1 **Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest**  
   (09.30)

2 **Count me in! – Inquiry into the role of arts and culture in addressing poverty and social exclusion: Deputy Minister for Culture, Tourism and Sport**  
   (09.30–11.00)  
   (Pages 1 – 40)  
   Dafydd Elis-Thomas AM, Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism  
   Jason Thomas, Director, Culture, Sport and Tourism – Welsh Government  
   Lesley-Anne Kerr, Head of Museums Development – Welsh Government

3 **Paper(s) to note**

   3.1 **Correspondence from the Chair to the Chair of Health, Social Care and Sport Committee regarding The National Health Service (Welsh Language in Primary Care Services) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2019**  
   (Pages 41 – 43)

   3.2 **Correspondence from the Chair to the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding The National Health Service (Welsh Language in Primary Care Services) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2019**  
   (Pages 44 – 46)
4 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 (vi) to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of this meeting
(11.00)

5 Private debrief and key issues discussion
(11.00 – 11.30)
By virtue of paragraph(s) vi of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted

Agenda Item 2
The Role of Arts and Culture in Addressing Poverty and Social Exclusion

Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee

Wednesday, 22 May 2019 09.30

The Role of Arts & Culture in Addressing Poverty and Social Exclusion

1. The Committee is interested in how the publicly funded bodies can use culture to tackle the effects of poverty and social exclusion. When we refer to publicly funded bodies, we are including local authorities, heritage sites, theatres, schools, museums, archives and libraries.

2. The Committee has focused on the following areas when requesting evidence:
   a. How effective has the Welsh Government been in improving participation in and access to culture for people in poverty?
   b. How effective have the efforts of Welsh Government sponsored bodies (namely the Arts Council, National Museum, National Library and the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historic Monuments of Wales) and local government been in using culture to tackle poverty?
   c. What impact has the Welsh Government’s Fusion programme had on using culture to tackle poverty?
   d. How effective have the Fusion pioneer programmes been in stimulating local collaboration?

3. An online consultation was held between Friday 5 October 2018 and Friday 14 December 2018 and collated 19 different responses. The committee visited local fusion Programmes Wednesday 30 January 2019. The committee took evidence from interested parties on Wednesday 6 March 2019, Thursday 14 March 2019, Thursday 20 March 2019, Wednesday 3 April, Thursday 2 May 2019 and Wednesday 8 May 2019.

Background: the Andrews Report

4. In 2013 Welsh Government commissioned Baroness Kay Andrews OBE to recommend ways in which cultural and heritage bodies can work more closely together to broaden access to, appreciation of and participation in, culture in ways that contribute to reducing poverty.

5. Her report, *Culture and Poverty: Harnessing the power of the arts, culture and heritage to promote social justice in Wales*, complemented Professor Dai Smith’s 2013 report on ‘Arts in Education in the schools of Wales,’ and was launched in March 2014.

6. It demonstrated how museums, libraries, archives, historic monuments and arts organisations can play a vital role in inspiring people, in encouraging them to learn and gain new skills, and in helping them to develop confidence and a sense of identity. The report set out a compelling case for all involved to work together more effectively, to maximise the benefits of cultural participation for those in our most deprived communities. The report made 33 recommendations, under 3 broad themes:
The Role of Arts and Culture in Addressing Poverty and Social Exclusion

a. Community Focused: cultural organisations’ approach to engagement, links with Communities First and Families First and shared use and joint initiatives.
b. Education and Skills Focused: integration of arts, culture and heritage opportunities into existing educational programmes and activities, development of materials which support the best use of arts, culture and heritage opportunities to enhance learning and developing new programmes.
c. Strategic Framework and Infrastructure: ensuring policies and structures support delivery, development of learning networks and transport.

The Welsh Government’s response: *Fusion*

7. The Welsh Government has placed offering equality of opportunity at the heart of its community policy in Wales. The particular role which cultural and heritage can play in successfully transforming life chances of individuals in deprived communities is being progressed by a major policy initiative, under the title of *Cyfuno: Creu Cymleoedd drwy Ddiwylliant / Fusion: Creating Opportunity through Culture*.

8. Achieving greater collaboration between organisations cannot be achieved overnight; it requires a concerted effort to trial new approaches, and learn lessons, before it can be extended. Ministers agreed to test a method of working during a 2-year ‘pilot’ phase.

9. This initial pilot phase ran for one year from April 2015 and involved establishing six Pioneer Areas across Wales. For the second year, this was expanded to cover ten areas. Within each area, national, regional and local cultural and heritage bodies worked with Communities First clusters and community groups to increase participation in cultural activity at a local community level. There was a particular focus on individuals and communities who would not normally engage with these activities, and on helping them to benefit from *lasting* engagement with culture and heritage.

10. The evidence gathered after the pilot phase, and at the end of 2017 has identified that overall, participants are very positive about Fusion. The key benefits, as perceived by Fusion stakeholders, were:

a. The development of much stronger links between stakeholders from different sectors
b. A higher profile for Fusion stakeholders, and more awareness of the role that culture can play within local authorities and anti-poverty stakeholders in partnerships
c. More engagement with ‘harder to reach’ groups within deprived communities.

11. This approach is being developed and extended in 2017-20 through the funding and support of eight Fusion networks across Wales.

12. The Welsh Government has established a Cultural Inclusion Board (CIB) to coordinate and drive delivery of the vision in the Andrews report. This comprises the key cultural bodies, as well as local authority representatives and departments leading on historic environment, community and education policy within WG. The CIB has been a vital step in securing engagement with key stakeholders, adopting a strategic approach and sharing learning.
Along with setting up and managing the fusion Programme, the Welsh Government has been involved in delivering Fusion activities, including Cadw, which has offered a range of activities and programmes related to Fusion across their sites and through their volunteering programmes. As examples, the wide range of projects includes support of Gwynedd Family signature programme and the WLGA School Holiday Enrichment programme (SHEP); The Poets in Residence project, in partnership with Literature Wales, National Trust and Theatr Genedlaethol Cymru, engaging young people in poetry at sites, developing skills, confidence and appreciation of sites. Cadw is also a key partner in the Cultural Ambition initiative, which aims to create 33 training placements a year, over a three-year period. The trainees are aged 18-24 and non-graduates who are not in education, employment or training.

Under the CIB, an Operational Group manages the Fusion programme. This develops, agrees and monitors a comprehensive Delivery Plan (Annex A) and an associated action plan and communications plan. It also ensures effective linkages between the cultural sector and a broad range of related programmes and organisations.

The Fusion Programme is providing individuals in deprived communities with greater opportunities to take part in culture and heritage activities. Through it, we are working in partnership with museums, archives, libraries, castles, theatres, housing associations, schools and volunteering agencies.

Fusion is a low cost initiative with an annual budget of £280,000 for the entire programme, all of which comes from the Culture budget. The support of the cultural sector is pivotal in the successes of Fusion with input into the Fusion programme provided by all of the lead Welsh Government Sponsored Bodies (WGSBs). The Remit letters to these bodies identifies the requirement to work in support of the Fusion programme. Please find summaries of their input below.

**National Museum Wales / Amgueddfa Cymru**

National Museum Wales (NMW) has and continues to play an active part in the development and delivery of the Fusion Programme. Over the last three years it has also led the evaluation of the Fusion programme, in partnership with the Welsh Government’s Knowledge and Analytical Services team. NMW has responsibility for delivering a range of Fusion initiatives. Examples include:

a. Who Decides? NMW worked with a group from The Wallich, a charity supporting homeless adults, to curate an exhibition of contemporary art from the Museum’s collections.

b. GRAFT: A Soil Based Syllabus. Under this programme, linked to local artists and charities, individuals were able to design, create and maintain a garden at the National Waterfront Museum in Swansea. The programme changed perceptions and individuals gained knowledge and a number of qualifications.

c. Cultural Ambition: NMW is also a key partner in the Heritage Lottery funded initiative

d. Volunteering: National Museum Cardiff is working with Oxfam Skills for the Future
scheme, to support vulnerable women by providing progression to employment to women from a refugee background. It is also working in partnership with local special schools to offer placement opportunities to young people with autism.

**Arts Council Wales**

18. Arts Council Wales (ACW) is an active partner in Fusion. It influences the development of the programme, and promotes its ethos via several initiatives to encourage people from deprived communities to participate in the arts. Examples include:

   a. Arts Portfolio Wales, where there is particular emphasis on work with people in disadvantaged communities across 67 revenue funded organisations.

   b. Head4Art or the Night Out Community: ACW provides funding to enable individuals or arts organisations to reach into specific communities via its ‘Head4Art’ or ‘Night Out’ community arts events. In 2017/18 Night Out supported 319 promoters who hosted 511 performances in local communities across Wales. Night Out is a Fusion funded Programme.

   c. Ideas, People, Places: this programme aims to embed the arts by involving local people in imaginative, ambitious and innovative regeneration programmes.

   d. Working in partnership with like-minded organisations, through its involvement in Fusion and cARTrefu Cymru, a partnership programme between ACW, Age Cymru and the Baring Foundation.

**National Library of Wales (NLW)**

19. The National Library of Wales (NLW) is a member of the CIB, and has chaired the group. The NLW is supportive of the Fusion programme and committed to supporting Fusion. It has held a range of events related to the programme.

**The Royal Commission for Ancient and Historic Monuments Wales (RCAHMW)**

20. The Royal Commission for Ancient and Historic Monuments (RCAHMW) has less direct input into Fusion but is represented on the CIB and has influenced the direction of the programme since its inception. RCAHMW, in partnership with NLW and Amgueddfa Cymru, manage Peoples Collection Wales (PCW), which facilitates the uploading of photographs, recordings and documented stories about Wales and its people; a significant amount of material sourced for PCW is gathered via the Fusion programme.

**Funding, resources and staff**

21. The role of the local Fusion co-ordinators is to enable more effective programmes and partnerships, and to link organisations together. The Partnerships deliver and report on activities and Programmes that meet the Fusion performance indicators (Annex B).
22. A review of the Coordinator role in Fusion is currently underway. However, anecdotal evidence from partner organisations indicates that the Coordinators’ role is highlighted by all of the organisations involved in Fusion as being critical to its success. Without the Coordinators’ work on the ground, the programme is unlikely to have been as successful. The original pilot overlapped significantly with Communities First areas, and it continues to build and develop many of those links, based upon local knowledge. The programme is strengthened by this ability to utilise existing groups and partnerships to deliver Fusion-related work.

23. Whilst early indications are that the coordinators’ role has been pivotal, how it is resourced at local level is delegated to the lead bodies. Each lead body has supported the programme differently ranging from a part time coordinator to being embedded within a dedicated team.

24. Funding of Arts and Culture remains an ongoing issue within public bodies with Arts and Culture often perceived as being a lower priority for local authorities.

Access to transport

25. Throughout the programme, partners have consistently highlighted the high cost and/or inadequate provision of transport. Transport remains a barrier to participation in a number of communities. Evidence shows that lack of access to suitable transport has been identified as a factor that prevents many people from getting to cultural sites, or makes it more difficult. The National Survey for Wales (2014-15) found that around 4% of the general population cite lack of transport, or difficulty getting to a destination, as their primary reason for not visiting a cultural venue or event in Wales. However, this increased to 7% for residents of (the then) Communities First areas.¹ This indicates that access to affordable transport is a more significant barrier for people living in disadvantaged communities than for the population as a whole.

26. In response to the Andrews report the then Public Transport Users Advisory Panel commissioned a report into the interface between culture and transport, which included case studies of schemes aimed at reducing transport barriers. This report formed the basis of Culture and transport: Breaking down barriers access (https://gweddill.gov.wales/topics/culture-tourism-sport/tackling-poverty-through-culture/breaking-down-barriers-to-access/?lang=en)

27. The Welsh Government has previously provided guidance on breaking down these barriers, and has worked with partners and colleagues in the culture and transport sectors to produce this. WG wants to help cultural organisations increase access through practical, realistic and cost-neutral or low-cost measures to improve transport links. The guidance includes information on transport options, examples of best practice, and where to find resources and additional support. WG particularly wants to support people experiencing economic, social, physical and other barriers to cultural participation.

Long-term funding

28. Fusion Challenge Grant Lead Bodies have highlighted that short term funding does not allow for long term planning and retention of skilled and knowledgeable members of staff who can build lasting and effective relationships with and within communities.

29. There is a concern that if funding is devolved to local stakeholders, the focus on Fusion could be lost, especially given local authority funding pressures. However, in the longer term, the Welsh Government would consider looking to persuade local authorities and the culture sector to support this agenda as part of their core work. Officials are currently exploring plans with stakeholders for the longer-term funding of Fusion.

Evaluation

30. The Welsh Government, through MALD and the Knowledge and Analytical Services team continue to work in partnership with NMW to review the Fusion Programme and to develop a wider evidence base around the benefits of cultural participation. The next review, examining the role of the Fusion coordinators, is due for publication in June 2019. Previous evaluations have highlighted key benefits such as the opportunities partnerships provided for relationship building between stakeholders and for raising the profile of cultural organisations.

31. There is indicative evidence that the Fusion programme has encouraged organisations who would not previously have considered accessing culture and heritage to now do so, as resources to help their clients. This has had beneficial effects on the participants, in terms of, access to learning, training and volunteering opportunities, and improved physical and mental health.

32. The evaluation shows that stimulating local collaboration is a key benefit of Fusion. Before Fusion, the benefits of culture and heritage in tackling poverty and the cause of poverty in Wales were not fully understood by many in the third sector and local government, including organisations supporting people:
   a. living in communities without access to culture and heritage venues
   b. in danger of exclusion from education
   c. not in education, employment or training
   d. volunteering
   e. gaining access to job creation
   f. experiencing physical or mental ill health

33. Fusion continues to provide opportunities to breaking down barriers in the culture and heritage sectors. Whilst it is making progress in addressing poverty and social exclusion, it will require additional support and resources in future, if it is to sustain and widen its impact.
Fusion
Creating opportunities through culture
Delivery in 2018-19

#CyfunoFusion
http://gov.wales/fusion
Contents

3 Introduction

4 Context
   Progress to date

5 What we are doing in 2017-2019

7 Annex 1: Fusion Challenge Grant programmes in 2017-19

11 Annex 2: The seven Fusion Indicators

Names and personal details in the featured case studies have been changed to protect the privacy of individuals.
Introduction

The powerful role culture, heritage and the arts play in transforming life chances of individuals is being strengthened by the Fusion: Creating Opportunities through Culture programme.

Fusion is an innovative, low-cost intervention that aligns and focusses resources, services and programmes from a wide range of sectors and organisations, enabling them to directly support people across Wales.

It concentrates on helping those communities experiencing economic disadvantage. These communities traditionally face barriers in accessing culture and heritage, and the benefits they can bring.

The Welsh Government has led Fusion since 2015, in partnership with the cultural and heritage sector. Following the successful pilot phase, we launched a 2-year Fusion Challenge Grants programme in 2017 to embed the programme.

Eight partnerships are delivering strategic programmes using culture to support employability, empowerment, early years and family learning, and health and wellbeing – for those most in need.

We are also taking forward several initiatives including volunteering, training placements and youth engagement to support the wider objectives of the Fusion programme.

Conwy – David’s story

David is a young man in his twenties who has been acting as the main carer for a relative and subsequently was unemployed due to his family commitments. He contacted Conwy’s ‘Support for Carers’ for advice and was referred to the ‘Let’s Get Working’ advisor in Conwy Council, who works closely with Conwy’s Fusion Officer.

David was looking for opportunities connected to his passion for history and wanted to develop his CV to improve his employment prospects and confidence. He started volunteering at Conwy Archives on a weekly basis and after 6 months, a vacancy arose for Archive relief staff. He successfully met the criteria and is now a member of a small pool of relief staff, presently working 6½ hours a month.

David did not expect this outcome when he signed up to volunteer but says that he now feels more empowered and confident to not only take ownership of his working life but also to be able to carry on fulfilling his long existing commitment as a carer. The Fusion officer has signed him up to GwirVol Volunteer Accreditation as he has volunteered for over 100 hours to date. He has seized new opportunities including volunteering at a Fusion event at Pentre Mawr park, helping deliver a WW1 themed children’s activity. He is keen to pursue further training and qualifications in 2018 as part of Conwy’s Fusion programme.
Context

• The Fusion programme embodies the Well-being of Future Generations Act\(^1\) with a particular relevance to supporting a Prosperous Wales, a Wales of Cohesive Communities and a Wales of Vibrant Culture and Thriving Welsh Language.

• The Fusion programme enables the cultural sector to contribute to several objectives in Taking Wales Forward\(^2\) 2016-2021\(^2\) and Prosperity for All\(^3\), including volunteering, employability, supporting young people and boosting digital skills.

• Light Springs through the Dark\(^4\) outlines the Welsh Government’s vision for culture in Wales. It articulates how culture, through Fusion, can empower people and develop confidence, skills, and employability.

Progress to date

Led by MALD, co-ordinated action has been taken to develop and embed Fusion. A strategic Cultural Inclusion Board (CIB) oversees the programme and seeks to drive forward change across Welsh Government departments, sponsored bodies, and cultural and community organisations across Wales.

Since 2015, MALD has supported Fusion partnerships, coalitions of cultural and community bodies which provide cultural activity that help tackle poverty. Our evaluation shows local, structured partnerships, within a national programme, are the most effective way to deliver genuine collaboration and better outcomes.

Between 2015 and 2017, over 5,000 people took part in Fusion activities, involving more than 150 partners. We worked with local authorities, heritage sites, theatres, schools, museums, archives and libraries among others to help over 100 people gain a qualification, created over 300 volunteering opportunities and supported more than 1,500 pupils to do better at school.

---


What we are doing in 2017-2019

Following the successful pilot phase, in 2017 MALD launched a Fusion Challenge Grants programme. Eight Lead Bodies are delivering 2-year strategic programmes using culture, heritage and the arts to support employability, empowerment, the early years, and health and wellbeing – for those living in the most deprived communities.

Each works with a range of cultural partners, as well as other organisations including volunteering bodies, housing associations, health services, schools, community agencies, employability programmes including Communities for Work and the Flying Start programme for the early years.

Lead bodies have all appointed local Fusion co-ordinators to enable more effective programmes and partnerships to be created and to link organisations together better.

Partnerships deliver and report on activities and projects that meet the seven Fusion performance indicators (Annex 2). Levels of participation in Year 1 were extremely encouraging. Lead bodies reported the following results:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fusion Indicator</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F1 Supporting the Early Years and Family Learning</td>
<td>4979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F2 Gaining a qualification</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F3 Regular volunteering as route to work</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F4 Completing a work experience placement</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F5 Improved digital skills</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F6 Improved attitude to formal learning</td>
<td>2689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F7 Better able to manage mental well being and physical health</td>
<td>2941</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Newport – Sarah’s story

Sarah is a school pupil who has been described by the teacher as someone with challenging behaviour, confidence issues and low literacy levels. Her primary school sits within an area of high deprivation in Newport, with a high percentage of pupils receiving free school meals.

The Newport Fusion Co-ordinator worked with the school and Operasonic, a South Wales-based company that enables young people to participate in opera, as part of the Global Science Opera. An introductory session took place within the normal school day. Sarah seemed uninterested but was encouraged by the teacher to attend after school sessions. The teacher and facilitator commented on the slow but clear shift in Sarah’s levels of participation.

She began to ask questions, enjoyed a live-stream opera performance and even carried out independent research at home. Sarah actively took part in an after school, non-compulsory project resulting in a performance.

Sarah’s confidence levels have increased; she was more responsive within lessons throughout the duration of the project and carried out research independently at home without being prompted. This had never happened before. Recently she visited Newport Museum and Art Gallery as part of a school workshop; Sarah was one of the first people to volunteer to read out her work.
MALD will continue to support the partnerships in a variety of ways, responding to need. That support will include:

- Regular networking and training sessions, resources, newsletters and advice.
- Support to lever in external funding.
- Training programmes in areas such as Arts Award.
- Advice and training on effective evaluation.
- Developing a showcase for the Fusion programme on People’s Collection Wales.
- Promotion of and advocacy for the Fusion programme in Wales and beyond.

In addition to the Challenge Grants programme, we will also continue our commitment to key priorities requiring action at a national level.

We will:

- Implement a programme of 33 high quality, 12-month training placements targeted at communities and individuals experiencing disadvantage, working with the HLF and Creative & Cultural Skills.
- Develop powerful cultural engagement programmes for young people, to increase empowerment and skills, working with partners including Kids in Museums and the Young Promoters scheme.
- Help deliver a step change in cultural volunteering by supporting cultural bodies to increase opportunities and widen access to volunteering programmes, in partnership with WCVA.
- Work with other Welsh Government departments to ensure the cultural sector plays a greater role in supporting our priorities around employability, health, education and cohesive communities.

---

**Torfaen – Gareth’s story**

Gareth from Torfaen was referred to Llantarnam Grange by ‘Bridges into Work’ Torfaen in August 2017. He had been out of work for a number of years and needed support to upgrade his skills, confidence and CV to improve his chances of finding work. With support from Bridges into Work and Fusion, Gareth completed a level 2 qualification in First Aid and began volunteering two days a week at Llantarnam Grange Arts Centre in August 2017 doing general maintenance and gardening.

Gareth rapidly grew in confidence under the structured Volunteer scheme at Llantarnam Grange, set up as part of Torfaen’s Fusion programme. He gradually increased the level of tasks he was able to undertake and used his own initiative, even helping with exhibition changeovers. He completed larger tasks such as repainting the foyer and the entire café with help from staff.

A colleague at Llantarnam Grange said “Gareth is proving to be invaluable. His enthusiasm and commitment is fantastic and he has grown in confidence since he has been here”.

Gareth said “I’m enjoying my time here. My confidence has grown back to where it used to be and I hope to go on further and further”.

Gareth has now been offered a contract to work regular part-time hours at Llantarnam Grange.
## Annex 1: Fusion Challenge Grant Programmes in 2017-19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fusion Area / Lead Body</th>
<th>Activity and Outcomes</th>
<th>Fusion Co-ordinator Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Torfaen & Caerphilly** | Torfaen and Caerphilly local authorities are working together on the Fusion programme, using culture and heritage to support people in Communities First and other areas. The project is seeking to change the way people think and feel about arts, culture and heritage, making them relevant and accessible to everyone. 

It is working with a wide range of partners including culture, education, health, employment and skills bodies. It is focussing on tackling barriers to employment through volunteering and work placements, supporting educational attainment, the early years, and health and wellbeing. | Phone: (01633) 648809 |
| **Cardiff** 
Cardiff Story Museum | Cardiff Story Museum, operated by the City & County of Cardiff, is leading a wide range of national and local cultural and heritage partners. It is working closely with a number of programmes including Flying Start to develop a rich programme of activity, delivering accredited learning opportunities, skills development, apprenticeships, volunteering and work experience, and fun and meaningful activities for children, families, young people and the elderly. These opportunities are targeted towards individuals that live in Cardiff’s Southern Arc and current Communities First clusters. | Phone: (02920) 871024 
#CardiffFusion 
#CyfunoCaerdydd |

Pack Page 32
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fusion Area / Lead Body</th>
<th>Activity and Outcomes</th>
<th>Fusion Co-ordinator Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Swansea</strong></td>
<td>Building on the success of the Swansea Creative Learning Partnership, the City &amp; County of Swansea is driving forward innovative and diverse partnership work across the city. A coalition of cultural and heritage providers are building excellent community links with existing programmes and networks, and creating new activity. The aim of the project is to provide exciting opportunities through culture to engage and support people as part of their progression and improved wellbeing, education and employability. Working in partnership, the project will ensure increased volunteering opportunities, creative skills and accredited learning.</td>
<td>Phone: (01792) 637 685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conwy</strong></td>
<td>Conwy County Borough Council is strengthening cultural partnerships, working with a number of local and national bodies to ensure that residents from a number of disadvantaged areas within the County have access to cultural provision. There is a strong focus on supporting children and families, as well as employability and employment through volunteering, accredited learning, and improving skills. Activities include storytelling, art workshops, museum visits, archive projects, events, volunteering opportunities, and photography and drama opportunities.</td>
<td>Phone: (01492) 574628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Neath Port Talbot</strong></td>
<td>Tai Tarian is supporting volunteering opportunities, employability, financial literacy and numeracy programmes and arts and culture opportunities in Port Talbot and beyond. One of its most important programmes is with Ysgol Bae Baglan school where it is using film, media and culture as a way of boosting engagement and attainment. Tai Tarian is working closely with partners including the actor Michael Sheen, National Theatre Wales, and Ffilm Cymru.</td>
<td>Phone: (01639) 505922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fusion Area / Lead Body</td>
<td>Activity and Outcomes</td>
<td>Fusion Co-ordinator Contact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gwynedd</td>
<td>Cyngor Gwynedd is delivering a programme of activity working with partners including Storiel, the National Library of Wales, Gwynedd’s library service, Pontio, Cadw, the National Slate Museum and others. It is focusing on supporting young people and families through the Family Learning Signature programme, developing new approaches to increasing volunteering, and supporting literacy and the early years. Cyngor Gwynedd is concentrating its work mainly on the current Communities First cluster in Bangor, Caernarfon and Talysarn, as well as other communities.</td>
<td>Phone: (01286) 679215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmarthenshire</td>
<td>Carmarthenshire County Council and its partners are delivering a wide range of cultural projects and activities. It is working alongside Welsh Government Tackling Poverty programmes and key employability programmes such as Communities for Work and Communities for Work Plus. We are focusing our work on the Llanelli area and areas that are experiencing economic disadvantage. The main aim of the programme is to create opportunities that will support individuals to access employment. Working in partnership, culture and heritage bodies are prioritising volunteering opportunities, work placements, training, wellbeing, and encouraging individuals to become involved in local culture.</td>
<td>Phone: (01554) 742662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ext 5462</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The City of Newport is focussing on reducing barriers to accessing culture, working with a wide variety of cultural partners including Newport Museum, Cadw, Amgueddfa Cymru, It’s My Shout, People’s Collection Wales and the Chartist Trust. It is working closely with the Communities First, Flying Start, and Communities for Work programmes as well as social landlords. It is focussing on creating opportunities for young people to take part in culture and heritage to support their learning, creating work placements and volunteer opportunities to increase employability, promoting digital inclusion, and supporting physical and mental health and wellbeing.
# Annex 2: The Seven Fusion Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Activity and Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **F1:** Supporting the Early Years and Family Learning | Structured cultural activities promote learning and development from birth through school age.  
For Early Years: Cultural bodies develop and deliver structured Language and Play (LAP) or Number and Play (NAP) provision, or other structured language and communication sessions. These can take place in a Flying Start or equivalent programme, or cultural setting.  
For Family Learning: Cultural bodies develop and deliver activities to support family learning. These have been specifically designed to enable adults and children to learn together or enable parents/carers to learn how to support their children’s learning, focussed on improving:  
- the literacy, language and numeracy skills of parents  
- ability to help their children’s acquisition of literacy, language and numeracy. |
| **F2:** Gaining a qualification | The client attains a recognised qualification within a cultural organisation or through a cultural project which is primarily intended to develop the client’s employability. This includes:  
- CQFW qualifications  
- Agored Units  
- NOCN. |
| **F3:** Regular volunteering as route to work | The client undertakes volunteering within a cultural setting which is primarily intended to develop employability, such as:  
- at least one hour of volunteering per week for a period of at least 4 weeks  
- another pattern of volunteering where client completes at least 4 hours in a single month  
- volunteering includes time-banking. The client should time-bank at least one hour per week for a period of at least 4 weeks. |
<p>| <strong>F4:</strong> Completing a work experience placement | The client completes a work experience placement in a cultural organisation, lasting at least 16 hours per week for 2 weeks. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Activity and Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **F5:** Improved digital skills | The client has been supported to develop their digital skills by:  
  • completing a recognised, accredited IT or software course such as ECDL, or other accredited digital skills e.g. through Agored or OCN  
  • participating in a cultural project of which the primary focus is to improve digital skills. |
| **F6:** Improved attitude to formal learning | The client demonstrates a measurable improvement in their attitude to formal learning, and potentially attainment, through engagement with culture. Evidence should be provided by the school or agency rather than being self-reported. |
| **F7:** Better able to manage their mental well being and physical health | Clients report having better management strategies for their mental well being and/or receives support to help them improve their physical health, through taking part in cultural and heritage activities of which the primary focus is to improve their health and wellbeing.  
Example activities/evidence:  
  • The client has participated in an activity at least twice a week for 4 weeks with the primary purpose of helping them to feel more positive about their mental well being.  
  • The client undertakes increased physical activity as a result of the intervention provided. |
### Annex B: Performance Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fusion theme</th>
<th>Performance measure</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Supporting the Early Years          | F1 Supporting the Early Years and Family Learning              | Structured cultural activities promote learning and development from birth through school age. Delivered with a range of community and other partners, including childcare providers, programmes such as Families First and Flying Start, and schools. Outcomes are developed to benefit both child and parents/carers.  
For Early Years: Cultural bodies develop and deliver structured Language and Play (LAP) or Number and Play (NAP) provision, or other structured language and communication sessions. These can take place in a Flying Start or equivalent programme, or cultural setting.  
For Family Learning: Cultural bodies develop and deliver activities to support family learning. These have been specifically designed to enable adults and children to learn together or enable parents/carers to learn how to support their children's learning, focussed on improving: the literacy, language and numeracy skills of parents ability to help their children's acquisition of literacy, language and numeracy. |
| Supporting Employability and Skills | F2 Gaining a qualification                                     | The client attains a recognised qualification which is primarily intended to develop the client’s employability. This includes CQFW qualifications and related awards e.g. Agored Units, NOCN.                                                                                                                                                        |
| Supporting Employability and Skills | F3 Regular volunteering as route to work                       | The client undertakes at least one hour of volunteering in a cultural setting per week for a period of at least 4 weeks which is primarily intended to develop employability. Volunteering includes time-banking. The client should time-bank at least one hour per week for a period of at least 4 weeks which is primarily intended to develop employability. |
| Supporting Employability and Skills | F4 Completing a work experience placement                      | The client completes a work experience placement in a cultural organisation, lasting at least 16 hours per week for 2 weeks.                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| **Supporting Employability and Skills** | F5 Improved digital skills | The client has been supported to develop their digital skills by completing a recognised, accredited IT or software course such as ECDL, or other accredited digital skills e.g. through Agored or OCN. Participants have undertaken activity which has improved their digital skills, competency and confidence. |
| **Supporting Employability and Skills** | F6 Improved attitude to formal learning | The client demonstrates a measurable improvement in their attitude to formal learning, and potentially attainment, through engagement with culture. Evidence should be provided by the school or agency rather than being self-reported. |
| **Health and Wellbeing** | F7 Better able to manage their mental well being and physical health | Participants have undertaken activity in which they have reported an improvement to their mental health. Participants have undertaken activity which has encouraged increased physical activity. Clients report having better management strategies for their mental well being and/or receives support to help them improve their physical health. Example activities/evidence: The client has participated in an activity at least twice a week for 4 weeks with the primary purpose of helping them to feel more positive about their mental well being. The client undertakes increased physical activity as a result of the intervention provided. |
Dai Lloyd AM,
Chair, Health, Social Care and Sport Committee
National Assembly for Wales

13 May 2019

Dear Dai,

The National Health Service (Welsh Language in Primary Care Services) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2019

The Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee intends to scrutinise the Regulations relating to the Welsh language standards for primary health care providers including general practitioners, dentists, pharmacists and opticians which were laid on 9 May 2019 and are due to come into force on 30 May 2019.

Unfortunately, we have very little time in which to do this. By setting the date for the Regulations to come into force on 30 May, which includes a Bank Holiday, Privilege Day and Recess period, the Welsh Government has allowed us only 10 working days to consult our stakeholders, discuss this issue and report on it to the Assembly. I have written to the Minister for Health and Social Services to express my frustration with the situation.

With apologies for the short deadline, please can you bring the Regulations to the attention of your Members and let me know if there are any issues which your Committee or stakeholders feel should be addressed in our report?. Would you be able to respond by 17 May 2019?
I am grateful to you for your input, it is important that we hear the views of your stakeholders on this issue to gain a full assessment of the impact of this legislation.

Yours sincerely,

Bethan Sayed
Chair of the Committee
Dear Bethan

The National Health Service (Welsh Language in Primary Care Services) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2019

Thank you for your letter of 13 May 2019 regarding the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee’s intention to scrutinise the Regulations relating to the Welsh language standards for primary health care providers.

Unfortunately, due to existing work programme commitments, there is no time available for the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee to consider these Regulations in the immediate future. However, I have circulated your letter, the Regulations and Explanatory Memorandum to Committee Members and suggested they contact you directly if they have any concerns.

Kind regards

Dr Dai Lloyd AM
Chair, Health, Social Care and Sport Committee
Vaughan Gething AM,
Minister for Health and Social Services
Welsh Government

10 May 2019

Dear Vaughan,

The National Health Service (Welsh Language in Primary Care Services) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2019

I note that the Regulations relating to the Welsh language standards for primary health care providers including general practitioners, dentists, pharmacists and opticians were laid yesterday. I also note that they are due to come into force on 30 May 2019.

I am extremely concerned that the Committee has not been given sufficient time to consider them, particularly after I emphasised how important it was for us to have more than 21 days to consider them when we looked at the previous set of Regulations in March of last year.

The need for more consideration time was made clear in our Committee report and I brought it up during the Plenary debate on 20 March. I spoke then about our frustration with the rushed timetable and the fact that our stakeholders and Members felt there was insufficient time to consider the implications of the legislation properly.

In response to our concerns, Eluned Morgan AM, Minister for International Relations and the Welsh Language said:

I am highly aware that you didn’t have a great deal of time to look at this, but we have complied with the 21 days that is usually in place. However, I do accept that perhaps we can look at expanding
that, if that's created a problem on this occasion. But that's the way it's always been done. But as a point of principle, I do think that we can extend the time in future.’

Given these comments, the Committee Clerk wrote to Welsh Government officials in the Legislative Programme and Governance Unit on three occasions between December and January ‘to confirm that the Committee will have more than the minimum 21 days to consult on and scrutinise the regulations.’ No reply was received.

I am sure you can understand how disappointed I am therefore, at finding we have, again, been given the very bare minimum of time to scrutinise this important piece of subordinate legislation.

In fact, by setting the date for the Regulations to come into force on 30 May, which includes a Bank Holiday, Privilege Day and Recess period, you have effectively given us only 10 working days to consult our stakeholders, discuss this issue and report on it to the Assembly.

I am not prepared to compromise the work of the Committee by rushing this activity. Please can you postpone the coming into force date to the third week in June? It is essential that we have time to properly scrutinise the legislation because of the importance it has for this group of service users and primary care providers.

During the debate on the previous set of Regulations relating to primary care providers the Minister acknowledged this is a contentious issue and the need for it to be discussed thoroughly with all those it will affect.

Due to the urgency, please can you reply by email or telephone as soon as possible or ask one of your officials to speak to the Committee Clerk, Martha
Howells, who can be contacted on [Redacted] or by e-mail at [Redacted]

Yours sincerely,

Bethan Sayed

Chair of the Committee