



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and
Communications Committee](#)

20/07/2016

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)
[Meeting Agenda](#)

Cynnwys
Contents

- 4 Cynnig i Ethol Cadeirydd Dros Dro
Motion to Elect Temporary Chair
- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Newyddiaduraeth Newyddion yng Nghymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 11
News Journalism in Wales: Evidence Session 11
- 28 Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note
- 29 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w dystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Hannah Blythyn	Llafur
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour
Neil Hamilton	UKIP Cymru
Bywgraffiad Biography	UKIP Wales
Dai Lloyd	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Dros Dro)
Bywgraffiad Biography	The Party of Wales (Temporary Committee Chair)
Jeremy Miles	Llafur
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour
Lee Waters	Llafur
Bywgraffiad Biography	Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Graham Breeze	Partner yn MyTown Media Ltd, perchnogion safleoedd ar-lein MyWelshpool a MyNewtown Partner at MyTown Media Ltd, owners of online sites MyWelshpool and MyNewtown
Rob Taylor	Golygydd, Wrexham.com Editor, Wrexham.com

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Steve George	Clerc Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Lowri Harries	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Robin Wilkinson	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:30.
The meeting began at 09:30.

Cynnig i Ethol Cadeirydd Dros Dro Motion to Elect Temporary Chair

[1] **Mr George:** Diolch. Rwyf yn datgan bod y cyfarfod hwn o Bwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu ar agor. Mae Cadeirydd y pwyllgor wedi anfon ei hymddiheuriadau ar gyfer y cyfarfod, felly yr eitem gyntaf o fusnes yw penodi Cadeirydd dros dro ar gyfer y cyfarfod, o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.22. Rwyf yn gwahodd enwebiadau gan aelodau'r pwyllgor.

Mr George: Thank you. I declare this meeting of the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee open. The committee Chair has tendered her apologies for the meeting, so the first item of business is the appointment of a temporary Chair for today's meeting, under Standing Order 17.22. I invite nominations from committee members.

[2] **Jeremy Miles:** Dai Lloyd.

Jeremy Miles: Dai Lloyd.

[3] **Mr George:** Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw enwebiadau eraill, felly rwyf yn datgan bod Dai Lloyd wedi'i ethol ac rwyf yn ei wahodd i gymryd y gadair.

Mr George: I see that there are no other nominations. Therefore, I declare that Dai Lloyd is elected and invite him to take the chair.

[4] **Lee Waters:** Llongyfarchiadau, Dai.

Lee Waters: Congratulations, Dai.

*Penodwyd Dai Lloyd yn Gadeirydd dros dro.
Dai Lloyd was appointed temporary Chair.*

09:31

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[5] **Dai Lloyd:** A gaf i ddiolch yn fawr iawn i fy nghyd-Aelodau am eu hyder yn fy ngallu i gadeirio'r cyfarfod yma? Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi. A gaf i groesawu pawb i'r cyfarfod yma, gyda rhai

Dai Lloyd: May I thank fellow Members for their confidence in my ability to chair this meeting? Thank you very much. May I welcome everyone to this meeting, and just say a few initial words of

rhagymadroddion cychwynnol? Os bydd yna larwm tân, dylai pawb adael yr ystafell drwy'r allanfeydd tân penodol a dilyn cyfarwyddiadau'r tywyswyr a'r staff. Nid ydym yn disgwyl prawf heddiw. Dylai pawb droi eu ffonau symudol i fod yn dawel. Bydd pawb yn ymwybodol, rwy'n siŵr, fod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog. Mae yna glustffonau ar gael i glywed y cyfieithiad ar y pryd ac i addasu'r sain ar gyfer pobl sy'n drwm eu clyw. Mae'r cyfieithu ar y pryd ar gael ar sianel 1, a gellir chwyddo'r sain ar sianel 0. Peidiwch â chyffwrdd â'r botymau ar y meicroffonau, gan y gall hynny amharu ar y system, a gofalwch fod y golau coch ymlaen cyn dechrau siarad.

introduction? In the event of a fire alarm, you should leave the room through the appropriate exits and follow the instructions of the ushers and staff. We're not expecting a fire drill today. Everyone should turn their mobile phones to silent. Everyone will be aware, I'm sure, that the National Assembly for Wales operates bilingually. Headphones are available for interpretation and amplification for those who need it. Interpretation is available on channel 1 and amplification is available on channel 0. Please don't touch the buttons on the microphones, because that can have an impact on the system, and do ensure that your red light is on before you make your contribution.

[6] A gaf i ofyn i fy nghyd-Aelodau a oes ganddyn nhw unrhyw fuddiannau i'w datgan o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog? Na, pawb yn hapus. Rydym ni wedi derbyn ymddiheuriadau o dan eitem 1—ymddiheuriadau oddi wrth, yn naturiol, fel yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes, Bethan Jenkins, a Dawn Bowden, a hefyd ymddiheuriadau oddi wrth Suzy Davies. Nid ydym yn disgwyl dirprwyon ar eu rhan.

May I ask fellow Members whether they have any declarations of interest under our Standing Orders? No, everyone is content. We have received apologies under item 1, as we've already heard, from Bethan Jenkins, and Dawn Bowden, and we've also received apologies from Suzy Davies. We're not expecting any substitutes this morning.

09:33

Newyddiaduraeth Newyddion yng Nghymru: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 11 News Journalism in Wales: Evidence Session 11

[7] **Dai Lloyd:** Rŷm ni'n symud **Dai Lloyd:** That brings us, therefore,

ymlaen, felly, i eitem 2, a pharhad ein harolwg o newyddiaduraeth newyddion yng Nghymru. Hon ydy sesiwn dystiolaeth 11. O'n blaenau ni heddiw mae Rob Taylor, golygydd Wrexham.com—bore da—a hefyd Graham Breeze, partner yn MyTown Media Ltd, perchnogion safleoedd ar-lein MyWelshpool a MyNewtown—croeso hefyd i chithau. Rŷm ni wedi derbyn llond trol o dystiolaeth ymlaen llaw o wahanol ffynonellau. Yn ôl ein traddodiad, rŵan, rŷm ni'n mynd yn syth i mewn i gwestiynau.

to item 2, and we continue our inquiry into news journalism in Wales. This is evidence session 11. Joining us today are Rob Taylor, editor of Wrexham.com—a very good morning to you—and Graham Breeze, partner at MyTown Media Ltd, owners of online sites MyWelshpool and MyNewtown—a very warm welcome to you, too. We've received a great deal of evidence from various sources, so, as per usual, we will move immediately to questions.

[8] Fe wnaif i ddechrau, gan mai dyna beth mae'r Cadeirydd yn arfer ei wneud fan hyn. Mae un o'r ffynonellau tystiolaeth yna wedi dod o Brifysgol Glyndŵr Wrecsam, ynglŷn â beth maen nhw'n ei wneud yn y fan yna, felly yn benodol i Rob Taylor, a allaf ofyn ichi ehangu ar y syniad yr ydym ni wedi'i gael oddi wrth Brifysgol Glyndŵr Wrecsam i gyflwyno prentisiaethau newyddiaduraeth yng Nghymru? Sut fydd hyn yn gwella cynnwys a phlwraliaeth newyddiaduraeth Gymreig? Rob.

I'll kick off, as that's what the Chair usually does in this place. One of those evidence sources was Wrexham Glyndŵr University, and could I ask Rob Taylor specifically to expand on the concept that Wrexham Glyndŵr University put forward to introduce journalism apprenticeships in Wales? How will this improve content and plurality in news journalism in Wales? Rob.

[9] **Mr Taylor:** First of all, good morning and thank you very much for inviting Wrexham.com here. I'm speaking, obviously, on behalf of Wrexham.com—myself, Rob Taylor, and Darryl Robertson, who also co-runs the website—but also we have a partnership with Deeside.com, and that's Jon Sheppard, and I've spoken with him. To pick up on your point, in terms of the apprenticeships, it's one thing we spoke about, actually, a couple of weeks ago. We do various placements with the university, alongside journalism courses et cetera. I think there is a concern that there's not parity between the situation in England and, perhaps, Wales in terms of apprenticeships. I believe that the course leaders there will be in touch directly—they'll be making a separate submission to the committee on that

basis, in terms of apprenticeships.

[10] To touch on a wider point in terms of the future of journalism in Wales is that, certainly—we were discussing this earlier—there's obviously, looking back towards the Institute of Welsh Affairs submission, which is perhaps retrospective in itself—. And on that point, it is certainly a case of looking forward, more than anything, in terms of the skill sets that have been brought forward. Is it the case that the response or the output from this committee will be based on something in 2017, whereas, perhaps, really, we should be looking five, perhaps even 10 years ahead, at what the media landscape would be then, and perhaps use it as an opportunity to get ahead of the game, as opposed to just perhaps managing a situation that is developing?

[11] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr am hynny. Yn nhermau—. Mae'r cwestiynau cyntaf ynglŷn â'r modelau busnes cyfredol. A allaf i ofyn i chi'ch dau beth wnaeth arwain i chi ddechrau eich safleoedd newyddion hyperleol yn y lle cyntaf? Nid ydw i'n gwybod pwy sydd eisiau mynd gyntaf? Sut wnaethoch chi ddechrau?

Dai Lloyd: Thank you for that. The first questions are on current business models. Can I ask both of you what led you to start running your hyperlocal news sites initially? I don't know who would like to go first. How did you start?

[12] **Mr Breeze:** First of all, I'd like to say a big 'thank you' for allowing us to be here to address this committee this morning, and to address that question: mid Wales is the area that MyTown Media serves, and Welshpool and Newtown in particular. The reason that we launched the sites was that we recognised that there was a huge black hole in that area in terms of news coverage. The area is covered by a very successful weekly newspaper, which I previously edited in a previous life, which is owned by NWN Media—previously North Wales Newspapers—which dominates the scene, really. Apart from that in the north Powys area, the only competition comes from the *Shropshire Star* evening newspaper. There is no local radio, and minimal coverage by the BBC of anything that happens basically north of Merthyr as far as mid Wales is concerned. So, it was recognised by myself, having recently been made redundant from North Wales Newspapers after 37 years with them, and another colleague—an ex-colleague—that there was a hole there that needed filling. Our initial idea was to launch a newspaper. The costs of that were prohibitive, so we looked at what other means we could come up with. Online newspapers were in their infancy at that stage, but we

recognised that there was an opening for that, and immediately set about getting one off the ground.

[13] The response to that has been amazing, as far as we're concerned. We launched MyWelshpool initially in 2010—in August 2010. By December, we'd launched MyNewtown as well because of the demand that we were getting. We have received enormous hit rates for both sites. We use social media heavily to promote all the content that we've got, and the sites have grown from that day to this, and continue to grow now, and are supported heavily by advertising now, which, in the initial stages, they weren't. So, the sites have developed. We recognised there was a hole that needed filling—a vacuum—and that newspapers, as you will know in this committee, are falling in sales terms on a daily and weekly basis. Weekly newspapers and regional daily newspapers are falling by 6 to 10 per cent every six months, and that's something that can't continue. It's spiralling out of control, whereas online news is certainly the way forward as far as we can see.

[14] **Dai Lloyd:** Okay. And Rob.

[15] **Mr Taylor:** Slightly different reason for Wrexham.com. I've got background in computing, domain policy—bits and pieces along those lines. I managed to acquire the domain name Wrexham.com, with no intention of essentially building out what it is now. I am a Wrexham Association Football Club fan, and there's been some probably quite well documented troubles with that. At the time, I was doing some Q&As with prospective owners, essentially—some quite shady characters, shall we say? And it was quite interesting to see the local media response to that, in terms of the—. For example, anecdotally, at the time, there was one bit where you'd look someone up on Companies House and you'd see they're disqualified—quite an empirical fact—and it was not possible to have that published in, say, a local paper, and at the time I was told that that was a decision that was not taken locally but perhaps, say, out of Canary Wharf, for example. It was almost a case of just creating a platform that when—if and when—there are local issues that you've got an audience and it's an audience with perhaps weight, or it's a title with some kind of weight to point people towards—. So, yes, it was started from that perspective and it's now—. Although I'm not a qualified journalist myself, I like to think I can string a sentence together. We do have qualified journalists working on Wrexham.com, and we run, essentially, I think, probably 17 to 18 hours a day coverage via various different social media feeds. We run an office out of Wrexham town centre, and we're now—I would probably say we're quite firmly established as the

go-to informational place for Wrexham and the surrounding area, and likewise, Jon Sheppard up in Deeside as well is doing similar work.

[16] I think, certainly, one thing I was going to mention today is that I think that even when you look back and, perhaps, review in the context of preparing for this, where we've come from and what we're doing, it certainly struck me how, almost, I suppose, Welsh media is the proverbial simmering frog—that you don't notice the incremental changes of the degradation of what is being covered and how it's being covered, perhaps month to month or quarter to quarter, but, certainly, when you look back—. One case in point is that there is a market report in front of the local authority at the moment. Previously, that would be front page news on the *Daily Post*, for example. However, there was no-one from the *Daily Post* at that meeting the other week. This is where it'll change, I think, and will add up to quite a depressing direction of travel, which I think is a very good way of describing it.

<p>[17] Dai Lloyd: Grêt, diolch yn fawr am hynny. A allaf i jest gael rhagor o wybodaeth ynglŷn â'ch cwmnïau chi? A allwch chi amlinellu y prif heriau rydych chi wedi eu hwynebu yn nhermau sefydlu eich safleoedd newyddion? Ai dim ond heriau ariannol oedd yna, neu a oedd yna heriau o ran sgiliau, ac felly, yn dilyn o hynny, pa mor gynaliadwy yw eich model busnes presennol chi?</p>	<p>Dai Lloyd: Great, thank you for that. If I could just seek a little more information about your companies—could you outline the main challenges that you faced in setting up your news sites? Were they simply financial challenges, or were there skills challenges? And therefore, following on from that, how sustainable is your current business model?</p>
---	--

[18] **Mr Breeze:** Well, yes, there have been issues, clearly, with setting the business up, and mainly financial. We're operated by a team—. We launched with a team of three: two highly experienced journalists working part-time, and an information technology partner who handles all the IT systems for us. That's expanded to three experienced journalists working part-time. So, the challenge was not really in accessing news, because we had the abilities to do that. We quickly set up the channels through all the regular news providers—that news came to us in a way that it comes to all the regional newspapers as well.

[19] The biggest challenge, of course, was financing the operation. We were fortunate from the start that we were able to gain the confidence of some quite big advertisers who recognised, you know, that we were coming

from an editorial background and a commercial background, in that we knew how newspapers were operated and how they existed, and we were known locally so we gained some local support. So, from day 1, we did manage to gain quite a bit of local advertising. The biggest challenge, of course, for us, is that we do not receive any advertising from local authorities or from Welsh Government. That really is the obstacle that stands in the way of making the hyperlocal business the success that it really can become. We do manage to make a profit. We make quite a big profit, you know, considering what we do. It doesn't support four full-time people, but it does give four part-time incomes. It's quite a complicated operation, because, clearly, we have to keep things running on a seven-day-a-week basis, and that's been our strength, really. But revenue is clearly our biggest obstacle, and getting it in on a regular stream as well.

[20] **Dai Lloyd:** Dyna fe. Ocê. Rob. **Dai Lloyd:** There we are. Okay. Rob.

[21] **Mr Taylor:** Probably the best example on this would be if any of you wanted to set up your own news website; that's where we started from. So, there's no funding—we didn't apply for any funding—there were no start-up grants, there was no, essentially, support network, because, to broaden this out, to do online news, for example, you would have to be working with server stuff, and you'd have to do website design at very basic levels, run by themes or whatever. But it's the technical aspects of putting things together: it's not just the attending these things and scrutinising things, and reporting. Moving forward, you've got to build, say, the add systems, or at least have an awareness of how add systems work, take payments, bank accounts—you've got to have the whole starting-from-scratch thing, even in terms of running an office, you know cleaning the office, stocking up the coffee to name the very basic things, which are not, perhaps, the core journalist angle that people think of when you think of the websites.

[22] Luckily, we have very receptive communications departments in north Wales—North Wales Police, for example, Wrexham council et cetera—who, around the UK—. I'm certainly aware that people have, perhaps, pushed back against such independent news outlets starting up and perhaps created some barriers, but they were very good with us. So, we were able to go and get access.

09:45

[23] In terms of that, when you widen it up—touching on it in terms of

statutory notices et cetera—we've had issues with, say, the Mersey Dee Alliance, where, perhaps the public relations has been done out of Liverpool. We had some really beautiful brand-new Arriva buses turn up in Wrexham the other day. They were all there, but we don't know anything about this because the PR's been done out of Manchester. We have, it's unfortunate to say, a similar issue with Cardiff, for example with Golley Slater. I've put in requests regarding the promotion of the Welsh lottery, enquired why we were not essentially being part of that process and we were told—and this is in the last month or two—'We only deal with mainstream titles', I think was the term they used. Now, when you're in Wrexham, it's—

[24] **Dai Lloyd:** Don't worry; after this appearance, you'll be mainstream. *[Laughter.]*

[25] **Mr Taylor:** I think we kind of are. I think that's the problem with it. And that's the issue. I've mentioned about Welsh Government spending on statutory notices and using white space. In a letter from Ken Skates, he mentioned that advice was essentially given to Welsh Government communications from Golley Slater. Now, if they're giving advice and they're unaware of us, that is a huge problem, from my perspective. But, again, the challenges are there. I suppose one outcome I'd be quite keen to see would be that, for other people—. At the moment, there are a lot of good people who are good journalists who are essentially being let go or are taking redundancy from existing legacy news organisations, and a few of those have said to me, 'I'd be quite keen to set up a Wrexham.com, essentially', but, with all these challenges, it's not as straightforward as carrying on with the job because, essentially, you've got to create the business behind it.

[26] **Dai Lloyd:** Fine. Developing these themes, the next three questions are from Neil Hamilton.

[27] **Neil Hamilton:** I don't know how many staff—. You mentioned that you've got four part-timers, but is Wrexham.com similar? Do you have a small core staff?

[28] **Mr Taylor:** There are two of us. I'd say, in terms of this, that my personal view is that, for operations like this, the aim—. Perhaps growth traditionally has been counted in jobs, for example, but these operations are going to be small, lightweight operations.

[29] **Neil Hamilton:** Well, obviously, you have to be much more flexible than

a traditional news organisation based on print, but you have to have a seven-day-a-week operation with part-time staff, so that must be quite difficult to keep going, I would have thought without having gaps or lacunae?

[30] **Mr Taylor:** It is. It certainly takes up the hours. However, I think that, if it's staffed correctly with people who are up-to-date and leveraging modern technology, for example—. With an Apple watch, if something happens in Wrexham, I'll get a ping on my arm. Again, I think that touches on looking forward in terms of perhaps not just responding to how things are run and perhaps looking at the media in terms of the transition from traditional newsrooms and traditional technologies to looking at how the future—. For example, the new Apple operating system will have augmented reality in it, and that will be commonplace, probably, within a year or two. How is that going to develop and affect news, for example, and how people consume news? To me, that's not even on the radar of some places.

[31] **Neil Hamilton:** Well, as you were saying, the print media is virtually dead on its feet, isn't it? The circulation of the *Western Mail* printed edition is about 17,000 and declining even from that level. So, the future is with online news coverage; that's for certain. But the challenges that you face are obviously going to be significant in terms of covering the ground. What sort of geographical areas do you cover? Is it just the town of Welshpool, just the town of Newtown, for example, just the town of Wrexham or—?

[32] **Mr Breeze:** No, we would cover an area, we say, of between 10 and 15 miles circulating around that area that's out of Welshpool and Newtown as well. So, we would say that we're covering the majority of north Powys. I forgot to mention, really, when you were asking the question before about how we set up. After a couple of years, we were very lucky to be selected as part of the Nesta project into hyperlocal media when we gained some funding to help us set up two other sites. We set up MyRadnor and MyBrecon and developed apps as well as part of the funding scheme. The return for that was that Nesta were able to log in to our analytics and see exactly where our hits were coming from and what type of hits we were getting. So, that certainly helped us along the way as well.

[33] But you ask about—you mention newspapers and the fact that they're dying on their feet, and they clearly are. It's not just mid Wales and north Wales and south Wales; that's the country as a whole. So, more and more hyperlocal sites like ours are springing up all over the country. When we set up seven years ago, there were very, very few. In fact, we were one of the

first in Wales. Now, you know, there are scores of them. Somewhere along the line, there has to be a coming together, I think, of the hyperlocal sites as an organisation, and when we were part of the Nesta scheme, we actually put forward the idea that a national set-up, just as there was a national newspaper set-up, would be the way forward, and I firmly believe that that still is the way forward and it'll be the only way that hyperlocals can really continue, and continue to grow.

[34] **Neil Hamilton:** Do you see any scope at all for a print spin-off of what you do?

[35] **Mr Breeze:** I know that some have gone down that route. In south Wales, it's happened in Caerphilly, and quite successfully. From our point of view, we don't think it's the way forward. We see the way forward as being online. We are now—I would say that we are regarded as the first port of call for readers in the main two towns in north Powys, which, for us, in that period of time, is a huge triumph, really. You know, you hear people talking about us everywhere you go, it's, 'Have you seen it online?', 'I saw it on MyWelshpool' or 'I saw it on MyNewtown'. That's something that didn't exist before, and it was, 'We saw it in the *County Times*' before. Now, people aren't prepared to wait a week to see something in a newspaper that they've already seen in numerous other places. You pick up your phone, you pick up—I haven't got an Apple watch yet, but I'm sure we'll all be quite interested to see about that. But we do have all the other modern technology, and people are getting things instantly and people want their news instantly. They don't want to wait for it. They want to know what's happening now, on the spot, really.

[36] **Neil Hamilton:** I haven't even got a clockwork watch. [*Laughter.*]

[37] **Dai Lloyd:** Well, I'm sure other watches are available, anyway. [*Laughter.*] Moving on to Hannah for the next—.

[38] **Hannah Blythyn:** Thanks, Chair. I think, Graham, in response to one of the previous questions from the Chair, you said you didn't receive any grant funding. Is that the case for you, Rob?

[39] **Mr Taylor:** Yes. We still don't have funding on that.

[40] **Hannah Blythyn:** So, is the reason why that there wasn't anything suitable available, or you just didn't—?

[41] **Mr Taylor:** In terms of what we've done, it would be a case of almost like shoehorning what we do to enable grant funding, if that makes sense, be it a case of—there are huge sums of money floating around in terms of what could be out there. The Google development fund, for example—an app gets created for a six-figure sum that, essentially, doesn't really get used. It's a case of doing it for money's sake, whereas, being someone and having a publication that is keeping an eye on other people's spending, shall we say, to be able to go down that route wouldn't sit right. So, it'd be something that we would look at; however, it would have to be in the right circumstances.

[42] **Hannah Blythyn:** One of the previous evidence sessions we've had—it was suggested that, perhaps, some start-up funding that was better targeted at hyperlocal journalism would be useful. Would you agree with that or—?

[43] **Mr Taylor:** I think it's to do with the framework around that. It's not solely a money-based issue. I don't think many people look to—if you say you're setting up a news website et cetera—essentially make revenue and make yourself rich; I don't think that's the right reason to do it. But I think it's—obviously, finance does come into it, but, as I said earlier, it's having the right connections, because, for example, Jon of Deeside.com broke a story the other night where his server, essentially, fell over. So, he's now becoming very popular; however, the revenue's not matching up to, essentially, pay for the server that will be needed to cope with it. So, it's that kind of chicken-and-egg situation where, if there is expertise or that kind of thing available to tap into, I think that would be a genuinely beneficial thing.

[44] **Hannah Blythyn:** Is that the same for you, Graham?

[45] **Mr Breeze:** Yes, very much, really. I think it all comes down to revenue. Without that—I think the majority of hyperlocal sites are being formed by journalists who are, possibly, being made redundant. They think there's an opening they can fill and go down that route. Unfortunately, the majority of journalists don't have any commercial background, either, and don't appreciate the costs, and they're not able to provide the revenue to make it work. So, that's the biggest stumbling block that the hyperlocal industry faces, really.

[46] **Hannah Blythyn:** I think you also touched on the whole issue of advertising to raise revenue, and I think one of the things that have come through quite strongly in previous evidence sessions in this committee is

that it would be very beneficial to hyperlocals if you were able to publish statutory notices.

[47] **Mr Breeze:** Absolutely. It would change the game completely for the hyperlocal industry. It's not just in Wales that people are facing this problem; everyone you talk to in the business is not getting the statutory notices. I don't think they sit particularly well on the sites, because they're harder to read than they are in a newspaper, but the fact is that people are not reading the newspapers anymore and that statutory notices are appearing at an exorbitant rate. I've made several presentations to Powys County Council. I'm even on Powys County Council now, so I've had to stop making them, but—*[Laughter.]* But Powys have not responded to our pleas to come on board with us, and, without that revenue, we continue to struggle. It would change the game completely if statutory notices came—

[48] **Hannah Blythyn:** It's quite interesting about, the way they're formatted, they don't sit well on a digital site. So, I think it goes back to some of the evidence we had that it's not just about funding needing to be rethought, but the whole approach to this thing needs to be rethought—

[49] **Mr Taylor:** I was just going to say—

[50] **Hannah Blythyn:**—to suit the digital age we're in now.

[51] **Mr Taylor:** Statutory notices certainly are a tick box in the legal framework as opposed to actually genuinely wanting to communicate, 'This is happening to you in your community—are you interested in it?' To be blunt, I'm convinced that statutory notices aren't even read by the people who publish them, because we've picked stories out of statutory notices out of the back of newspapers and run a story on it, and then we see that story being run in the newspaper several days later, because they've read it on us.

[52] **Mr Breeze:** It's true. *[Laughter.]*

[53] **Mr Taylor:** And that is genuinely true. I completely agree. I don't think the format would translate to be online, but also I don't think the generalised, 'We are sticking it a Wrexham publication, therefore everybody in Wrexham perhaps will be aware of something'—it needs to be thought through better. I know there's been a pilot scheme. I think about £1 million was spent on a pilot scheme across the UK on how this can be done better, and it was, essentially, the usual big newspaper groups who've done various

trials, and I'm told—I don't know this 100 per cent, but I'm told that the outcomes of that are unknown, because, essentially, it was disbanded and it's disappeared. So, again, it's another example of, perhaps, how funding has gone a certain way and not been used as well as it could have.

[54] **Dai Lloyd:** Mae'r cwestiynau **Dai Lloyd:** The next questions are nesaf o dan ofal Jeremy Miles. from Jeremy Miles.

[55] **Jeremy Miles:** Can we turn to the question of non-financial support, which you've touched briefly on in the answers that you gave? We had evidence from Cardiff University about their centre for community journalism and the independent community news network. Have either of you engaged with any of the support services that they provide, and, if so, what have your experiences been like?

[56] **Mr Breeze:** Yes, we have. We are in constant touch, actually, and there are a lot of positive things coming out of there. It's a very slow process, but I think what's happening there is very positive for us, really. Moving forward from that, I think, as a result of some of the discussions that have been taking place, there is obviously the BBC programme as well to provide a journalist for coverage of local authority meetings and matters, which, potentially, could be a big help to us. But, yes, what's happening at the college is something that we're both working very closely with.

[57] **Jeremy Miles:** And what kind of support are you getting? How does it manifest itself in terms of—

[58] **Mr Taylor:** I was going to say, just to echo, the work that the guys at C4CJ at Cardiff University are doing—we've been in touch with them for a number of years now, and what they're doing is excellent stuff. The ICNN is an output of that to a degree, recognising that there needs to be some form of, I suppose, collective group, however, to exist in terms of be it hyperlocals or independent news.

[59] One thing I wanted to touch on, because I was reading through some of the transcripts, is that there was a perception that hyperlocals are quite amateur affairs, perhaps don't do scrutiny, and just do reports of what is going on, for example, but there is a higher level of that, and I think one element of the ICNN would be a case of doing the quality control, increasing, essentially, industry standards, and that kind of thing. To touch on practical outputs, one thing with that is getting alongside editors' codes of practice

and that kind of thing, enabling that, feedback loops in terms of complaints procedures, and, longer term, I know the ambition is to do things bigger and better and properly, for established players as well as people who want to come into it.

[60] **Jeremy Miles:** So, do you get legal advice and legal services?

[61] **Mr Taylor:** Not at the moment, but there are, essentially, pathways in place if there are issues.

[62] **Jeremy Miles:** Right. So, what do you do to make sure that you are legally compliant, apart from rely on your journalistic training—

10:00

[63] **Mr Taylor:** There is, as you said, the journalistic training in terms of media law. There are various National Union of Journalists refresher courses, which are up in Wrexham, as well as down in Cardiff, that are attended to keep up to speed.

[64] **Jeremy Miles:** You feel that's adequate, do you? An open question.

[65] **Mr Taylor:** I think it can always be done better, but I think, in terms of Cardiff University, certainly, they have a track record in terms of their journalism school anyway, and what they're doing is proper groundbreaking, proper useful stuff. So, to spin that out into the ICNN via C4CJ, I think would be a very beneficial thing.

[66] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay.

[67] **Mr Breeze:** Can I just come back on that one, perhaps? I think there is a problem there in that we are both lucky that we have got journalistic experience in our team, and at a high level. But a lot of hyperlocal sites haven't got that, and that's where there is a legal—a loophole, really, which I think is where an insistence that hyperlocal sites are members of some kind of national organisation, and they're governed and have certain regulations that they have to fulfil to become part of that group, is essential, going forward.

[68] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. We talked to Rachel Howells, who set up the *Port Talbot Magnet*, about her experiences. She said to us that she felt that one of

the solutions to this challenged landscape, if I can put it like that, is to set up community news hubs, effectively, that are publicly funded, in different parts of Wales. Do you think there's any merit in that? Would that complement what you do, or would it be a threat, in a sense? How do you feel about that?

[69] **Mr Breeze:** I'm not sure how that would work, really, in terms of keeping an open mind about what you publish—you know, whether there'd be people imposing how they want things to be published if that sort of thing is set up, and I'm not sure—.

[70] **Jeremy Miles:** So, your concern is about editorial independence, effectively.

[71] **Mr Breeze:** Absolutely—those were the words I was looking for. *[Laughter.]*

[72] **Mr Taylor:** To add to that, I'd say I'm obviously quite—. I wouldn't be comfy with, essentially, state-funded news; I think that's a terrible idea. I think anything like that would have to be done certainly via arm's length. Personally, if it is competition, I would encourage that. I think people in a competitive environment get better, so, yes, if it could be done in the right manner, I'd be all for it, even if it was one that was set up next door to us, because we'd raise our game.

[73] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. Is there any other kind of non-financial support that you feel would be beneficial that you haven't yet been able to put on the record this morning?

[74] **Mr Breeze:** Not really. I think the plan by the BBC to set up this network of reporters—

[75] **Jeremy Miles:** We're going to come on to that in a second, actually.

[76] **Mr Breeze:** Okay, so, we'll come back to that.

[77] **Mr Taylor:** The only thing I'd answer on that is that, perhaps, touching back on raising awareness of the existence of these entities—be it, for example, yourselves, as well, in terms of how you communicate, et cetera, et cetera, that there are large audiences out there, and the audiences are different. I'm not saying just in terms of independent news websites or the like, but there are different audiences and they will change over time, as well.

What the landscape was even 18 months or two years ago has probably changed even now.

[78] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. Great, thank you.

[79] **Dai Lloyd:** Seamlessly, then, on to Lee Waters.

[80] **Lee Waters:** I've looked at both of your sites, and you should be congratulated on the quality of them. I was struck by what you've, Rob Taylor, just said about being uncomfortable with state-sponsored journalism, I think you called it. You complained about the fact that the statutory notices aren't available to you, and you gave a very good piece about the wasted white space in the paid-for adverts. Presumably, you'd like to be able to access the pot of money that pays for those.

[81] **Mr Taylor:** It's not a case of wanting the money. I think the frustration, from my perspective, is we are putting the information out and we're doing it in a better way than perhaps is being paid for. So, again, if we've got access to perhaps being in competition and being able to demonstrate we can do it better, I think that the flow of money would naturally come our way, probably, because we are better at what we do than saying, 'We're advertising something on page 46' or whatever, which nobody reads.

[82] **Lee Waters:** Did I understand from your previous point that you think that that should be a contestable fund? That people—

[83] **Mr Taylor:** I think it should be something that we can access and demonstrate do we have a relevant audience for this, and are we being considered as a relevant audience by the people who are placing them. In a way, I think, then, that's a natural process.

[84] **Lee Waters:** It's a tricky one for Government, isn't it, because the newspaper industry lobby on the one hand that, if this source of revenue was taken from them, the already brittle newspaper business model would collapse, which, I guess, none of us would want to see. We're in a transition between one model and the birth of another, I guess. So, how would you like to see those statutory notices put out for tender?

[85] **Mr Taylor:** Just to touch on that point, it's an interesting flex, I suppose, in terms of—. I suppose nobody around here wants to be the ones responsible for closing down their local newspaper, but, likewise, we run

stories about how much local authorities spend—be it on statutory notices or job advert spend—with a local newspaper that, essentially, is not being read as widely as perhaps traditionally it was. But they're not going to report on that themselves either, because there is self-interest, perhaps, from both angles on that. It touches back on what I mentioned earlier, that we perhaps should be looking forward more, as opposed to perhaps providing a crutch for legacy media to get their act together, essentially.

[86] **Lee Waters:** So, what would you suggest that we should consider as a way forward for the way statutory notices are dispersed?

[87] **Mr Taylor:** I would personally start on a very top-level basis. There is information here that needs to be communicated: where are the audiences? I'm not saying it would be via Wrexham.com. It could be a case of even—. There are probably random Facebook administrators of groups on a local level who have more of a relevant audience for some of the information than anybody else, and it's a case of identifying the audience, because the aim of the game is to get the information to the right people.

[88] **Lee Waters:** I'm struggling to understand what you think the Government should do about it, then. If you were a civil servant in charge of this, what would you do with statutory notices in future?

[89] **Mr Breeze:** Can I come in there?

[90] **Mr Taylor:** Go for it.

[91] **Mr Breeze:** Well, I think there needs to be a complete review of the way Government is spending the money. Rob touched on white space. There is no—. As far as I'm aware, and I've had a lifetime in the industry on the commercial side and the editorial side, costs are not negotiated. Bookings are made through agents like Golley Slater for full-page adverts, full-page public notices, which could simply have gone into far less space, but you're paying for a full page; it's not negotiated.

[92] I can take you back to the times when newspapers—local newspapers—would charge £1,000 a page for an estate agent, and the estate agents got together and said, 'Sorry, we don't need you anymore. We're on Rightmove now; we don't need newspapers.' So, they now pay £100 a page, because the newspapers said, 'Well, we need you, if you don't need us.' I have to say it's the same situation. Governments and county authorities are

wasting thousands of pounds with the size of the adverts that they're placing in newspapers, and I see that as the way that that money can be saved, can be reduced. The spend can be reduced there, and some of that money can then be spent in the places where people are actually reading it. If you ask a 20-year-old on the street out there where they get their news from today, or a 30- or a 40-year-old, to be quite honest, they won't tell you it's from the local newspapers, and they certainly won't tell you they read a public notice, because they won't know what a public notice is.

[93] **Lee Waters:** So, just to be clear, you still think that Government should use public notices in newspapers, but they should just pay less for them.

[94] **Mr Breeze:** I think you have to, don't you? You've got that legislation that, at this stage in time, you have to spend money in the printed world.

[95] **Mr Taylor:** Just touching on that, that's—. I was going to say, you could almost go the layer above that and say the legislation that requires such notifications perhaps should be the ones revisited, and say, 'It needs to be effectively communicated'.

[96] **Lee Waters:** Revisited with what?

[97] **Mr Taylor:** Well, it needs to be 'effectively communicated', to leave it broad, because in terms of—. Again, touching on looking forward, even in terms of websites in five to 10 years' time, it could be outdated. So, keep the wording very broad in terms of you want to effectively communicate, for example, a planning notice or road closure notices, et cetera. It needs to be effectively communicated to the local community, because then that gives—. This problem doesn't—

[98] **Lee Waters:** That's a subjective judgment, your editorial judgment of what is interesting and the best way to communicate it, and the whole point of statutory notices is that they put out information in an objective format so that people can access—or not access—as they choose.

[99] **Mr Taylor:** I suppose, at the moment, the definition is that it has to be in a newspaper, and that's the issue at the moment: what is a newspaper, is it, you know, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera?

[100] **Lee Waters:** That's what I'm struggling to get out of you. I get your criticism that they are dry, arid things that aren't really read, this is a tick—

box exercise; I understand that. I get Graham Breeze's point that there's no negotiation and these could be put in for far less than they are; I understand that too. What I'm struggling with is what you'd like to be done differently.

[101] **Mr Taylor:** I suppose, to touch on that, it would be a case, in my view, that the wording would change from, for example, 'in newspapers' to something—to 'effectively communicated locally'. So, at the moment, we could, say, touch into that and say, 'We're the way, at the moment, to effectively communicate properly.' In 10 years' time, it would be a case of, 'Right, on my augmented reality glasses that I'm wearing', that would be the way. It means that the method of communication changes throughout time, and you then don't have the same issue where it's almost like a historical, I suppose, legacy way of doing things in the legislation.

[102] **Lee Waters:** These are legal documents, though, aren't they? I think we're confusing different matters here.

[103] **Mr Taylor:** No, I do understand. I suppose I was taking that kind of level above. It's not a case of looking at statutory notices as such; it's the information, and how do you communicate the information.

[104] **Lee Waters:** Yes. I think there are lots of different points you're making, and I understand them, but, if we were to make a recommendation about the way the Government does statutory notices, what would you like to see replace them, or distributed differently? Would you like to be able to bid to be able to run those yourselves? Because you're making an argument for just, 'Let's report them differently'. Well, that's the job of journalists, isn't it?

[105] **Mr Breeze:** No, no, I don't think—. That's certainly not the case; I don't think Rob was putting that forward either. I think, yes, we would want to be able to tender for public notices. At the moment, we don't get the chance. We're not considered, even. As Rob touched on before, we're not even recognised. I think it's time, you know, that the hyperlocal industry is recognised, because it's here now and it's starting to replace newspapers at an alarming rate, really. We've talked already about the decline in newspaper sales, and that can't go on. There comes a point—and I never thought in my lifetime I'd hear myself say it—where that has to stop, because that newspaper is no longer viable. It is happening across the country. We've seen Trinity Mirror close newspapers in Reading, for instance, and just run a website.

[106] **Lee Waters:** Well, what's the tipping point, if the question is—? At what point does your circulation become so large that it's better to advertise with you rather than the prints? What are your readership figures like?

[107] **Mr Taylor:** Traditionally, things get measured. I don't think the statutory notices, for example, get measured; there's no measurement of interactions on that, and that could be one way of doing it. We've seen locally where there are trackable links, for example, put into adverts—not in terms of statutory notices—and we look at the stats on those in terms of how many people have actually used the link, for example, and typed it in, and you're talking single digits.

[108] **Lee Waters:** Okay. Well, I want to move on to a different area. I'm still not clear what you're arguing for. So, if you do have further thoughts, I'd appreciate—perhaps you can write to us with a considered judgment of what you'd like us to recommend in this area, because I think you make a sound point, but I'm not clear what the next step is. I do want to touch on the BBC situation that Graham Breeze mentioned, and your view of the scheme that they're rolling out.

[109] **Mr Breeze:** Yes. I'll come in on that, if you like. Clearly, I see this as a double-edged sword, really. There are some huge benefits for the hyperlocal industry in the BBC launching this scheme in that what we get is a newsfeed that we haven't got at the moment—basically, a reporter that we haven't got. But there are also downsides to that in that trying to become one of the people that holds these journalists as part of our team carries great costs for us. You need HR departments to allow that to happen, which we clearly haven't got. So, you know, we are restricted in what we can do in doing that. Having the reporter there would be a big benefit. The downside I see is that companies such as Trinity Mirror will use this. Despite the fact they've sat in front of you here and said they won't, they will use this as an opportunity. It's an opportunity for them to get staff on board that are being funded from somewhere else. Initially, they will be additional staff; I have no doubt at all about that. As years go by, vacancies won't be filled. I'll put myself—. I was an editorial director previously. If I put myself in that position, I'd be seeing this as a fantastic opportunity to cut my costs. So, that's the downside of it, and that will happen. Yes, we would like to be a part of it, because it would give us a news service that we don't currently have. As far as we're concerned, in Powys, I don't see that anybody has come forward yet at this stage, including Trinity Mirror, to say, 'Yes, we will cover Powys County Council'. It's a different situation for Rob.

[110] **Mr Taylor:** Yes. As I say, on a wider point, I'd say, in principle, it's a good thing. However, I have huge reservations about it. Touching in terms of the BBC, my initial standpoint would be, 'Why are they not doing it already?', essentially, 'Why is it a rarity that we see the BBC in and around Wrexham?' It's a huge area, huge population, but it is quite a rarity. I would agree with Graham that I think it will be used to substitute, and, essentially, cut jobs.

10:15

[111] At the moment, we have, for example, media brief at Wrexham council, Wrexham.com attends, there's usually a reporter from NWN Media. There used to be a reporter from Trinity Mirror's *Daily Post* there; we've not seen them for a very long time. Now, roll forward, when this comes into operation, will it be Wrexham.com and the local democratic reporter role run out of wherever, or will there still be those extra eyes there or not? I'm not sure. I think in Wrexham we're relatively lucky that we do have perhaps more oversight than other areas, but it does concern me that it will be used as an opportunity to get, essentially, basic BBC-style solid feed, but without having to fund a reporter.

[112] **Lee Waters:** You mentioned the requirements to be able to take part in this scheme. What are the requirements that you'd struggle to reach?

[113] **Mr Taylor:** We've applied successfully for phase 1 of it, which is to access the news bank. The tender for the reporter opened last night. We're unlikely to go for that, on a matter of principle more than anything, but, in terms of the access for that, we've not found anything particularly onerous on it.

[114] **Lee Waters:** What's the principle you find objectionable?

[115] **Mr Taylor:** That, basically, we would be—. To, essentially, give you a concept of what we do, we would attend scrutiny meetings, we attend council meetings, we give be it a 500-word or sometimes 3,000-word report, giving a colour of the conversation, who said what, even pointing out when perhaps councillors are unsure what they're voting for—giving a bit of colour and actually a reality of how local democracy works.

[116] **Lee Waters:** I'm glad you don't cover the Assembly.

[117] **Mr Taylor:** Oddly enough, that would be really interesting. That would make, perhaps, the business more accessible to people if there was that kind of entertainment factor as well, and it would raise people's game because they would want to be better in what they do so they don't, perhaps, feature in it.

[118] **Dai Lloyd:** Or feature more in it. [*Laughter.*]

[119] **Mr Taylor:** Yes, exactly, but we do get some who do play up to it. But, in terms of that, from the test project that we've seen the output on, it is solid, it is good, but it is BBC content. It is 300, 400 words of quite dry, unengaging—

[120] **Lee Waters:** Safe.

[121] **Mr Taylor:** Yes, and that's not what we do, and that's not how we're got a decent readership, basically. And that's—. My concern would be that, essentially, we would be staffing it alongside a reporter we're running.

[122] **Lee Waters:** But, just in practical terms, to take Graham Breeze's point that you need a HR department to be able to apply for this, what are the barriers they're setting that you'd struggle to meet?

[123] **Mr Taylor:** Literally, the documentation for this popped in last night. I've not had the chance to read it because I was reading through the wonderful transcripts of this committee, but my understanding is that, essentially, the contracts are bundled up so that there would be three, say, in north Wales, and that would be run out of, say, NWN, Trinity Mirror, and we could, in theory, sub-run one of them, for example. I believe the BBC are doing it in quite a decent way to facilitate it, so we would be able to do it without, for example, having to have a separate, dedicated HR, all that kind of thing. So, in terms of accessibility, my belief is that it would be something we could do if we wanted to.

[124] **Lee Waters:** You just don't want to.

[125] **Mr Taylor:** In terms of what the output would be, I don't see the benefit, really, to be honest.

[126] **Lee Waters:** So, what would you do in its place, if you had a free hand to—? This is a pot of money the BBC are setting aside to support commercial

journalism. What would you do differently?

[127] **Mr Breeze:** Well, from our point of view, we would be able to take on dedicated staff.

[128] **Lee Waters:** So, you'd want to be directly funded as hyperlocals who take staff on?

[129] **Mr Breeze:** No. I don't want to be directly funded for it, but what I'm saying is a share of the public spend that goes into newspapers would make a huge difference to our operation—

[130] **Lee Waters:** How would that work?

[131] **Mr Breeze:**—and only a very small spend. It's basically advertising spend, isn't it? So, the public notice spend to us would allow us to take on staff, which would obviously improve the coverage of news in our area and allow us certainly to cover councils and courts, which, at this stage, we're not able to do. These are essential things that are now being left out of the media.

[132] **Lee Waters:** I understand that. Just help me understand what the funding mechanism you'd like to see looks like.

[133] **Mr Breeze:** Well, I'm not asking—I'm not saying we want grant aid from the Assembly.

[134] **Lee Waters:** So, what are you asking for?

[135] **Mr Breeze:** I'm saying we would like a cut of the public notice spend that appears in newspapers. If we were to get a small part of that—

[136] **Lee Waters:** So, how would that work? Would Government have to give public notices to hyperlocals?

[137] **Mr Breeze:** Yes, absolutely. Yes. That's how it would work.

[138] **Lee Waters:** And how would you decide which hyperlocals to support?

[139] **Mr Breeze:** Well, obviously it depends on the area that you want your notices to go out in. We're, personally, the only hyperlocal site in our area

that you would have the option to go in.

[140] **Lee Waters:** Okay.

[141] **Mr Taylor:** Just to touch on that, I wanted to say that I'd widen it out and say that I would look to entities such as Cardiff University's centre for community journalism or the independent community news network as, perhaps, the body to administrate or be the arbiters, because they've got the experience, they've got the knowledge, and they've got the track record, as well. To me, that would then enable new start-ups, perhaps, to be focused or specific projects to be encouraged if there was expansion or, perhaps, even more forward-looking, I suppose, trials of technology or to try and make a proper IP base for expansion.

[142] **Lee Waters:** So, let me try and summarise: what I understand you're arguing is that instead of the BBC putting this money into local reporters that would instead go to some kind of journalism hub that would support the sector more generally, plus there'd be some mechanism for you being able to have the share of the spend of statutory notices. Is that what you're advocating?

[143] **Mr Taylor:** As a general point in terms of general funding, that would be my view of perhaps how to administrate it and how to put it out there. In terms of the BBC itself, I touched on it earlier—how there's been, I believe, a decline generally. If you look back at what was being done—I think it was touched on in one of the evidence sessions—in terms of what was happening around the Wrexham area, the BBC were relatively strong there and there have been internal cutbacks, so the BBC should perhaps spend their own money on their own stuff and do, perhaps, what people expect they should be doing.

[144] **Lee Waters:** Okay. Thank you.

[145] **Dai Lloyd:** Ocê. Jeremy, a oedd cwestiwn gyda ti? **Dai Lloyd:** Okay. Jeremy, did you have a question?

[146] **Jeremy Miles:** Na. **Jeremy Miles:** No.

[147] **Dai Lloyd:** Na. Ocê. Wel, dyna ni. A allaf i ddiolch yn fawr iawn i'r tystion y bore yma? Diolch, felly, er **Dai Lloyd:** No. Okay. Well, I think that's it then. May I thank our witnesses very much? For the record,

mwyn y record, unwaith eto, i Rob Taylor, golygydd Wrexham.com, a hefyd i Graham Breeze, partner yn My Town Media Ltd, perchnogion safleoedd ar-lein MyWelshpool a MyNewtown. Diolch yn fawr iawn ichi am eich tystiolaeth a byddwch chi'n derbyn trawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod yma i'w wirio i wneud yn siŵr ei fod o'n ffeithiol gywir. Felly, diolch yn fawr iawn ichi. Diolch.

I thank Rob Taylor, the editor of Wrexham.com, and Graham Breeze, partner in My Town Media Ltd, the owners of MyWelshpool and MyNewtown. Thank you very much for your evidence. You will receive a transcript of this meeting so you can check it for factual accuracy. So, thank you very much.

[148] **Mr Breeze:** Thank you for your time.

[149] **Mr Taylor:** Thanks.

10:21

Papurau i'w Nodi **Papers to Note**

[150] **Dai Lloyd:** I'm cyd-Aelodau nawr, rydym ni'n symud ymlaen i eitem 3 a phapurau i'w nodi. Mi fydd Aelodau wedi darllen y papurau hyn i gyd mewn manylder: papur 3.1, ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cymru i adroddiad y pwyllgor, 'Gwireddu'r Uchelgais: Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Gymraeg newydd Llywodraeth Cymru', hefyd, papur 3.2, llythyr gan y Llywydd ynghylch gweithredu Deddf Cymru 2017, a hefyd papur 3.3, llythyr gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch gweithredu Deddf Cymru 2017. A oes unrhyw sylw ar y rheini neu a ŷch chi'n hapus i'w nodi? Rwy'n cymryd y tawelwch fel hapusrwydd i'w nodi.

Dai Lloyd: For fellow Members now, we move to item 3, papers to note. Members will, of course, have read all of these papers in great detail: paper 3.1, a response by the Welsh Government to the report of the committee, 'Achieving the Ambition: Inquiry into the Welsh Government's new Welsh Language Strategy', paper 3.2—a letter from the Llywydd relating to the implementation of the Wales Act 2017, and paper 3.3, a letter from the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the implementation of the Wales Act 2017. Are there any comments on those or are you happy to note them? I take your silence as an indication of your desire to note.

10:22

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod**

**Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting**

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(vi) a (ix). *that the committee resolves to exclude the public from the meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi) and (ix).*

Cynigiwyd y cynnig.

Motion moved.

[151] **Dai Lloyd:** Felly, symudwn ni ymlaen i eitem 4 a chynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i benderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod am weddill y cyfarfod. A ydy pawb yn gytûn? Pawb yn gytûn. Diolch yn fawr iawn ichi.

Dai Lloyd: We move to item 4, a motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the rest of the meeting. Is everyone content? Everyone is content. Thank you very much.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 10:22.

The public part of the meeting ended at 10:22.