins:** Other products are available.

[196] **Alun Davies:** Yes. Sorry, sorry. I'll get into more trouble again.

[197] We need a parent to want to speak, and to feel comfortable speaking, Welsh to their child. You can't legislate for that.

[198] **Lee Waters:** Okay. So, I think that's clear. So, my second question is: if it's not the vision to have every school in Wales in time being a Welsh-medium school, then that assumes that the non-Welsh-medium schools are also able to teach Welsh well. Do you have a sense, and is there Estyn evidence, about how well Welsh is taught in non-Welsh-medium schools at the minute?

[199] **Alun Davies:** We've been through quite a difficult conversation on Welsh as a second language, as you are aware, and we've come to conclusions on that. I think it would be difficult to argue that we have, over the last couple of decades, teaching Welsh as a second language to all children who are not in Welsh-medium schools in Wales, created a bilingual nation. I think we recognise that. So, we haven't succeeded in that way. That's not to criticise or to talk about failure, because I don't think that's either fair or useful, but what we need to do is to ensure that young people leaving the education system in Wales have a knowledge of the Welsh language that goes beyond 'bore da' and 'nos da', and we've failed to do that. We haven't succeeded in doing that, so we need to do that differently. That is entirely the basis of the work that Kirsty's working on at the moment. We've already made significant changes to the curriculum of Welsh as a second language, and I think that's sometimes overlooked in the public debate that is taking place. You know, people look at the title of a qualification, but they don't look at the curriculum, and I think people need to look at both before coming to a conclusion on this. But we do need to change the way that we're teaching Welsh; I think there's no doubt about that at all. But we've made this commitment—the First Minister was extremely clear at the National Eisteddfod that we've made a commitment, we've recognised the reality and we're going to change what happens. We're going to make sure that we start changing immediately, and then we will flow into the Donaldson process, which we're all familiar with. So, you know, we haven't succeeded, and we're going to succeed, is what I want to say.

11:50

[200] **Bethan Jenkins:** A fyddai'n bosibl i ni gael nodyn ynglŷn â beth for us to receive a note about the

yw cylch gwaith yr elfen yma o remit in terms of this element of Donaldson, o ran y continwwm iaith Donaldson, in terms of the Welsh Gymraeg drwy addysg? Rwy'n credu y language continuum in education, so bydd hynny'n ein helpu ni i ddeall yn that we have a better understanding? iawn beth sydd yn digwydd.

[201] **Alun Davies:** A gaf i jest **Alun Davies:** Could I just say, as I ddweud, fel y dywedais wrth ymateb i said in response to Lee, that this part Lee, mae'r rhan yma o'r gwaith yn of the work is Kirsty Williams's gyfrifoldeb i Kirsty Williams, nid i mi. responsibility, rather than mine. I will Felly, byddaf yn siarad â Kirsty, a speak to Kirsty and she will write to bydd Kirsty yn ysgrifennu atoch chi you as a committee. fel pwyllgor.

[202] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê, grêt, **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay, great, thanks. diolch. Mae gan Suzy Davies Suzy Davies has a question. gwestiwn.

[203] **Suzy Davies:** I'm very encouraged by this ambition to normalise and grow the use of Welsh as a communication tool in non-Welsh-medium schools as well, and I really wish success on that. But we are still left with a fairly new generation of people who are actually not demonstrating goodwill to the Welsh language because of their own experiences in learning Welsh compulsorily in school in the previous, shall we say, 15 years; I think it's different now. These are the people who are going to be the influencers and the decision-makers in the next 10 years or so. You've launched a consultation—there's a question as to whether there's a need to do that—but what I want to ask you is: what are you doing about communicating to people who don't fill in consultations as a rule, saying, 'Actually, we need to hear from you and maybe even hear some difficult truths from you', so that you don't end up with a pile of consultation responses from the usual suspects telling you stuff you already know, because I think that would be a waste of everybody's time? How are you using your consultation process to reach people you've never reached before and may have uncomfortable things to say about how they view the Welsh language at the moment?

[204] **Alun Davies:** Look, I don't shy away from discomfiture, as you're aware.

[205] **Suzy Davies:** No, I know that.

[206] **Alun Davies:** But, let me say this—.

[207] **Suzy Davies:** This is a helpful question, by the way.

[208] **Alun Davies:** It is, and I'm trying to answer it in a full way. Look, we understand—notwithstanding the point I made to Lee earlier about the movement of the language away from being a political football—that there are different views in the country. I represent Blaenau Gwent, and I understand that full well. I think we do need to consult. I know there's been some criticism of that, but I think it's right and proper, if a Government is going to change the way it operates and change the way it establishes policy, that it does so by consulting with and talking with people in Wales. I think it would be outrageous were we to move away from that. So, I think it's absolutely the right thing to do.

[209] Now, in terms of moving away from having the usual people saying the usual things, whatever those usual people and usual things may be, I think you're absolutely right. We've tried in different ways to reach out to have conversations with people that don't necessarily fill in the forms that the Government would prefer them to fill in. I hope that when we get to the end of this process—it's ending at the end of October but, you know, if processes have to take longer, then I'm happy for them to do so—I hope that we will have spoken to more people than we will have done in other consultations. I've spoken to people and I've asked them to hold meetings in their communities or with people they know—whether it's through the *mentrau iaith* or whether it's through schools, or wherever it happens to be—so that they are able to reach out and speak to people. My feeling will be that, unless we're able to formulate an approach and a policy and a strategy—however you wish to describe it—that isn't simply based on Cathays park, then we won't have succeeded. What we need to do is really ensure that there is that sense of ownership of the language.

[210] In terms of normalising the language, many of us enjoyed the success of the Welsh football team earlier in the summer, and I particularly enjoyed the successes that I witnessed in Bordeaux and in Paris and the rest of it. The language was around me—in the stadium, in Bordeaux, in restaurants elsewhere, in Paris—and you got a sense of a very vibrant culture. Then when we were coming back we were seeing advertisements on television elsewhere where the language was alive and being used. I think that's a sort of thing that is more powerful than any number of pious speeches from pious politicians.

[211] **Suzy Davies:** Well, I'm not going to—. Sorry, this is the second part of my question.

[212] **Bethan Jenkins:** Yes, that's fine.

[213] **Suzy Davies:** I'm not disappointed by the end of your response to that, but while it's great to see Welsh use normally as part of life and in things like the football, on the high street of Neath there are people who can speak Welsh and don't speak Welsh, which is why I'm asking about your consultation. When I've asked some of these businesses, because you might know I've got a bit of a project going on there at the moment, they don't know about your consultation in the cafés and so on. Are you placing responsibility on other bodies—whether they be third sector or things like the Federation of Small Businesses and the Confederation of British Industry—to positively go out to their membership to promote what you're trying to do with this consultation?

[214] **Alun Davies:** Well, certainly, I would hope that they do so, but I don't think that it would be right and proper for me to tell them how to consult with their members as a Minister. But let me say this: one of the conversations I was having with Bethan earlier, before coming to the committee, was about some of the standards that we're looking at in the health service. The conversation we were having was about a doctor's surgery where staff there will speak and use Welsh, but as soon as somebody walks through the door they turn to English and write things in English. You know, there's that sort of conversation that we need to have about enabling people to feel more confident, to feel relaxed, and to feel that the language isn't something you turn to if you're going to watch the rugby on S4C, if you're going to go to chapel on Sunday morning or whatever it happens to be, but it's something that you can speak well, speak badly—it doesn't really matter—on the street, in the shop or wherever you happen to be. I think it's that sort of sense of a community-used spoken language that I'm more concerned about than the slavish translation of official documents.

[215] **Suzy Davies:** Thank you. Diolch.

[216] **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay. Diolch. I think Neil Hamilton had a question.

[217] **Neil Hamilton:** Yes. Well, I've never been one to frown on ambition, so I support you in your target of having 1 million speakers by 2050, and I hope

to still be here and be one of them.

[218] **Alun Davies:** Well, we look forward to your contributions. I look forward to the cross-examinations at that point.

[219] **Neil Hamilton:** One of the many tragedies of my life is that, when I was 14 years old I had to make a choice in school between carrying on studying Welsh and moving to German, and I chose the latter. So, I can now make a passable speech in German but I can't yet make a speech in Welsh, although I hope to amend that in the course of my sojourn here. So, 1 million speakers by 2050 is a remote target. The first necessity is to stabilise the number of speakers where we are, isn't it, and then to have a series of more modest intermediate targets along the way to 2050. I don't think we should have a slavish adherence to targets, because these are figures that are plucked out of the air, aren't they? But I applaud your general robustness in politics, and I think that that's an advantage to us in the conduct of your important office. So, I think you will have support, perhaps from some surprising sectors of politics, in what you're doing. But the way to make the Welsh language survive and prosper is to make it the language of the playground everywhere, isn't it, because that's the way in which it's easiest to learn a language when you're young, as I know full well from my struggles now to get the dictionary hammered into my head. Things that were very easy 40 years ago have now become very difficult. So, what's the strategy for making Welsh the language of the playground in areas where it isn't at the minute?

[220] **Alun Davies:** Modesty doesn't come easily to me sometimes, Mr Hamilton. [*Laughter.*] We won't be setting modest targets. We'll be setting ambitious targets because I don't want targets that I'm going to meet without doing anything and without trying. I want targets that are going to drive policy and drive change and targets that are achievable, clearly—there's no point setting a target that you're never going to achieve—but targets that are going to drive a change in approach.

[221] In terms of where we are, you talk about the playground—and you're right—but I would also talk about playing in the street. I would also talk about sitting in a pub, and I would also talk about going shopping wherever you happen to be. But the general point about the language in school is important. One of our Plaid Cymru colleagues—Sian Gwenllian—has done a lot of work launching a language charter in Gwynedd, which I think has been hugely important in changing the sort of approach to language use there.

12:00

[222] One of the things that I hope we will achieve in Tŷ'r Gwrhyd in Pontardawe, where we were not so long ago opening a Welsh language centre, is to give people the opportunity to use and practice their Welsh and to do so in a way that is comfortable, whether that is reading newspapers and talking about the news through the medium of Welsh, listening to a band through the medium of Welsh, or whatever it happens to be, enabling people to have that cultural opportunity beyond and outside a formal education.

[223] So, I want to go a bit further than simply doing what you suggest, but I do agree with you that what we need to do is to support the mentrau. I know the Chair's getting frustrated with my answers. [*Laughter.*] I don't know whether it's the quality or the length of them. We need to look at supporting the mentrau in what they're seeking to do and then ensure that the 10 Welsh-language centres that we're setting up actually are outreach centres and not ghettos.

[224] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you. There are yna bethau eraill rydym am godi gyda other topics that we want to raise chi; dyna'r unig reswm rydw i eisïau with you and that's the only reason bod yn fwy *strict*. Ond, mae gan that I'm going to be more strict. But, Hannah ac wedyn Suzy gwestiwn—ar Hannah and then Suzy have a addysg mae un Suzy ac nid wyf yn question—Suzy's is on education and siŵr am Hannah. Wedyn, mae angen I'm not sure about Hannah. Then, we inni symud at safonau. need to move on to the Welsh language standards.

[225] **Hannah Blythyn:** Diolch. I'll keep it brief. It links to what colleagues have been saying about reaching out. I think you're right; there's recognition that the way that Welsh is a second language certainly needs to be improved. While I welcome the planned significant increase in Welsh-medium education, I think we're quite keen to make sure that that is accessible and appealing to people—those communities, families and people who wouldn't actually think it was for them, and how we get that message across. A lot of people might think, 'Oh well, what's the point, what's the relevance to me?' It's that those groups of people aren't missed out, so I'd be interested to hear, as part of the strategy, how that is being considered and actioned.

[226] **Alun Davies:** Absolutely, and we represent very similar parts of the country in different places, if you like—

[227] **Hannah Blythyn:** A few miles apart.

[228] **Alun Davies:** Pardon?

[229] **Hannah Blythyn:** A few miles apart.

[230] **Alun Davies:** A few miles apart; the same places in different places, if you like. Welsh isn't a part of, you know—. You don't hear Welsh spoken on the streets of Blaenau Gwent in the same way as you probably don't in many parts of your constituency in north Wales. But I think it's important to recognise that people shouldn't feel any level of exclusion and that, as policy makers, we should be proactively and actively seeking to ensure that people have access not only to Welsh-language classes that are being re-established, if you like, and relaunched at the moment, but also to a sense of 'it does belong to me'.

[231] And one of the things—. You know, we're not here now to discuss legislation, but one of the things I think we need to look at when we do come to legislating in the next year or so is that whole role for promoting and supporting the language. I think in trying to establish standards and a statutory framework, we've lost sight, potentially, of the non-statutory, informal work, which persuades somebody, whether they're watching a football game or a rugby match—wherever it happens to be—and they feel that they can talk and have conversations about Welsh and can start conversations in Welsh. I remember seeing posters up around Cardigan not so long ago saying, 'Start every conversation with a "Shwmae"'. When you do that, you'll be surprised at how many people actually do use and speak the language.

[232] So, I think we do need to look at that level of promotion, which I think we've lost sight of over recent years. If the committee has any contributions on that, I think I would really welcome that in terms of taking forward, potentially, the legislation, if not the strategy, when we come to those sorts of conversations.

[233] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. Suzy now has a question on education.

[234] **Suzy Davies:** Just on that last point, I think it's really helpful to push

the point that Welsh is good for social mobility.

[235] **Jest un clou ar Gymraeg i Blant, sut mae hwn yn wahanol i Twf?** Just very quickly on Cymraeg for Kids, how is this different to the Twf scheme?

[236] **Alun Davies:** Wel, mae yna fwy ohono. Rwy'n cytuno gyda beth rydych chi'n ei ddweud am *social mobility*, ond nid wyf eisiau gweld y Gymraeg yn iaith y crachach, chwaith. **Alun Davies:** Well, there's more of it. I agree with what you say about social mobility, but I don't want to see the Welsh language as the language of the crachach, either.

[237] **Suzy Davies:** O na, na, rwy'n cytuno â hynny hefyd. **Suzy Davies:** Oh no, no. I also agree with that.

[238] **Alun Davies:** Rydw i eisiau gweld y Gymraeg fel iaith y stryd, iaith y *pub* ac iaith pob un ohonom yn y tŷ neu ble bynnag rydym ni. Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n bwysig ein bod yn tanlinellu hynny pan ydym yn siarad. **Alun Davies:** I want to see the Welsh language as the language of the street, the language of the pub and the language of each and every one of us at home or wherever we may be. I think it's important that we should highlight that when we do discuss these issues.

[239] **Pan ddaw i Gymraeg i Blant—ac fe wnaof ofyn i Bethan i ateb yn fwy manwl, achos mae hon yn broses sydd wedi mynd ymlaen ers sbel nawr—rydw i'n gwybod bod rhai pobl wedi bod yn becho aboutu beth ddigwyddodd i Twf ac rydw i'n cymryd mai hynny sydd tamaid bach y tu ôl i'ch cwestiwn chi. Mae Cymraeg i Blant yn hynod o bwysig i ni i ehangu cyrhaeddiad, os ydych chi'n licio, y project—ac rydym wedi gwneud hynny—ac i wneud mwy, achos mae'n mynd yn ôl at gwestiwn Neil Hamilton, i ryw raddau: sicrhau bod plant yn cael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg ac i ddysgu** When it comes to Cymraeg for Kids—and I will ask Bethan to respond in more detail, because this is a process that's been ongoing for some time now—I know that some people were concerned about what happened to Twf and I assume that that's what underpins your question. Cymraeg i Blant—Cymraeg for Kids is very important to us in enhancing the attainment, if you like, of the project—and we have done that—and to do more, because it goes back to Neil Hamilton's question, to some extent: to ensure that children have the opportunity to use the Welsh language and to learn Welsh through

Cymraeg drwy'r meithrin ac i sicrhau bod teuluoedd yn teimlo'n ddigon hyderus i gyflwyno'r Gymraeg i blant ac i sicrhau bod y plant yn cael cyfle, nid jest i gael eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond hefyd i chwarae drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, rydw i'n gobeithio bydd y penderfyniadau roedd y Llywodraeth flaenorol wedi'u gwneud ar Gymraeg i Blant yn sicrhau gwell cyrhaeddiad i'r projectau sydd gyda ni. Ydy hynny'n deg, Bethan?

[240] **Suzy Davies:** Ydy hi'n dal yn seiliedig ar y teulu? Dyna beth rydw i eisiau ei ofyn, *really*.

[241] **Ms Webb:** Ydy, rhaglen ar gyfer y teulu ydy hi. Mae yna ardaloedd newydd a'r rheswm pennaf am hynny oedd bod eisiau dod â chylchoedd Ti a Fi y Mudiad Meithrin yn nes at gynllunio addysg yn gyffredinol. So, roedd y dewis yn cael ei wneud yn gynharach, ac mae eisiau mwy o fudiadau meithrin. Felly, dyna yn ei hanfod oedd hi. Rydym yn cydnabod yn rhai o'r cadarnleoedd lle nad oes Twf rŵan mai'r trosglwyddo iaith a'r sgwrs ar drosglwyddo iaith oedd y peth pwysig yn y fan honno, ac felly mae'r mentrau iaith yn gweithio'n glos iawn efo'r rhaglenni Cymraeg i Blant. Y sesiynau tylino babi oedd y pethau eraill oedd yn achosi gofid ond rwy'n gwybod bod rhai o'r rhai a oedd ynghlwm â hynny bellach wedi setio busnesau eu hunain i fyny achos roedd yna ddigon o angen a digon o alw. Rydw i'n

nurseries and to ensure that families are sufficiently confident in introducing the Welsh language to their children and to ensure that the children have the opportunity, not just to have their education through the medium of Welsh, but also to play through the medium of Welsh. So, I do hope that the decisions taken by the previous Government on Cymraeg for Kids will ensure better attainment for our projects. Is that fair, Bethan?

Suzy Davies: Is it still family based? That's what I really want to ask, *really*?

Ms Webb: Yes, it is a programme for the family. There are new areas and the chief reason for that was that we wanted to bring the Mudiad Meithrin Ti a Fi groups closer to education planning in general. So, the choice was being made earlier, and there need to be more nursery organisations. So, in essence that's what it was. We acknowledge that in some of the strongholds where there is no Twf now that transferring the language and the conversation on transferring the language was the important issue there, and therefore the *mentrau iaith* are working very closely with the Cymraeg for Kids programmes. The baby massage sessions were the other things that caused concern but I know that some of the people who were linked to that have now established their own businesses because there was

gwybod bod yna sesiwn tylino babi yn mynd i ddechrau yn yr Atom. Mae yna rywun ym Mhwllheli a hefyd yn Fflint—

sufficient need and sufficient demand. I know that a baby massage session is going to start in the Atom. Somebody in Pwllheli and also in Flint—

[242] **Suzy Davies:** Mae'r fenter iaith wedi dod mewn—

Suzy Davies: The menter iaith has come in—

[243] **Ms Webb:** Ydy, ac mae'n gweithio fwy mewn partneriaeth rwan ond yr un ydy'r nod. Ond roedd yn rhaid i ni ddod â phobl yn fwy clos. Roedd sesiynau Twf a chylchoedd Ti a Fi yn debyg iawn hefyd. Felly, sicrhau bod pawb yn gwneud y gorau o'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn lleol a gweithio mewn partneriaeth—dyna beth oedd y prif reswm y tu ôl iddo fo.

Ms Webb: Yes, and it works more in partnership now but the aim is the same. But we had to bring people closer. The Twf and Ti a Fi groups were also very similar. Therefore, ensuring that everybody is making the most of the resources available locally and working in partnership was what lay behind it.

[244] **Suzy Davies:** Océ, diolch yn fawr. Diolch, Gadeirydd.

Suzy Davies: Okay, thank you very much. Thank you, Chair.

[245] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydw i'n mynd i fynd at safonau achos rwy'n gwybod bod Jeremy eisiau gofyn cwestiwn.

Bethan Jenkins: I'm going to move towards standards now because I know that Jeremy has a question.

[246] **Jeremy Miles:** Atebwyd y cwestiwn ar ddechrau'r sesiwn, so mae'n iawn.

Jeremy Miles: The question was answered at the beginning of the question, so it's okay.

[247] **Bethan Jenkins:** So, mae'n iawn. A oes gan unrhyw un arall gwestiwn ar safonau?

Bethan Jenkins: So, it's okay. Does anyone else have a question on standards?

[248] **Lee Waters:** I have a brief one. A couple of minutes ago you said that you are keen for the process for imposing standards to be less bureaucratic. I just wondered if you're able to elaborate on that a little.

[249] **Alun Davies:** You're tempting me into terrible trouble here, aren't you?

[*Laughter.*] Look, my feeling is that when you arrive at a point of compulsion you've probably failed, and what I tend to find, and I'm sure other Welsh speakers on the committee will recognise this, is that you can always tell when you're dealing with an organisation that wants to have a bilingual policy compared with an organisation that's compelled to have a bilingual policy. The quality of the service is always better. So, my feeling is that I would prefer to reach a situation whereby people, organisations and institutions are persuaded that operating bilingually is the right thing to do in Wales, rather than being compelled by law to do so.

[250] We have the legislation in place. I think it's proper that we do have language legislation in place to ensure that we do have that statutory framework. But the standards are a new way of operating, I think, for everybody, and when we legislated—and I was part of the committee that looked at this in a couple of Assemblies ago now and it's coming back to bite me, isn't it—we were certainly, I think, very ambitious in what we wanted to achieve at that time and we were trying to put in place a new way of working. Those of us who have been members of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee of this Assembly will know that it is right and proper to review legislation when it's been operating for a period of time and that is what we will do. My feeling is—and this is me—my feeling is that we are creating too much of a bureaucracy and we just need to streamline things to ensure that things are done easily and done effectively, and where we do expend resources that we do that on delivering bilingual services not administering bilingual policies.

[251] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Roeddwn i jest yn wonder—an os oedden ni'n gallu cael pum munud ychwanegol i godi materion darlledu gan nad oes cyfle wedi bod hyd yn hyn.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. I was just wondering if we could have an additional five minutes to raise issues in relation to broadcasting because we haven't had an opportunity up until now.

[252] **Alun Davies:** Wrth gwrs.

Alun Davies: Of course.

[253] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Grêt. Yn amlwg, roeddem wedi cael yr Ysgrifennydd Cabinet mewn yn gynharach ac fe wnaeth e gadarnhau mai fe fydd yn gyfrifol am fforwm y cyfryngau ac wedyn mai chi fydd yn

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Great. Obviously, we had the Cabinet Secretary in earlier and he confirmed that he will be responsible for the media forum and then you will have responsibility for broadcasting. How

gyfrifol am ddarlledu. Sut ydych chi'n do you foresee collaboration or co-rhagweld cydweithio ar hynny wedyn, operation on that, given that you gan mai chi oedd wedi gwneud y were the one who made the datganiad, rwy'n credu, yn y cychwyn statement, I believe, at the outset, in cyntaf, o ran bod y Llywodraeth yn terms of how the Government is gweithio ar y cyd ar y pethau yma, fel working jointly on these issues, so nad yw e'n gymhleth i ni, efallai, fel that it's not complicated for us as a pwyllgor i wybod pwy i sgrwteneiddio committee, and we know who to yn hynny o beth? scrutinise in that regard?

[254] **Alun Davies:** I am aware of Lee's rather mischievous question earlier in the session, and so is the Chief Whip. [*Laughter.*]

[255] **Bethan Jenkins:** You'll be off the committee next. [*Laughter.*]

[256] **Alun Davies:** I'm not entirely serious on that second point. [*Laughter.*] Can I say that I think it is potentially possible to expend a huge amount of time trying to stuff cigarette papers between Ministers, and it's usually a pointless exercise? Ken and I speak on a daily basis when we're here. We speak outside of professional work, we talk and we text. We keep in touch very closely.

[257] **Bethan Jenkins:** You don't need to go into details. It's fine. [*Laughter.*]

[258] **Alun Davies:** Well, the point I'm trying to—

[259] **Bethan Jenkins:** Spare us, please. [*Laughter.*]

[260] **Alun Davies:** Yes, okay. Perhaps we go into too much detail sometimes. But Ken and I work closely together. His focus is clearly on the media and particularly on industrial policy in sustaining and supporting, for example, the independent sector. My focus, and this is very clear in the breakdown of ministerial responsibilities that has been published by the Government, is broadcasting policy and the policy that sustains a broadcasting environment. Now, those are two quite distinct responsibilities.

[261] In terms of where we are, the committee will be aware that the draft charter is being published this week. I've spoken to the Secretary of State on these matters. I'm meeting her a week next Monday to discuss the issues around the charter. I've been corresponding with her this week, and I'll be able to update the committee on that correspondence in future meetings. But

can I say this: I've been very pleased with the way that the United Kingdom Government has responded to much of what we've been saying. Much of what we've said as a Government is shared, I think, by this committee, in terms of the view it's taken. It's also shared by other devolved administrations in the United Kingdom, and we've been able, I hope, to work in such a way as to deliver a BBC charter that will be far more responsive to the needs of the whole of the United Kingdom than, perhaps, the current charter is. Now, when we see that charter, I hope that it will give us the opportunity to ensure that people in Wales are properly served by our public service broadcaster, the BBC.

[262] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch, rwy'n **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you, I think credu bod Lee eisiau gofyn cwestiwn. that Lee wants to ask a question.

[263] **Alun Davies:** I thought he might. [*Laughter.*]

[264] **Lee Waters:** On a different matter, I think we've heard enough from you since becoming Minister on your position on the BBC and the charter, and I wholeheartedly support it and am very pleased with it. I was particularly heartened, in your statement, by your comments on ITV, which I think have been left off the hook in the focus on S4C and BBC. You say that you don't view that the existing level of provision on the licence is 'appropriate, or even adequate'. Work will be undertaken to address this, which I completely agree with. The challenge here is that they are only at the beginning of a 10-year licence. They take the view that, as a commercial company, they can do what they like, they already do more than they need to, despite very healthy advertising revenues and share prices. So, I wonder what options are available to you to realise your rightful ambition here—to get them to do more.

[265] **Alun Davies:** Look, you've worked at ITV, I think, and you know that there are some fantastic programme makers in ITV making some fantastic programming. It's a tragedy that we don't see more of that talent on our screens. One of the things that's affected all of us in different ways has been the decline in the number of hours and where those hours are situated in the schedule across all our public service broadcasters over the last period. You point out, quite rightly, that ITV is in a very robust financial situation. The latest numbers are—I think Adam Crozier was very clear in speaking to the City that is a financially successful business, and if he's that clear talking to the City, then I would expect him to be as clear talking to us about what he's going to deliver in terms of that highly robust, successful business.

12:15

[266] I met ITV Wales on Monday, as it happens, to talk about some of these issues. I want to see them broadcasting more hours. I'd like to see those hours at peak and not just in the darkness of the early morning, and I would like to see an increase in the genres produced by ITV Wales. I think it's important that that happens. Now, at the moment, the licence agreement they have runs, I think, to 2024. That is in place and that will not, I expect, be changed in that period. But that, of course, doesn't provide a ceiling; it provides a threshold for those services. And, in terms of where ITV is, you're quite right, they have been let off the hook. We've spoken repeatedly about the failures of the BBC to commission network programming, but we haven't spoken about the same failures from ITV. I think it is important that ITV commissioners look at Wales as a production centre and not simply as a cost centre. And I would expect and anticipate the opportunity to say that to ITV management at another time.

[267] But we do need to look at the regulation. This is why, I think, I've taken an interest in this, and others have over the years: we do need to have systems of regulation that hold these people to account. What's failed over the last certainly 15 years or so, or 20 years, is that we haven't had systems of accountability and regulation in the United Kingdom that have enabled commercial broadcasters such as ITV to both succeed commercially but also to deliver on public service obligations. I think that's something that we do need to look at, and I hope that the report that the committee offered last year, following previous reports and a report that I was responsible for many, many years ago now, will inform an environment of accountability that is UK-wide. We've always had this rather dry, dismal argument about devolving broadcasting, or not, and what I would like to see is the devolution of a level of accountability for broadcasting. I think that's really important: that broadcasters feel that you've got committees in this place—and I think it should be this place, rather than the Government—holding broadcasters to account on these matters.

[268] **Lee Waters:** Thank you.

[269] **Bethan Jenkins:** Did you want to come back?

[270] Roeddwn i jest eisiau gofyn am I just wanted to ask about S4C, S4C, achos cafwyd datganiad yr because there was a statement last

wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â sefydlogi'r arian rwy'n credu hyd 2022. Gwelais i ddim rhyw lawer yn y newyddion ac o gwmpas ynglŷn â barn pobl ynglŷn â hynny, achos nid oeddwn yn gweld bod yna gynnydd, dim ond ei fod yn sefydlogi. A oes barn gyda chi fel Gweinidog yn hynny o beth?

week about stabilising the funding I think until 2022. I didn't see much in the news and around about people's views about stabilising the funding, because I didn't see an increase, just that there was more stabilisation. Do you have a view as a Minister on that?

[271] **Alun Davies:** Rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith bod cytundeb wedi bod a bod gan S4C y gallu nawr i gynllunio ar sail gyllidebol, ariannol, pendant. Rwy'n credu y byddai pob un ohonom ni eisiau gweld mwy o arian yn mynd at y BBC ac yn mynd at S4C. Rwy'n credu y byddai pob un ohonom am weld ein darlledwyr cenedlaethol yn cael y math o adnoddau sydd ei angen arnyn nhw i sicrhau bod y gwerthoedd cynhyrchu yn parhau i fod yn uchel iawn. Ond rwyf yn meddwl bod y cytundeb nawr sydd gan S4C a'r BBC yn un aeddfed ac yn un sy'n galluogi i'r ddau sefydliad i gydweithio ac i lwyddo ar y cyd.

Alun Davies: I welcome the fact that there has been agreement on this and that S4C now has the ability to plan on a firm financial basis. I think that each and every one of us would like to see more funding provided to the BBC and to S4C. I think each and every one of us would want to see our national broadcasters being given the kind of resources that they need to ensure that production values remain high. But I do think that the agreement now in place between S4C and the BBC is one that is mature and one that enables both institutions to collaborate and to succeed together.

[272] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê. Grêt. A oes yna gwestiynau eraill? Rwy'n siŵr y gallwn ni ddod yn ôl i nifer o'r rhain yn y dyfodol. Ac os oes unrhyw gwestiynau ychwanegol, fe wnawn ni ysgrifennu atoch chi. Diolch yn fawr iawn am ddod i mewn heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay. Great. Are there any other questions? I'm sure that we can return to many of these in the future. And if there are any additional questions, we will write to you. Thank you very much for coming in today.

[273] **Alun Davies:** Croeso. Diolch.

Alun Davies: You're welcome. Thank you.

[274] **Bethan Jenkins:** Fe wnawn ni symud, yn unol â'r Rheolau Sefydlog,

Bethan Jenkins: We will now move, in accordance with Standing Orders,

i mewn i sesiwn preifat. Diolch yn into private session. Thank you very
fawr. much.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 12:19.

The public part of the meeting ended at 12:19.

Drafft – Draft